Is it ethical and safe to use non-invasive brain stimulation as a cognitive and motor enhancer device for military services? A reply to Sehm and Ragert (2013)

The Harvard community has made this article openly available. Please share how this access benefits you. Your story matters.

Citation

Published Version
doi:10.3389/fnhum.2013.00874

Accessed
August 27, 2017 12:53:28 PM EDT

Citable Link
http://nrs.harvard.edu/urn-3:HUL.InstRepos:11879365

Terms of Use
This article was downloaded from Harvard University's DASH repository, and is made available under the terms and conditions applicable to Other Posted Material, as set forth at http://nrs.harvard.edu/urn-3:HUL.InstRepos:dash.current.terms-of-use#LAA

(Article begins on next page)
Is it ethical and safe to use non-invasive brain stimulation as a cognitive and motor enhancer device for military services? A reply to Sehm and Ragert (2013)

Jerome Brunelin1,2, Jean Levasseur-Moreau1 and Shirley Fecteau1,3*

1 Centre Interdisciplinaire de Recherche en Rédadaptation et en Intégration Sociale de l’Université Laval, Centre de Recherche de l’Institut Universitaire en Santé Mentale de Québec, Faculté de Médecine, Université Laval, Quebec, QC, Canada
2 Centre Hospitalier le Vinatier, Université de Lyon, F-69003, Université Claude Bernard Lyon I, EA 4615, Bron, Lyon, France
3 Berenson-Allen Center for Noninvasive Brain Stimulation, Beth Israel Deaconess Medical Center, Harvard Medical School, Boston, MA, USA
*Correspondence: shirley.fecteau@fmed.ulaval.ca

We appreciate the comment from Sehm transcranial magnetic stimulation (TMS) as a cognitive and motor enhancer device for military personnel. We consider it is our obligation to discuss their limitations in terms of safety, ethics, transferability, and meaningfulness as we did in Levasseur-Moreau et al. (2013). We thus, raised potential safety and ethical concerns of using NIBS in healthy participants and we referred readers to articles specifically addressing these major questions (e.g., Illes and Bird, 2006; Forlini et al., 2013).

This debate on ethics and safety on the use of NIBS for cognitive enhancement should certainly be pursued among scientists (e.g., Bikson et al., 2013) but we should also seek participation of policy makers, ethicists and manufacturers, since, whether we like it or not, there is a fast-growing market promoting do-it-yourself brain stimulation devices proposing NIBS for a recreational use, especially transcranial Direct Current Stimulation (tDCS). We thus, welcome the effort of policy makers such as The California Department of Public Health (CDPH) that “warned consumers not to use the unapproved medical device sold on the Internet as a tDCS Home Device Kit” (see http://www.cdph.ca.gov/Pages/NR13-029.aspx). As already stated in Levasseur-Moreau et al. (2013), we believe that this discussion should also encompass all potential nonpharmacologic neuroenhancers and brain-boosting drugs that can improve performance of healthy individuals including military personnel.

If our position on the ethics or safety in the use of NIBS in our article has been misinterpreted or is unclear, we hereby want to reaffirm it because these topics strongly matter to us: in our opinion, benefits and risks in terms of ethics and safety must be clearly weighed before any use of NIBS as a cognitive enhancer in healthy population. NIBS protocols must be reviewed by independent and competent institutional review boards. Stimulation sessions should be delivered by adequately trained staff in a secure environment (e.g., hospital setting) and with strict inclusion and exclusion criteria to ensure safety of participants in accordance with international guidelines (for instance, see Rossi et al., 2009).

REFERENCES
Received: 12 November 2013; accepted: 29 November 2013; published online: 16 December 2013.

Citation: Brunelin J, Levasseur-Moreau J and Fecteau S (2013) Is it ethical and safe to use non-invasive brain stimulation as a cognitive and motor enhancer device for military services? A reply to Sehm and Ragert (2013).


This article was submitted to the journal Frontiers in Human Neuroscience.

Copyright © 2013 Brunelin, Levasseur-Moreau and Fecteau. This is an open-access article distributed under the terms of the Creative Commons Attribution License (CC BY). The use, distribution or reproduction in other forums is permitted, provided the original author(s) or licensor are credited and that the original publication in this journal is cited, in accordance with accepted academic practice. No use, distribution or reproduction is permitted which does not comply with these terms.