Disentangling Electronic and Vibronic Coherences in Two-Dimensional Echo Spectra

The Harvard community has made this article openly available. Please share how this access benefits you. Your story matters.

Citation

Published Version
doi:10.1021/jp405421d

Accessed
June 18, 2017 8:13:02 AM EDT

Citable Link
http://nrs.harvard.edu/urn-3:HUL.InstRepos:12696021

Terms of Use
This article was downloaded from Harvard University's DASH repository, and is made available under the terms and conditions applicable to Open Access Policy Articles, as set forth at http://nrs.harvard.edu/urn-3:HUL.InstRepos:dash.current.terms-of-use#OAP

(Article begins on next page)
Disentangling electronic and vibronic coherences in two-dimensional echo spectra

Christoph Kreisbeck, 1 Tobias Kramer, 2,3 and Alán Aspuru-Guzik 1

1 Department of Chemistry and Chemical Biology, Harvard University, Cambridge, Massachusetts 02138, USA
2 Institut für Physik, Humboldt Universität zu Berlin, 12489 Berlin, Germany
3 Department of Physics, Harvard University, Cambridge, Massachusetts 02138, USA

(Dated: June 21, 2013)

The prevalence of long-lasting oscillatory signals in the 2d echo-spectroscopy of light-harvesting complexes has led to a search for possible mechanisms. We investigate how two causes of oscillatory signals are intertwined: (i) electronic coherences supporting delocalized wave-like motion, and (ii) narrow bands in the vibronic spectral density. To disentangle the vibronic and electronic contributions we introduce a time-windowed Fourier transform of the signal amplitude. We find that 2d spectra can be dominated by excitations of pathways which are absent in excitonic energy transport. This leads to an underestimation of the life-time of electronic coherences by 2d spectra.

I. INTRODUCTION

The observation of long-lasting oscillations in peak amplitudes of two-dimensional (2d) echo spectroscopy as function of increasing delay time between pump and probe pulses has lead to an intensive search for quantum mechanical effects in photosynthetic systems at physiological temperatures. The general theoretical model of excitonic energy transfer from the antenna to the reaction center is well established. For the Fenna-Matthews-Olson (FMO) complex an efficient transfer relies on a dissipative coupling of electronic and vibronic degrees of freedom, which puts the excited system in an energy funnel towards the reaction center. The oscillations recorded in 2d echo spectra were not anticipated within a simplified rate equation formalism based on Markovian approximations for the dissipative coupling of vibronic and electronic degrees of freedom.

The physical origin of the experimental observations has lead to various theoretical proposals, which are roughly divided into two mechanisms. As shown from calculations in model Hamiltonians the presence of δ-spiked peaks in the vibronic mode distribution does imprint a long-lasting oscillatory signal on coherences. The spectral density determined from fluorescence line-narrowing experiments (J Wendling in Fig. 1) reveals a series of peaks. However a calculation of 2d spectra and coherences using a close approximation to the density (denoted by J peaks and J 11 peaks in Fig. 1) puts the vibronic contributions on a much smaller scale compared to electronic coherences, which lead to oscillation periods determined by the differences in exciton eigenenergies. The second proposed mechanism identifies two prerequisites for long-lasting electronic coherences and oscillations of cross-peaks of 2d-spectra in the continuous part of the vibronic mode distribution: (i) a small initial slope of the vibronic density towards zero frequency, and (ii) a larger coupling between a continuum of vibrations whose frequencies are in the range of the typical excitonic energy gaps. Both conditions are fulfilled by the florescence line-narrowing spectral density J Wendling.

It remains an open question to what extend 2d spectra are probing vibrational or electronic properties of light-harvesting complexes. Moreover, for the design of artificial nanostructure it is of interest to identify the physical mechanism for efficient transport and conditions for the accompanying vibronic density. Here, we disentangle the interplay of electronic and vibronic effects on the transport by introducing a reliable method to dissect the 2d-echo signal. We show that a time-windowed short-time Fourier transform (STFT) is a suitable tool to track and assign specific vibronic and electronic contributions at all delay times. We find that two-dimensional echo-spectra can significantly underestimate the duration of electronic coherences due to the destructive superposition of several pathways related to additional excitations and ground-state bleaching. Such pathways are not important for excitonic energy transfer, which for the same system displays longer electronic coherences than the 2d spectra. The connection between 2d spectra and efficient
transport and the role of coherences requires a careful evaluation.

II. TRANSITION FROM ELECTRONIC TO VIBRATIONAL INDUCED COHERENCE IN THE FMO COMPLEX

Multiple frequencies are a common pattern in the cross-peak oscillations observed in 2d echo spectra of various LHCS such as the FMO complex or light harvesting proteins PE545 and PC645 from marine cryptophyte algae. To unravel which physical processes are present as the delay-time progresses and to uncover the transition from electronic to vibrational induced coherences we introduce a windowed short-time Fourier transform (STFT) of the signal

$$F_w(\omega, t_c) \rho_{E_iE_k}(t) \rho_{E_iE_k}(t) e^{i\omega t}$$

where $t_c$ denotes the center and $t_w$ the width of the window function

$$F_w(t_c, t) = \sum_{s=\pm 1} \frac{8}{1 + e^{i(t-t_c-st_w/2)/t_w}}$$

Later, we normalize $F_w(t_c) \rho_{E_iE_k}$ to its maximal value. A typical window function along with the coherence between exciton eigenstates $|E_i\rangle$ and $|E_k\rangle$ of the FMO complex calculated in Ref. is shown in Fig. together with the corresponding STFT analysis in Fig. Sweeping the centre of the window function $t_c$ yields information about the changes in the frequency distribution with advancing time in the exciton dynamics. In Fig. the initially dominant electronic coherent frequency $\hbar\omega_{15}$ is indicated by the arrow on the left side. At later times dephasing reduces the influence of the electronic coherences while the interaction with the strongly coupled vibrational modes increases. Around $t_c = 0.7$ ps a “gap” can be seen, where the electronic frequency is absent but shortly afterwards re-emerges. From $1 - 3.5$ ps a wobbling motion of the dominant contribution is seen, which is caused by the vibronic frequencies marked by arrows on the right hand side. During the time evolution, energy is shared among different vibrational modes close in resonance with the excitation frequency $\hbar\omega_{15}$. Which vibrations are activated changes with time. For example, the vibration at $\hbar\Omega = 380$ cm$^{-1}$ is present around $2.2$ ps but absent around $3$ ps. The features revealed in the STFT reflect two different mechanisms in the energy transfer. Electronic coherences signify delocalized wavelike energy transfer which helps to overcome energy barriers and facilitates fast energy transfer to specific target states. On the other hand the signatures of strongly coupled vibrational modes mark reversible energy exchange between the exciton system and the protein environment.

III. COHERENCES IN 2D SPECTRA

The decay of peak amplitude oscillations in two-dimensional spectra has been used to extract coherence lifetimes. In the following, we identify two processes which reduce the signature of electronic coherence in two-dimensional spectra compared to transport calculations. To elucidate and quantify the interplay between electronic and vibronic degrees of freedom we discuss the physical processes mapped by 2d-echo spectra within a model trimer consisting of sites $1 - 3$ of the FMO complex.

$$H_{ex} = \begin{pmatrix} 410 & -87.7 & 5.5 \\ -87.7 & 530 & 30.8 \\ 5.5 & 30.8 & 210 \end{pmatrix} \text{cm}^{-1}. \quad (3)$$

FIG. 2. Time evolution of the coherence $\rho_{E_iE_k}(t)$ for the spectral density $J_{1\text{peaks}}$ at $T = 150$ K. The dashed line shows a typical window function ($t_c = 0.6$ ps, $t_w = 0.4$ ps, $\beta = 7$).

FIG. 3. STFT analysis ($t_w = 0.4$ ps, $\beta = 7$) of the coherence $\rho_{E_iE_k}$ of Fig. The left arrow marks the frequency of the electronic energy difference $E_1 - E_5$ and the right arrows indicate the centers of vibrational peaks of $J_{1\text{peaks}}$, Fig. 4.
We proceed along the steps in Ref. 1 and calculate the Fourier transform of the third order re-
flecting stimulated emission (SE), ground-state bleach-
ing (GB) and excited state absorption (ESA), where the
frequencies (dashed line) are close in resonance with the
difference of the exciton energies $E_i - E_j$ (solid line) of the
exciton system Eq. (3). Parameters for Eq. (4): $\lambda_k \in \{11, 9, 12, 7, 4\} \text{ cm}^{-1}$, $\nu_k \in \{230, 50, 750, 700, 750\}$ fs, $\hbar \Omega_k \in \{80, 260, 135, 260, 430\} \text{ cm}^{-1}$.

As for the FMO complex22 we describe the energy trans-
fer within a Frenkel exciton model23 linearly coupled to
independent baths at each site. The spectral density is
parametrized by a superposition of shifted Drude-Lorentz
peaks

$$J(\omega) = \sum_{k=1}^{M} \left[ \frac{\nu_k \lambda_k \omega}{\nu_k^2 + (\omega + \Omega_k)^2} + \frac{\nu_k \lambda_k \omega}{\nu_k^2 + (\omega - \Omega_k)^2} \right].$$  (4)

The spectral density $J_{\text{peaks}}$ (Fig. 4) for the model trimer fulfils the criteria for long-lived electronic coherences due
to its small initial slope and later on larger coupling.
To study the role of specific vibrational modes $J_{\text{peaks}}$
adds three vibrational modes centered at frequencies
$\hbar \Omega_1 = 135 \text{ cm}^{-1}$, $\hbar \Omega_2 = 260 \text{ cm}^{-1}$, $\hbar \Omega_3 = 430 \text{ cm}^{-1}$,
which puts them close to resonance with the differences
in exciton eigenenergies. The total 2d-echo rephasing signal
is composed of three Liouville pathways29,30 reflecting stimulated emission (SE), ground-state bleach-
ing (GB) and excited state absorption (ESA), where the
laser pulses create two excitons in the system. Formally,
we calculate the Fourier transform of the third order re-
sponse function $S_{RP}(t_3, T_{\text{delay}}, t_1)$29,30 in the impulsive
limit

$$I_{RP}(\omega_1, T_d, \omega_3) = \int_0^{\infty} \int_0^{\infty} dt_3 dt_1 e^{i\omega_3 t_3 - i\omega_1 t_1} \times [S_{\text{GB}}^{RP}(t_3, T_d, t_1) + S_{\text{SE}}^{RP}(t_3, T_d, t_1) + S_{\text{ESA}}^{RP}(t_3, T_d, t_1)].$$  (5)

We proceed along the steps in Ref. 21 and include the ro-
tational average over random orientations by sampling
20 distinct laser polarization vectors aligned along the
vertices of a dodecahedron. We assume equal dipole
strength of the three pigments and dipole orientations
along the nitrogen atoms $N_B - N_D$. The propagation
is performed with the GPU-HEOM method16,33 In an
experimental setup all three pathways are tied together
and cannot be analysed separately, while the theoreti-
cal calculations allows us to study the individual contri-
butions. Typically, the SE and ESA pathways interfere
destructively and lead to a diminished amplitude of the
coh erent signal in the total spectrum. The cancellation
of coherent amplitudes in 2d spectra enhances the influence
of strongly coupled vibrations on the cross-peak oscilla-
tions. In particular the ground-state vibrations moni-
tored by the GB get amplified in weight in the 2d-echo
spectra. Our finding, that ground-state vibrations af-
fect the cross-peak dynamics is in agreement with Tiwari
et al.34 who investigate the effect of a single vibrational
mode in resonance with a model dimer. Different condi-
tions govern transport and 2d-echo spectra, where sev-
eral pulses hit the sample. For instance the ground-state
bleaching and excited state absorption induced by the
2d-echo setup are not relevant for the energy transfer
process. Thus the apparent diminishing of coherences in
2d spectra does not imply unimportance of coherence in
the excitonic transfer.

The cancellation effects are prominently visible in Fig. 5
which displays the oscillatory component of the lower-
diagonal cross-peak dynamics of CP(12), CP(13) and
CP(23) of the rephasing signal as function of delay time
$T_{\text{delay}}$. The amplitude of CP($ik$) is determined by in-
tegrating the real part of the rephasing 2d-spectra (all
three rephasing pathways) over a small rectangle ($\Delta E =$
$36 \text{ cm}^{-1}$) in the 2d-energy grid. The center of the rect-
angular area is located at $\omega_i = E_i + \lambda/4.5$ and $\omega_k =
E_k + \lambda/4.5$, where $E_i, E_k$ denote the exciton eigen-
egenergies of Eq. (3). The shift $\lambda/4.5$ takes into account the
stokes shift and ensures that the amplitude is averaged
around the maximum of the peaks. The non-oscillatory
background is fitted by $f(t) = a + b e^{-cd} + dt + e t^2$ and
is subtracted from the total signal. The three cross peaks
show different behaviours. In the upper panel CP(12) osci-
lates dominantly with a single frequency that matches
the vibrational mode $\hbar \Omega_1$. The 2d-spectra thus appar-
tently shows that there is almost no contribution of elec-
tronic coherence between exciton states $|E_1\rangle$ and $|E_2\rangle$
left. This finding is in contradiction to simulations of the
coh erence $\rho_{E_1, E_2}(t)$ that predict long lasting elec-
tronic coherence up to 1 ps. Studying the dynamics of
the SE and ESA pathways of CP(12) separately recov-
ers the long lasting electronic coherence. But in the
case of CP(12) the amplitudes of the coherent oscillations
of the SE and ESA pathway are nearly identical and the
destructive interference of these pathways can-
cels the contribution of electronic coherence in the total
signal. The remaining oscillatory component of the to-
tal signal reflects the ground state vibrations of the GB
pathway shown as dashed line in Fig. 5(a) and the signal
de the electronic coherence is masked by the vibrational mode
$\hbar \Omega_1$. The cross-peaks CP(13) and CP(23) (Fig. 5(b) and
Fig. 5(c)) show a more complex dynamics, which is best

![FIG. 4. Five peak model spectral density $J_{\text{peaks}}$ with a suppressed slope at zero frequency and three strongly cou-
pled underdamped vibrational modes. The vibrational fre-
quencies (dashed line) are close in resonance with the
difference of the exciton energies $E_i - E_j$ (solid line) of the
exciton system Eq. (3). Parameters for Eq. (4): $\lambda_k \in \{11, 9, 12, 7, 4\} \text{ cm}^{-1}$, $\nu_k \in \{230, 50, 750, 700, 750\}$ fs, $\hbar \Omega_k \in \{80, 260, 135, 260, 430\} \text{ cm}^{-1}$.](image-url)
analysed using the STFT methodology for the case of CP(23) in Fig. 6. Multiple frequencies originating from electronic coherence and vibronic modes superpose each other and form rich structures in the beating pattern. The STFT frequency analysis for the sum of ESA and SE pathways is depicted in Fig. 6(a). In agreement with the coherences (not shown) we observe a transition around $T_{\text{delay}} = 0.7 \, \text{ps}$ from initially electronic coherence with frequency $\hbar \omega_{23} = 212 \, \text{cm}^{-1}$ to vibrational frequencies $\hbar \Omega_k$ at later times. The strongest coupling to the exciton dynamics stems from the vibrational modes $\hbar \Omega_1$ and $\hbar \Omega_2$ that are close in resonance with the electronic frequency $\hbar \omega_{23}$. For the GB pathway (Fig. 6(b)) the exciton system remains in the electronic ground state during $T_{\text{delay}}$ and no electronic frequencies show up in the cross peak dynamics. In the total signal Fig. 6(c) the GB vibrational modes leave their trace and diminish the relative weight of the electronic coherences.

**IV. CONCLUSION**

The STFT provides a tool to determine the physical mechanisms behind oscillatory signals for progressing delay time. We find that the determination of electronic coherence life-times from the experimentally observed total signal in the 2d-echo spectra is difficult and can underestimate the lifetime of electronic coherences. For varying delay times the STFT shows multiple frequencies and a mix of vibronic and electronic contributions. Similar ob-
ervations are reported for experimentally recorded 2d spectra.\textsuperscript{3,6,25,26} We further found examples of a reemergent amplitude in the oscillatory component at later time in CP(23), where a larger amplitude at $T_{\text{delay}} = 0.35$ ps is seen compared to $T_{\text{delay}} = 0.2$ ps. Interestingly, such reemerging amplitudes are also observed for the FMO complex.\textsuperscript{25,26}

The pollution of the 2d-signal by ground-state vibrations and two-exciton states is not directly relevant for assessing the role of coherences in excitonic energy transfer, where these two pathways are absent. This has also implications for identifying vibronic spectral-densities supporting efficient transport. We find a good correspondence between coherence lifetimes of the stimulated emission pathway (SE) of cross peak CP($i,j$) and the corresponding coherence $\rho_{E_1,E_2}$. For certain cross-peaks the ground state vibrations dominate, and the 2d-echo spectra are not able to determine the electronic coherence lifetime. In this case an additional analysis, like the proposed witness of electronic coherence\textsuperscript{25,26} or quantum process tomography\textsuperscript{36,37} is required to reveal the hidden information.

ACKNOWLEDGMENTS

A.A.-G. and C.K. are supported by the DARPA grants N66001-10-1-4063, N66001-10-1-4059, and T.K. by a Heisenberg fellowship of the DFG (KR 2889/5). A.A.-G. thanks the Corning foundation for their generous support.


