P sources for phosphatic Cambrian carbonates

Jessica R. Creveling, David T. Johnston, Simon W. Poulton, Benjamin Kotrc, Christian März, Daniel P. Schrag, Andrew H. Knoll

1 Department of Earth and Planetary Sciences, Harvard University, 20 Oxford Street, Cambridge, MA 02138, USA
2 School of Earth and Environment, University of Leeds, Leeds, LS2 9JT, UK
3 School of Civil Engineering and Geosciences, Newcastle University, Drummond Building, Newcastle upon Tyne, NE1 7RU, UK
4 Department of Organismic and Evolutionary Biology, Harvard University, 26 Oxford Street, Cambridge, MA 02138, USA

*Email: jcrevel@gps.caltech.edu
†Email: johnston@eps.harvard.edu

ABSTRACT

The fossilization of organic remains and shell material by calcium phosphate minerals provides an illuminating, but time-bounded, window into Ediacaran—Cambrian animal evolution. For reasons that remain unknown, phosphatic fossil preservation declined significantly through Cambrian Series 2. Here we investigate the phosphorus (P) sources for phosphatic Cambrian carbonates, presenting sedimentological, petrographic, and geochemical data from the Cambrian Series 2–3 Thorntonia Limestone, Australia, some of the youngest Cambrian strata to display exceptional phosphatic preservation of small shelly fossils. We find that within Thorntonia sediments, phosphate was remobilized by organic decay and bacterial iron reduction, with subsequent reprecipitation largely as apatite within the interiors of small shelly fossils. We discuss the merits of bioclastic-derived, organic matter-bound, or iron-bound P as potential sources to these strata. Petrographic observations suggest that the dissolution of phosphatic skeletal material did not source P for fossil preservation. In contrast, high organic carbon contents imply significant organic fluxes of P to Thorntonia sediments. Sedimentology and iron-speciation data indicate that phosphorus enrichment occurred during times of expanded anoxic, ferruginous conditions in subsurface water masses, suggesting that phosphorus adsorption to iron minerals precipitating from the water column provided a second significant P source to Thorntonia sediments. Simple
stoichiometric models suggest that by themselves neither organic carbon burial nor an iron shuttle can account for the observed phosphorus enrichment. Thus, we infer that both processes were necessary for the observed phosphorus enrichment and subsequent fossil preservation in the Thorntonia Limestone.

INTRODUCTION

Phosphorite and phosphatic carbonate define a spectrum of sedimentary lithologies enriched in the authigenic calcium phosphate mineral apatite (Kazakov, 1937; Baturin and Bezrukov, 1979; Riggs, 1986; Cook and Shergold, 1986; Cook et al., 1990; Föllmi, 1996; Trappe, 2001). The punctuated temporal distribution (Cook and McElhinny, 1979; Cook and Shergold, 1984, 1986) and evolving spatial distribution (Brasier and Callow, 2007) of phosphatic lithologies through Earth history suggest that unique and restrictive physical (Filippelli and Delaney, 1992) and/or chemical (e.g., Föllmi, 1996) conditions govern phosphate deposition in time and space.

There are many reasons to want to understand this distribution. Perhaps foremost is the practical concern for understanding how ore-grade sedimentary phosphorites form (e.g., Cook and Shergold, 1986). As with petroleum, phosphate ores are approaching peak production, while global demand continues to rise (Cordell et al., 2009; Filippelli, 2011). At the same time, biogeochemists increasingly invoke perturbations to the ancient phosphorus cycle to explain inferred fluctuations in biological productivity, organic carbon burial and oxidant accumulation over geological time-scales (Tyrrell, 1999; Bjerrum and Canfield, 2002; Saltzman, 2005; Holland et al., 2006; Konhauser et al., 2007; Algeo and Ingall, 2007; Planavsky et al., 2010; Swanson-Hysell et al., 2012). Finally, phosphatic deposits provide a direct window into evolutionary history through
the exceptional preservation of fossils (Cook, 1992; Bengtson and Zhao, 1997; Xiao and Knoll, 2000; Butterfield, 2003; Porter, 2004a).

A global phosphogenic window coincides with major evolutionary innovation during the Ediacaran and Cambrian periods (Cook and Shergold, 1984; 1986; Cook, 1992). Much of our knowledge of early animal diversification derives from biomineralized and soft-bodied metazoans replaced and/or templated by phosphate minerals (Bengtson et al., 1990; Xiao and Knoll, 1999; 2000; Donoghue et al., 2006; Dornbos et al., 2006; Kouchinsky et al., 2012). Phosphatization taphonomy is tied to the biogeochemical cycle of phosphorus and, for reasons that remain unknown, a major decline in the incidence of phosphatic lithologies and phosphatic fossil preservation occurs during Cambrian Series 2 (Cook and McElhinny, 1979; Porter, 2004b; Donoghue et al., 2006). To understand the loss of phosphatic lithologies, and the consequent closure of the Cambrian phosphatization taphonomic window, we must first understand how phosphorus entered the sediment column and how it was subsequently redistributed and concentrated around skeletal elements. In this paper, we ask specifically: what was the source of phosphorus to phosphatic carbonates characterized by exceptional skeletal preservation?

Geochemistry provides one avenue to address this question. A common view holds that enhanced delivery of reactive phosphorus (i.e., phosphorus that may undergo biogeochemical transformations within the sediment column) to the sea floor is the primary variable governing the development of phosphatic lithologies (e.g., see Föllmi, 1996, and references therein; Papineau, 2010). In modern marine environments, the delivery of reactive phosphorus to the sea floor occurs predominantly in association with
two phases (e.g., Delaney, 1998; Benitez-Nelson, 2000): phosphorus bound within organic matter (Redfield, 1958) and/or phosphorus adsorbed to/co-precipitated with particulate iron minerals (herein referred to as the ‘Fe-P shuttle’) (Berner, 1973; Shaffer, 1986; Feely et al., 1991; Feely et al., 1998; Poulton and Canfield, 2006). To examine the extent to which these reactive phosphorus sources contributed to ancient phosphatic deposits, we report high-resolution phosphorus and iron speciation data, stable carbon isotope measurements, and trace element concentrations for the phosphatic Thorntonia Limestone, Georgina Basin, Australia (Cambrian Series 2–3; Southgate, 1988; Southgate and Shergold, 1991), and, for comparison, the overlying non-phosphatic Arthur Creek Formation. We explore the possibility that bioclastic-bound, organic-bound, and iron-bound P sourced the Thorntonia phosphatic carbonates and develop simple mathematical models to assess the relative importance of organic- and iron-bound P. We find that while the high organic carbon content of the Thorntonia Limestone suggests that organic-bound P contributed significantly to authigenic apatite formation, C to P ratios indicate that organic-bound P was insufficient to account entirely for the observed phosphorus enrichment. Sedimentology and iron speciation data indicate that these formations accumulated under anoxic, ferruginous subsurface water masses, allowing for the possibility that P adsorbed to iron minerals precipitating from the water column augmented organic-bound P delivery to the sediment column. Nonetheless, simple mathematical models indicate that, by itself, iron-bound phosphorus delivery is also incapable of accounting for the observed phosphorus enrichment. Thus, we infer that both organic-bound and iron-bound phosphorus sources were necessary for the development of the fossil-bearing phosphatic carbonates of the Thorntonia Limestone.
**GEOLOGIC BACKGROUND**

The Centralian Superbasin is a laterally extensive intracratonic basin that initiated during Neoproterozoic transcontinental rifting of Rodinia. Regional tectonic events subsequently dissected the superbasin into a mosaic of discrete, asymmetric, polyphase foreland basins (Fig. 1a; Walter et al, 1995; Lindsay, 2002; Dunster et al., 2007). Here, we focus on the phosphatic Cambrian strata of the southern Georgina Basin (Cook and Shergold, 1986; Southgate, 1988; Southgate and Shergold, 1991), which deposited variably and diachronously across the basin (Cook and Shergold, 1986; Southgate, 1988; Howard, 1990; Southgate and Shergold, 1991; Dunster et al., 2007).

The Narpa Group encompasses Cambrian Series 2 and Series 3 stratigraphy of the southern Georgina Basin (Fig. 1b; Ambrose et al., 2001; Dunster et al., 2007). Deposition of its lowermost member, the phosphatic Thorntonia Limestone, reflects a major transgression and expansion of the Georgina Basin. For this reason, the basal contact of the Thorntonia Limestone can unconformably overlie the Shadow Group, conformably and gradationally overlie the Shadow Group, or overlie and re-work crystalline basement (Fig. 1b). The rest of the Narpa Group records a basin-wide, shallowing-upward succession that transitions from outer (lower Arthur Creek Formation), middle (upper Arthur Creek Formation) and inner ramp (Steamboat Sandstone) depositional environments into a flat-topped carbonate platform (Arrinthrunga Formation; Ambrose et al., 2001; Dunster et al., 2007).

Trilobite biostratigraphy assigns Thorntonia rocks to the Ordian and early Templetonian stages of Australian chronostratigraphy (Laurie, 2004a,b; Dunster et al.,
correlative to Cambrian Series 2, Stage 4 and, possibly, lowermost Series 3, Stage 5 (Fig. 1b; Babcock and Peng, 2007; Peng and Babcock, 2011). Trilobite biozones within the Arthur Creek Formation are diagnostic for the Australian regional Ordian–Boomerangian stages (Laurie, 2004a, b; Dunster et al., 2007), correlative to uppermost Stage 4 of Cambrian Series 2 through to the Guzhangian Stage of Cambrian Series 3 (Fig. 1b; Babcock and Peng, 2007; Peng and Babcock, 2011).

METHODS

We examined the sedimentology and lithofacies associations of the Thorntonia and Arthur Creek formations within drill core NTGS 99/1 reposited at the Northern Territory Geological Survey, Alice Springs, Australia. With a water-cooled saw, we cut 534 three-cm-long, quarter-core samples perpendicular to bedding at ~10-25 cm resolution between 597.58 and 347.98 meters core depth (mcd). Each sample was again divided (perpendicular to bedding) into two subsamples, one half designated as a hand-sample or thin-section billet, the other half pulverized with a steel ring mill. Each hand-sample billet was micro-drilled along individual laminations for carbonate carbon ($\delta^{13}C_{\text{carb}}$) and carbonate oxygen ($\delta^{18}O_{\text{carb}}$) isotopic analysis. The evolved CO$_2$ was measured against an in-house reference gas on a VG Optima dual-inlet mass spectrometer attached to a VG Isocarb preparation system. We report isotopic values in the V-PDB per mil ($\%e$) notation. Standard reproducibility was $1\sigma$ = $< 0.1\%e$ and $0.2\%e$ for $\delta^{13}C_{\text{carb}}$ and $\delta^{18}O_{\text{carb}}$, respectively.

Sample powders were divided for carbon, phosphorus, iron, and trace element geochemical analyses aimed at diagnosing the sediment- and water-column geochemistry
at the time of phosphatic carbonate deposition. To determine carbon mass fractions, we acidified 5-10 g of powdered sample with cold, 2.5 M hydrochloric acid. The resulting insoluble residue (i.e., the non-carbonate fraction, comprised predominately of siliciclastics and organic matter) was isolated by filtration, rinsed thoroughly with de-ionized water, then dried and weighed. The total carbonate fraction was estimated as the weight percent difference between the bulk sample and the insoluble residue. To determine the weight percent of total organic carbon (TOC) and its isotopic composition ($\delta^{13}$C$_{org}$), aliquots of the insoluble residue were combusted within a Carlo Erba NA 1500 Analyzer attached to a Thermo Scientific Delta V Advantage isotope ratio mass spectrometer. Reproducibility of $\delta^{13}$C$_{org}$ for an acetanilide standard was 0.16‰ (1σ). Of the 100 samples processed, 29 were analyzed in duplicate and yielded an analytical reproducibility of 1σ = 0.07 weight percent (wt.%) TOC. Finally, we estimated the wt.% of silicate phases (either clastic or authigenic) as the wt.% of the insoluble fraction minus the wt.% of the TOC fraction.

The speciation of phosphorus (P) was determined with a modified sequential extraction methodology for marine sediment (Ruttenberg, 1992). Here, 150-200 mg of rock powder was sequentially extracted with 10 mL each of (1) 0.3 M sodium-citrate/1 M sodium bicarbonate/0.14 M sodium dithionite (pH = 7.5) for P bound to reducible/reactive ferric iron minerals (P$_{Fe}$), (2) 1 M sodium acetate (pH = 4.0) for carbonate fluorapatite, biogenic hydroxyapatite, and carbonate-bound P (P$_{auth+carb}$), (3) 1.2 M cold HCl for crystalline fluorapatite (P$_{xl}$), and (4) 1.2 M cold HCl after a 2 hour ignition at 550°C for organic P (P$_{org}$). To prevent P readsorption during the first two extraction steps, two 5 mL 1 M MgCl$_2$ washes were performed post-extraction.
Phosphorus in extracts and wash solutions (except P_{Fe}) was analyzed spectrophotometrically (Thermo Genesys 6) by the molybdate-blue method (Strickland and Parsons, 1972; Ruttenberg, 1992); P_{Fe} was measured by inductively coupled plasma optical emission spectrometry (ICP-OES; Varian Vista-MPX). We note that Ruttenberg (1992) ascribes P-speciation phase (3), P_{xl}, to detrital fluorapatite of igneous and metamorphic origin. We abbreviate this phase as ‘xl’ for ‘crystalline’ so as to remove reference to a genetic mechanism (i.e., detrital) for an operationally-defined phase based on a chemical extraction procedure. We hypothesize about the origin of this phase in greater detail in the discussion.

To verify the efficiency of the sequential extraction method, total P (P_{T}) values were determined independently (SGS Mineral Services Group) by inductively coupled plasma atomic emissions spectrometry (ICP-AES) after a standard four acid digestion (HF-HClO_{4}-HCl-HNO_{3}). These analyses also provide the additional major and trace metal concentrations reported below. To account for variable dilution by siliciclastic influx, we report element concentrations normalized to aluminum (Al) in wt.%/wt.% and ppm/wt.% units for major and trace elements, respectively.

To determine the speciation of iron within our samples, we applied a modified version of the sequential extraction method of Poulton and Canfield (2005). Here, 80-100 mg of rock powder was sequentially extracted with 10 mL each of (1) 1 M sodium-acetate, adjusted to pH 4.5 with acetic acid to extract Fe associated with carbonate phases such as siderite and ankerite (Fe_{carb}); (2) 0.28 M sodium dithionite, adjusted to pH 4.8 with 0.2 M acetic acid/0.25 M tri-sodium citrate, for iron oxides such as hematite and goethite (Fe_{ox}); and (3) 0.2 M ammonium oxalate/0.17 M oxalic acid for magnetite.
The boiling chromium reduction distillation of Canfield et al. (1986) was used to quantify sulfur (S) within pyrite from the insoluble residues derived from carbonate dissolution. We used a pyrite stoichiometry ($\text{FeS}_2$) to relate the extracted S back to iron ($\text{Fe}_{\text{py}}$). Total Fe ($\text{Fe}_T$), which comprises the sum of the diagenetically highly reactive phases ($\text{Fe}_{\text{HR}} = \text{Fe}_{\text{carb}} + \text{Fe}_{\text{ox}} + \text{Fe}_{\text{mag}} + \text{Fe}_{\text{py}}$), as well as unreactive Fe ($\text{Fe}_U$; predominately silicate-bound Fe), was determined via a boiling HF-HNO$_3$-HClO$_4$ extraction on an additional aliquot of sample powder. All iron concentrations were measured by atomic absorption spectrometry (AAS). Eight replicates of one sample, 572.64 mcd, yield a RSD of 2%, 13%, and 71% for $\text{Fe}_{\text{carb}}$, $\text{Fe}_{\text{ox}}$, and $\text{Fe}_{\text{mag}}$, respectively. The high RSD of the latter two phases result from measured quantities close to the instrument detection limit; that is, the average wt.% $\pm$ 1σ for the eight Fe-speciation replicates is 0.110$\pm$0.002, 0.016$\pm$0.002, and 0.001$\pm$0.001 for $\text{Fe}_{\text{carb}}$, $\text{Fe}_{\text{ox}}$, and $\text{Fe}_{\text{mag}}$, respectively. At higher Fe concentrations for each fraction, the RSD is <5% for each stage, and this is also the case for $\text{Fe}_{\text{py}}$ and $\text{Fe}_T$ (Poulton and Canfield, 2005).

RESULTS

Lithofacies descriptions and paleoenvironmental interpretations for the Thorntonia Limestone and Arthur Creek Formation from drill core NTGS 99/1

Markings on drill core NTGS 99/1 assign 598.4–580.1 mcd, 580.1–558.7 mcd, and 558.7–554.7 mcd to the informal lower, middle, and upper members, respectively, of the Thorntonia Limestone (previously Hay River Formation), and 554.7–103.2 mcd to the Arthur Creek Formation (previously Marqua Formation; Ambrose et al., 2001; Dunster et al., 2007). In this study, we characterized the sedimentology and geochemistry of the
entire Thorntonia Limestone and the lowermost ~200 m of the lower Arthur Creek Formation.

Thorntonia Limestone

The Shadow Group is absent from NTGS 99/1. Here, the Thorntonia Limestone directly overlies Paleoproterozoic granite basement. The basal meters of the lower Thorntonia member include lithic fragments and sand grains within dolomudstone, with minor cubic pyrite crystals (Fig. 2a). More generally, the lower Thorntonia consists of dolomudstone and peloidal dolowackestone, with pervasive structural dissolution textures creating a stylolaminated to stylobedded fabric (Fig. 2b). Southgate and Shergold (1991) designated the basal, arkosic, terrigenous unit as a low-stand system tract, and the overlying stylolitic carbonate as a condensed transgressive / high-stand system tract.

Below 575.92 mcd (the lower Thorntonia Limestone) and from 580.1 - 575.92 mcd (the middle Thorntonia Limestone), the bulk lithology is dolostone. Stratigraphically above this horizon, up to the middle–upper Thorntonia Limestone contact at 558.7 mcd, the bulk lithology is limestone. Nevertheless, petrographic observation of the bulk limestone lithofacies above 575.92 mcd reveals rare euhedral dolomite rhombs within an otherwise calcimudstone or calciwackestone matrix.

The middle Thorntonia contains four interbedded and interlaminated lithofacies that occur within generally coarsening-upward meter- to sub-meter-scale packages (Fig. 2c). These lithofacies include: (1) black to medium gray carbonate mudstone; (2) dark to medium gray peloidal, bioclastic, and, occasionally, intraclastic wackestone; (3) medium to light gray peloidal and bioclastic packstone; and (4) medium to light gray bioclastic
grainstone. Carbonate mudstone or wackestone lithofacies define the base of each package and interlamine or alternate gradationally on a centimeter to decimeter scale. These carbonate mud-dominated lithologies typically grade upward into, and contact sharply with, laminae and beds of packstone. When present, thin beds of bioclastic grainstone overlie packstone beds. These grainstone beds display basal erosional contacts with millimeter to half-centimeter-scale topography, and an upper contact that is either sharp or erosional and overlain by beds of black to medium-gray carbonate mudstone. In other cases, the upper contact is diffuse and conformable with beds of medium-gray packstone or wackestone (Fig. 2d). There is a broad up-core trend: packages initiate with progressively coarser lithologies and terminate with progressively thicker grainstone beds. The nature of deposition of the Thorntonia Limestone within NTGS 99/1 is consistent with the phosphatic lithofacies model from the northeast Georgina Basin (Cycle mP of Southgate, 1988). Southgate and Shergold (1991) assign these shallowing-upward cycles to the transgressive system tract.

We interpret the lithologic association of the middle Thorntonia to reflect deposition within a subtidal to intertidal depositional environment. Mudstone, wackestone, and packstone beds accumulated from suspension sedimentation in calm settings that lacked significant tidal, wave, or storm activity. The coarser grain size and subtle current-generated stratification observed in grainstone beds reflect a higher energy depositional environment. Grainstone beds reveal no internal grading, but do show evidence for amalgamation and winnowing of carbonate mud by currents or waves. Deposition under the influence of waves is also manifest in rosettes of brachiopod and trilobite shell fragments along basal scour surfaces of bioclastic grainstone beds (Fig. 2d).
Dunster et al. (2007) interpreted the black, carbonaceous carbonates of the Thorntonia Formation to represent deposition under dysoxic to anoxic conditions. In NTGS 99/1, the upper Thorntonia encompasses a 4 meter-thick vuggy, fossiliferous dolopackstone with laminae, beds, and pockets of bioclastic dolograining (Fig. 2e). When present, dolospar crystals form a mosaic around bioclasts (primarily of lingulate brachiopods). In addition to representing a prominent matrix constituent, bioclasts occur as cumulate along dissolution seams.

**Petrography of apatite distribution.** Apatite displays three predominant modes within the middle and upper Thorntonia Limestone. First, within bioclast-rich carbonate lithologies, apatite occurs primarily as the internal molds (steinkerns) of conical small shelly fossils or, more commonly in the upper Thorntonia Limestone, as lingulate brachiopod skeletal debris (Fig. 3a). Apatite also occludes gaps between, and templates the exterior of, silica-replaced skeletons (Fig. 3a). Second, in rare instances, apatite occurs as cement within bioclastic grainstone lithologies (Fig. 3b). Third, within mud-supported, suspension-deposited carbonate, apatite occurs as sub-angular to sub-rounded coarse-silt to medium-sand-size grains, and as silt- to fine-sand-size, tabular or undulose grains within well-sorted, thin beds (Fig. 3c). Due to the textural maturity and fine grain-size of these lithologies, we cannot say conclusively whether these grains were eroded, transported and winnowed from a site of apatite authogenesis (i.e., allochthonous apatite grains) or whether they were sourced with a detrital siliciclastic influx. We favor the interpretation that these grains represent re-worked authigenic grains (i.e., intraclasts of authigenic cement and steinkern bioclasts) because we observe no comparable-size
detrital siliciclastic grains. Below, we discuss the origin of these grains in light of geochemical data.

**Arthur Creek Formation**

Within NTGS 99/1, the basal 10 m of the lower Arthur Creek encompasses a petroleum-generating, massive black shale (Fig. 2e), or ‘hot shale’ (e.g., Dunster et al., 2007), succeeded by planar, undulose, and corrugated interlaminae of black to dark gray organic matter- and clay-rich shale and siltstone with medium to light gray calcimudstone and dolomudstone. This shale also contains rare interbeds of very fine-grained bioclastic packstone and grainstone (Fig. 2f). Clay- and iron-oxide-rich laminae include sub-rounded to angular, very well sorted, monocrystalline quartz and authigenic pyrite crystals, the latter of which often occlude pore space. Horizontal alignment of clay minerals indicates that compaction enhanced the physical expression of lamination.

Commonly below ~490 mcd, and only rarely above, decimeter-scale light gray limestone nodules displace surrounding laminations and retain faint remnants of lamination, indicating nodular development during compaction, but before lithification (Fig. 2g). We interpret individual laminae to reflect the gravitational settling of fine particles suspended by dilute turbidity currents that wafted sediment towards the basin interior, consistent with an outer-ramp depositional environment (Dunster et al., 2007). The fetid, carbonaceous black shale and black, carbonaceous, laminated dolostone suggest deposition under dysoxic to anoxic conditions (Dunster et al., 2007).

In the upper meters of the measured lower Arthur Creek, a second lithofacies interbeds with the laminated facies (Fig. 2h). This facies includes interbeds of light gray
calcimudstone and siliciclastic siltstone. Rare truncation of undulatory laminae indicates intermittent deposition under the influence of currents. This facies is a harbinger of the more proximal, oxygenated ramp environment of the overlying upper Arthur Creek Formation (Dunster et al., 2007), which was not measured in this study. Southgate and Shergold (1991) assign the lower Arthur Creek to a transgressive system tract.

**Geochemistry of the Thorntonia Limestone and Arthur Creek Formation**

A generalized stratigraphic column of the Thorntonia and lower Arthur Creek is shown in Figure 4a alongside chemostratigraphic variation in $\delta^{13}$C$_{\text{carb}}$ (Fig. 4b), $\delta^{18}$O$_{\text{carb}}$ (Fig. 4c) and $\delta^{13}$C$_{\text{org}}$ (Fig. 4d). Cross-plots of $\delta^{13}$C$_{\text{carb}}$ and $\delta^{18}$O$_{\text{carb}}$ display no statistically significant co-variation (Fig. 4e), thereby suggesting that $\delta^{13}$C$_{\text{carb}}$ values, at least, represent the primary seawater isotopic composition. The $\delta^{13}$C$_{\text{carb}}$ curve generated for NTGS 99/1 displays two positive peaks, the first in the middle Thorntonia (563.92 mcd) and the second in the Arthur Creek (506.51 mcd). Consistent with trilobite biostratigraphy (Laurie, 2004a,b), we correlate the middle Thorntonia excursion to the Ordian–early Templetonian isotopic event and the Arthur Creek excursion to the Late Templetonian–Floran event (Fig. 4b; Lindsay et al., 2005). This assignment corroborates regional isotopic variation in the southern Georgina, Amadeus, and Daly Basins (Lindsay et al., 2005) and, further afield, to the Argentine Precordillera (Gomez et al., 2007), the Great Basin, U.S.A. (Saltzman, 2005), South China (Zhu et al., 2004; Guo et al., 2010), and northwest China (Wang et al., 2011).

Small magnitude discontinuities in $\delta^{13}$C$_{\text{carb}}$ chemostratigraphy occur across the informal member boundaries of the Thorntonia Limestone (Fig. 4b). These
discontinuities likely represent erosive events or hiatuses in deposition. In support of the former interpretation, an increase in Zr/Al occurs across the middle/upper Thorntonia contact (Supplementary Figure 1). Elevated Zr/Al ratios define erosional surfaces where high-energy currents winnow fine-grained, low-density siliciclastics (characterized by Al) and concentrate high-density minerals (characterized by Zr; Vine and Tourtelot, 1970). Unlike carbon isotopes, secondary fluid migration does not affect the Zr/Al ratio. Thus, this proxy confirms sediment winnowing during deposition of the upper Thorntonia. Regionally, the Thorntonia Limestone—Arthur Creek Formation contact represents a sequence boundary, with karstification developed along this surface in the western margin of the basin (Dunster et al., 2007). While the formation boundary within NTGS 99/1 represents a sharp lithologic break, $\delta^{13}C_{\text{carb}}$ values display general continuity across this boundary (Fig. 4b), suggesting either relative temporal continuity or fortuitous resumption of deposition with similar carbon isotopic composition. Isopach maps of the Arthur Creek show that the formation thickens to the east-southeast, where the NTGS 99/1 drill core intercepted the maximum depocenter of the preserved basin margin (Dunster et al., 2007). Thus, under the former scenario, the Thorntonia Limestone—Arthur Creek Formation boundary within NTGS 99/1 could represent a correlative conformity of the regional sequence boundary, with limited time missing across this lithologic contact.

Within NTGS 99/1, $\delta^{13}C_{\text{org}}$ displays co-variation with $\delta^{13}C_{\text{carb}}$ within the lower Thorntonia Limestone and no co-variation with $\delta^{13}C_{\text{carb}}$ within either the middle/upper Thorntonia or the Arthur Creek formations (Fig. 4d,f; lower Thorntonia: $R^2 = 0.75$; middle/upper Thorntonia: $R^2 = 0.04$; Arthur Creek: $R^2 = 0.2$). TOC varies from 0.1-2.9
wt.% in the Thorntonia, displaying a generally increasing trend in the lower Thorntonia and high variance in the middle Thorntonia. TOC ranges from 0.1 to 2.5 wt.% in the lower Arthur Creek, with higher values at the base of the formation, decreasing towards a mean of 0.1 wt.% TOC in the upper 100 m of the measured core interval (Fig. 4d).

Despite the lack of covariance between $\delta^{13}$C$_{\text{carb}}$ and $\delta^{13}$C$_{\text{org}}$ in strata of the middle/upper Thorntonia and the Arthur Creek Formation, one trend emerges: high (> 1.0 wt.%), medium (0.2 < wt.% < 1.0), and low (< 0.2 wt. %) TOC correlate with light, intermediate, and heavy $\delta^{13}$C$_{\text{org}}$ values (Fig. 4d). That is, the lightest $\delta^{13}$C$_{\text{org}}$ values occur in the most organic- and phosphorus-rich lithofacies, the middle Thorntonia Limestone (cf., Bartley et al., 1998, and Guo et al., 2013). The latter two TOC bins generally correspond to samples from the Arthur Creek below and above ~430 mcd, respectively, which is the transition between the laminated facies and the interbedded carbonate mudstone–siliciclastic shale and siltstone facies.

Total phosphorus (P$_T$) within the Thorntonia Limestone ranges up to 3.9 wt.% (Fig. 5a). P$_T$ increases systematically within the lower Thorntonia and the lowermost middle Thorntonia, followed by an additional increase around 575 mcd. We note that the transition from dolostone (stratigraphically below 575.92 mcd) to limestone (stratigraphically above 575.92 mcd) within drill core NTGS 99/1 occurs just below this jump in P content (Figs 5a,b). The overlying meters of the middle and upper Thorntonia display high variance in P$_T$. In contrast, the maximum value of P$_T$ within the Arthur Creek is 0.4 wt.%, but is typically much lower with a median of 0.03 wt.% and 1st and 3rd quartile values of 0.02 and 0.04 wt.%, respectively (Fig. 5a).
We tested the fidelity of the P sequential extraction method by comparing the sum of the operationally-defined pools ($P_T = P_{xI} + P_{\text{auth+carb}} + P_{\text{org}} + P_{\text{Fe}}$) to the total phosphorus content determined by ICP-AES analysis. The consistency between these two measurement techniques (slope of linear regression = 1.1, $R^2 = 0.88$; Fig. 5e) increases confidence in the values of the constituent sequential extraction phases. In both the Thorntonia Limestone and the Arthur Creek Formation, the operationally-defined $P_{xI}$ and $P_{\text{auth+carb}}$ phases dominate $P_T$, while $P_{\text{org}}$ and $P_{\text{Fe}}$ contribute a negligible fraction (Fig. 5b). The median (1st, 3rd quartile) percent contribution to $P_T$ are: $P_{xI} = 91.5\% \ (77.5, 94.4)$, $P_{\text{auth+carb}} = 7.5\% \ (3.7, 19.5)$, and $P_{\text{org}} = 0.4\% \ (0.2, 1.5)$. $P_{\text{Fe}}$ was measured only on a subset of samples, but this phase contributes minimally to $P_T$ (a median of 0.1\% with 1st and 3rd quartiles of 0.0 and 0.4\%, respectively).

Total iron ($Fe_T$) varies from 0.06-1.49 wt.% in the Thorntonia Limestone and from 0.32-2.71 wt.% in the Arthur Creek Formation (Fig. 5c). In general, $Fe_T$ is lowest where $P_T$ is highest. Based on the slope of linear regression, 88\% of $Fe_T$ resides in $Fe_{\text{HR}}$ phases within the Thorntonia ($R^2 = 0.92$; Fig. 6a). In contrast, within the Arthur Creek, ~48\% of $Fe_T$ resides in $Fe_{\text{HR}}$ ($R^2 = 0.57$; Fig. 6a), consistent with the higher siliciclastic fraction for these lithologies. The lower coefficient of determination for the Arthur Creek Formation reflects a decrease in $Fe_{\text{HR}}/Fe_T$ from 0.66 at the base of the formation to ~0.3 near the top of the measured core interval. Reduced iron phases, $Fe_{\text{py}}$ and $Fe_{\text{carb}}$, dominate $Fe_{\text{HR}}$ in both formations, while oxidized and partially oxidized iron phases, $Fe_{\text{ox}}$ and $Fe_{\text{mag}}$, contribute a minimal fraction (Fig. 5c). Based on the slope of the linear regression, 82\% of $Fe_{\text{HR}}$ resides as $Fe_{\text{carb}}$ within the lower Thorntonia ($R^2 = 0.62$; Fig. 6c) while $Fe_{\text{py}}$ accounts for only a minor contribution that has no statistically significant correlation with...
Fe$_{HR}$ (Fig. 6b). As such, the gradual decrease in Fe$_{HR}$ within the lower Thorntonia reflects a systematic decrease in Fe$_{carb}$ from very high values of 1.3 wt.%, to ~0.3 wt.%. In the middle and upper Thorntonia, 64% of Fe$_{HR}$ resides as Fe$_{py}$ ($R^2 = 0.95$; Fig. 6b) and 31% resides as Fe$_{carb}$ ($R^2 = 0.82$; Fig. 6c). For the lower Arthur Creek, ~73% and 26% of Fe$_{HR}$ reside in Fe$_{py}$ ($R^2 = 0.94$; Fig. 6b) and Fe$_{carb}$ ($R^2 = 0.72$; Fig. 6c), respectively.

When we parse the Fe-speciation data of the middle Thorntonia Limestone samples by lithology, we see a similar partitioning of Fe phases as when we group all samples within members (as presented above). Within the dolostone of the middle Thorntonia (580.1 – 575.92 mcd), 98% of Fe$_T$ resides in Fe$_{HR}$ ($R^2 = 0.99$); in contrast, within the limestone of the middle Thorntonia (575.92 mcd – 558.7 mcd), 89% of Fe$_T$ resides in Fe$_{HR}$ ($R^2 = 0.95$). Likewise, within middle Thorntonia dolostone, 67% ($R^2 = 0.94$) and 27% ($R^2 = 0.69$) of Fe$_{HR}$ resides in Fe$_{py}$ and Fe$_{carb}$, respectively; within the middle Thorntonia limestone, 68% ($R^2 = 0.96$) and 30% ($R^2 = 0.86$) of Fe$_{HR}$ resides in Fe$_{py}$ and Fe$_{carb}$, respectively.

Within NTGS 99/1, the median (1st, 3rd quartile) percent acid insoluble fraction (i.e., silicates) within the Thorntonia is 8.3% (5.3, 17.0) as compared to 44.0% (32.8, 54.3) for the Arthur Creek (Supplementary Figure 1). TOC/Al ratios are higher and more variable in the Thorntonia than for the Arthur Creek (Supplementary Figure 1). Fe/Al ratios and Mn/Al ratios decline throughout the lower Thorntonia (save for a couple of high values in the upper Thorntonia; Supplementary Figure 1). The detrital-associated trace element ratio Zr/Al is low and variable within the Thorntonia compared to the Arthur Creek Formation and displays an abrupt increase across the middle/upper Thorntonia boundary. (See Supplementary Information for a discussion of aluminum-
normalized concentrations of redox-sensitive and bioessential trace metals;
Supplementary Figure 2.)

**DISCUSSION**

How do these geochemical data inform our understanding of the source of phosphorus to phosphatic Thorntonia carbonates and, more broadly, the loss of phosphatic lithologies and consequent closure of the phosphatization taphonomic mode during Cambrian Series 2? To address these questions, we combine petrographic observations with P-speciation data to quantify authigenic apatite within the Thorntonia Limestone. In turn, we explore the possibility that P bound within bioclasts, organic matter, or iron minerals sourced the observed P within these lithologies. Finally, we present a mathematical framework for which to deconvolve the relative contribution of the two most likely sources—P bound with organic matter or iron minerals—to authigenic apatite nucleation.

**Source(s) of phosphorus to the Thorntonia Limestone and Arthur Creek Formation**

How much of the apatite within the Thorntonia Limestone and Arthur Creek Formation must we account for with P delivery shuttles? Phosphorus speciation provides a (semi)quantitative measure of the partitioning of phosphorus within a sedimentary succession. The majority of P extracted from NTGS 99/1 is operationally classified as fluorapatite of detrital igneous and/or metamorphic origin (P$_{Di}$; Ruttenberg, 1992) and constitutes a median (1$^{st}$, 3$^{rd}$ quartile) of 91.5% (77.5, 94.4) of P$_{r}$. However, we have three reasons to question this genetic interpretation. First, as described above, petrographic observations reveal that apatite within the Thorntonia Limestone occurs
predominantly as the internal molds of small shelly fossils (Fig. 3a) or, occasionally, as cement within bioclastic grainstone (Fig 3b), both indications of an authigenic origin. Given the thermal history of the Georgina Basin, which reached temperatures necessary to develop Type II kerogen (Dunster et al., 2007), burial diagenesis should have increased the crystallinity of authigenic phosphate minerals (Shemesh, 1990). It is thus not surprising that authigenic apatite formed within marine sediment during the Cambrian is now operationally classified as crystalline igneous and metamorphic apatite (sensu Föllmi et al., 2005). Second, within mud-supported, suspension-deposited carbonate, apatite occurs as coarse-silt- to medium-sand-size grains. Given that we observe no comparable size detrital siliciclastic grains, we suggest these grains are eroded, transported and winnowed authigenic grains. Third, if the P_\text{x}\text{I} phase comprised fluorapatite sourced to the basin along with a detrital siliciclastic influx, we would predict that it should correlate with the siliciclastic-associated heavy element Zr/Al ratio. We observe no correlation between P_\text{x}\text{I} and Zr/Al (Fig. 5f). Thus, consistent with petrographic observations, we conclude that the P_\text{x}\text{I} pool largely represents authigenic apatite and, therefore, we must account for this phase with a delivery shuttle of P to the sediment column.

**Bioclastic apatite as a source of phosphorus for authigenic apatite precipitation?**

Lingulid brachiopods comprise a fraction of the bioclasts identified in samples analyzed petrographically for carbonate sedimentology and apatite distribution. The presence of these phosphatic bioclasts raises two issues. First, samples that contain apatite bioclasts will have a wt.% P_T that overestimates the quantity of authigenic apatite. Determining the actual wt.% of P within authigenic apatite for these samples would require subtracting the
wt.% of bioclastic P from the bulk wt.% $P_T$ determined by phosphorus speciation geochemistry. One method for determining the wt.% of P within primary phosphatic bioclasts would be to use quantitative point-count data to determine the volume of bioclasts, then to multiply this volume by the density of dahllite to determine the mass (wt.%) of P. Given that the percent of primary phosphatic bioclasts visually (qualitatively) rarely exceeds the percent of phosphatic steinkerns and sand-sized authigenic grains (see discussion above), we move forward without quantitative estimates of the wt.% of bioclastic P under the caveat that, for lingulid brachiopod-bearing bioclastic lithologies, $P_T$ overestimates authigenic apatite within a sample.

Second, the observation of bioclasts of primary phosphatic shells raises the possibility that *in situ* dissolution of these bioclasts may have contributed to high pore-water phosphate concentration and facilitated subsequent authigenic precipitation. However, petrographic observations show that inarticulate brachiopod and other phosphatic skeletons are not unusually abundant in phosphate-rich Thorntonia horizons, and conversely that authigenic phosphate is not unusually abundant in those samples with the highest abundances of phosphatic skeletons. Nor do these remains show marked evidence of dissolution. Thus, the sedimentation of phosphatic skeletal material does not seem capable of sourcing the phosphate now found in Thorntonia rocks. Further, *in situ* dissolution of phosphatic bioclasts would necessitate pore fluids that promoted the early dissolution of apatite shells without concurrent dissolution of the calcium carbonate shells and sediment molded and/or replaced by the precipitation of authigenic calcium phosphate minerals. For these reasons, we do not invoke phosphatic skeleton-derived P as a significant source for authigenic apatite precipitation. Nevertheless, if phosphatic
skeleton dissolution were to have sourced P for authigenic apatite, then the required quantity of organic and iron-bound P (discussed below) would lessen proportionately.

Organic-bound phosphorus as a source of phosphorus for authigenic apatite precipitation?

Particulate organic carbon represents the main delivery shuttle of phosphorus to the sediment column in the modern ocean (e.g., Delaney, 1998; Benitez-Nelson, 2000), and so we ask whether organic carbon could have sourced the observed amount of P within beds of the Thorntonia Limestone and the Arthur Creek Formation. Perhaps the simplest model for organic-bound P delivery is to assume that organic matter arrived at the sea floor with a Redfield \( C_{\text{org}}:P_{\text{org}} \) molar ratio of ~106:1 (Redfield, 1958). However, \( C_{\text{org}}:P_{\text{org}} \) of organic matter within marine sediment and, therefore, sedimentary rocks, is commonly much higher than the Redfield ratio as a result of the preferential remineralization of P-rich organic compounds within the water-column (Clark et al., 1998) or within the sediment column (Ingall et al., 1993, Ingall and Jahnke, 1997; Van Cappellen and Ingall, 1996; Jilbert et al., 2011). \( C_{\text{org}}:P_{\text{org}} \) molar ratios within the Thorntonia Limestone range from 79:1 up to 17,000:1 [median (1st, 3rd quartile) = 1,389:1 (521:1, 3619:1)]. Likewise, \( C_{\text{org}}:P_{\text{org}} \) molar ratios within the Arthur Creek Formation range from 43:1 up to 11,770:1 [median (1st, 3rd quartile) = 903:1 (360:1, 3,372:1)]. Thus, \( C_{\text{org}}:P_{\text{org}} \) molar ratios within these lithologies deviate substantially from the Redfield ratio and, at face value, suggest extensive preferential \( P_{\text{org}} \) loss during organic matter respiration.

When organic respiration occurs within the sediment column, liberated \( P_{\text{org}} \) may ‘sink-switch’ and precipitate as authigenic phosphate minerals (Ruttenberg and Berner,}
1993), as is likely the case for the development of phosphatic strata within the Thorntonia Limestone. With respect to phosphorus speciation terminology, ‘sink-switching’ would transfer P from the P$_{\text{org}}$ phase to either the authigenic P$_{\text{sl}}$ or the P$_{\text{auth+carb}}$ phase. In that regard, C$_{\text{org}}$:P$_T$ should provide a better estimate of the retention of organic-bound P to the sedimentary environments of the Thorntonia Limestone and Arthur Creek Formation (Ingall et al., 1993; Ruttenberg and Berner, 1993; Anderson et al., 2001; Algeo and Ingall, 2007). C$_{\text{org}}$:P$_T$ ranges from 0.1–16:1 within the Thorntonia Limestone with a median (1$^{\text{st}}$, 3$^{\text{rd}}$ quartile) value of 2.5:1 (1.2:1, 4.8:1). For the non-phosphatic Arthur Creek Formation, C$_{\text{org}}$:P$_T$ ranges from 5–157:1 with a median (1$^{\text{st}}$, 3$^{\text{rd}}$ quartile) value of 17.4:1 (7.6:1, 44.5:1). Thus, with the exception of four samples, C$_{\text{org}}$:P$_T$ molar ratios for both the Thorntonia Limestone and the Arthur Creek Formation fall well below the canonical Redfield ratio (Fig. 5d). From this perspective, both the Thorntonia Limestone and the Arthur Creek Formation retain more P than would be expected based on organic matter delivery with a molar C$_{\text{org}}$:P$_{\text{org}}$ ratio equal to or greater than the Redfield ratio. Preferential C$_{\text{org}}$ remineralization or hydrocarbon migration relative to P retention may have resulted in a molar C:P$_T$ lower than the Redfield ratio. The required > 90% loss of C$_{\text{org}}$ (see below) appears to be common in relatively organic-lean sediment deposited on oxic Cenozoic seafloors (Anderson et al., 2001); however, given the organic carbon content of Thorntonia samples, and accepting sedimentological and geochemical arguments for anoxic deposition of the Thorntonia Limestone (see below), such loss would have required massive remineralization under anoxic pore water conditions. $\delta^{13}$C$_{\text{carb}}$ values do not show the distinctly light values that might be expected in this circumstance (Schrag et al., 2013). Assuming that all phosphorus was delivered via
organic matter with a Redfield ratio and was subsequently retained within the sediment column, the discrepancy between the Redfield ratio and the measured C:P\(_T\) provides a minimum estimate of C\(_{org}\) loss (estimated quantitatively in a later section).

Organic carbon loss may also occur during low-grade metamorphism (Raiswell and Berner, 1987). Since the lithology of the Thorntonia Limestone precludes a confident application of the suggested metrics to account for this loss (Raiswell and Berner, 1987), we cannot evaluate how much this process may have contributed to the discrepancy between measured C\(_{org}\):P\(_T\) values and the Redfield ratio. However, we can explore whether an additional phosphorus delivery shuttle augmented organic-bound P delivery to the sea floor during deposition of the Thorntonia Limestone and Arthur Creek Formation. We discuss this possibility in a later section.

Notably, phosphatic strata of the middle Thorntonia Limestone have the highest measured wt. % TOC and the lightest \(\delta^{13}C_{org}\) values preserved within this sedimentary succession (Fig. 4c). A similar relationship has been documented in Proterozoic basins and attributed to differential recycling of organic matter in benthic mats (e.g., Bartley et al., 1998; Guo et al., 2013). Within the Thorntonia Limestone, this relationship may result from a difference in the primary isotopic composition of organic matter sourcing phosphatic strata, from variable \textit{in situ} remineralization of the sedimentary organic carbon reservoir, or from some combination of these two processes. We do not have an independent line of evidence (e.g., compound specific biomarkers) to distinguish between these possibilities. Instead, we note that acceptance of either of these hypotheses to explain the observed correlation between P content and \(\delta^{13}C_{org}\) values makes a prediction for the mechanism of P delivery. For the case of an isotopically distinct organic carbon
source to the middle Thorntonia Limestone, the C:P ratio of this source must have been much lower than the canonical Redfield ratio of 106C:1P. For the case of limited $C_{\text{org}}$ remineralization within phosphatic strata, an alternative P delivery shuttle to the sediment column must have augmented organic-bound P delivery.

**Iron-bound phosphorus as a source of phosphorus for authigenic apatite precipitation?**

If our estimates of organic-bound P delivery fail to account for the phosphate necessary for the observed Thorntonia apatite content, what alternative source could supply this P? A growing body of literature calls upon P adsorbed to the surface or co-precipitated with metal oxides, particularly iron (oxyhydr)oxide particles, as an important shuttle of phosphorus to the sea floor (Berner, 1973; Shaffer, 1986; Feely et al., 1991; Feely et al., 1998; Poulton and Canfield, 2006). Additionally, under anoxic conditions, Fe(II)-phosphates (e.g., vivianite, strengite) may play a more important role for marine P cycling than previously considered (e.g., März et al., 2008; Dellwig et al., 2010; Jilbert and Slomp, 2013). Thus, the release of adsorbed/co-precipitated Fe-bound P to sediment pore waters has previously been invoked as a necessary and significant source of P for sedimentary apatite nucleation (Krom and Berner, 1981; Schuffert et al., 1994, 1998; Slomp et al., 1996; Shen et al., 2000; März et al., 2008; Jilbert and Slomp, 2013).

Could the Fe-P shuttle have augmented organic-bound P delivery to Thorntonia and Arthur Creek sediments? In the modern, oxygenated ocean, iron mobility is generally limited to particulate fluxes of insoluble Fe$^{3+}$ phases (Martin and Meybeck, 1979; Poulton and Raiswell, 2002). Under these conditions, we might predict Fe-bound P.
delivery to these environments to be proportional to the (predominantly siliciclastic) particulate Fe(III) flux. In contrast, under anoxic conditions the reductive dissolution of iron (oxyhydr)oxides by dissimilatory iron reduction or by dissolved sulfide during early diagenesis generates soluble Fe\(^{2+}\) that is subsequently redistributed to anoxic slope and basinal environments (Canfield et al., 1996; Severmann et al., 2008; 2010; see review in Lyons and Severmann, 2006). This so-called ‘intrabasin iron shuttle’ provides a mechanism for decoupling iron delivery to the seafloor from siliciclastic sources and, therefore, we hypothesize that it allows for the delivery of P adsorbed to detrital Fe(III) minerals, Fe(II)-phosphate minerals (e.g., März et al., 2008; Dellwig et al., 2010; Jilbert and Slomp, 2013) and P adsorbed to/co-precipitated with Fe(III)-minerals formed from the oxidation of ferrous iron in the water column (cf., Mayer and Jarrell, 2000). In this regard, under either an oxic or an anoxic Cambrian water-column, Thorntonia and Arthur Creek sediments could have received substantial Fe-bound P; however, we note that the P contribution from the Fe-bound P shuttle would have been larger if these sediments accumulated under an anoxic water column.

The redox state of the southern Georgina Basin water column during deposition of these middle Cambrian strata can be assessed using data on the speciation and enrichment of sedimentary iron minerals. This geochemical method is most commonly applied to fine-grain siliciclastic lithologies, where the ratios of various mineralogical phases are interpreted to reflect specific and calibrated environmental redox conditions (Canfield et al., 1992; Raiswell and Canfield, 1998; Raiswell et al., 2001; Poulton and Raiswell, 2002). On the basis of empirical evidence, Fe\(_{HR}\)/Fe\(_T\) above 0.38 within fine-grain siliciclastic lithologies indicates sediment accumulation under an anoxic water-column.
Fe_{HR}/Fe_T below a value of ~0.22 is suggestive of oxic conditions (Poulton and Raiswell, 2002; Poulton and Canfield, 2011); additionally, in the case of anoxia, Fe_{py}/Fe_{HR} differentiates ferruginous (<0.7-0.8) from euxinic (>0.8) conditions (Anderson and Raiswell, 2004; Poulton et al., 2004; März et al., 2008; Poulton and Canfield, 2011).

The Arthur Creek Formation includes a siliciclastic facies (the ‘hot shale’) that is ideal for iron-based redox proxies (Poulton and Canfield, 2005). Fe_T within the Arthur Creek ‘hot shale’ ranges up to ~2.7 wt.% (Fig. 6a) and almost all measured highly reactive iron resides in reduced iron minerals (Fig. 6b,c). Fe_{HR}/Fe_T and Fe_{py}/Fe_{HR} indicate an anoxic, ferruginous redox environment during deposition of the ‘hot shale’ (Fig. 6a,b). In contrast, strata of the interlaminated siliciclastic shale/siltstone and carbonate calcimudstone facies of the Arthur Creek Formation (directly overlying the ‘hot shale’) contain a lower siliciclastic component, and this requires special attention in interpreting a paleo-redox environment. We note that each iron-speciation sample integrates 3 cm of stratigraphy; therefore, for this lithofacies, our sample preparation method homogenized multiple laminae of pure siliciclastic shale/siltstone and pure carbonate mudstone. Yet, despite the diluting carbonate component, Fe_{HR} is partitioned within this lithofacies in the same proportionality as the ‘hot shale’ (Fig. 6b,c). In this regard, iron speciation data for this lithofacies of the Arthur Creek Formation are consistent with the anoxic, ferruginous redox environment inferred for the underlying ‘hot shale’.

Strata of the Thorntonia Limestone are composed almost entirely of carbonate, and for this reason we do not to interpret these iron speciation data within the canonical,
siliciclastic-derived redox framework. Instead, we emphasize that the black, organic-rich
carbonate strata of the middle/upper Thorntonia Limestone (Fig. 2c), biomarker and
organic geochemistry of the Thorntonia and Arthur Creek petroleum systems (Boreham
and Ambrose, 2005), and trace element data (Supplementary Information) are
qualitatively consistent with iron speciation metrics for the Arthur Creek Formation ‘hot
shale’ (Fig. 6) for an anoxic depositional environment during accumulation of the
phosphatic middle/upper Thorntonia Limestone. Thus, we conclude that the Fe-oxide
bound P shuttle likely augmented organic-bound P delivery to the Thorntonia and Arthur
Creek sediment column. Further, if one accepts the sedimentological and geochemical
evidence for sediment accumulation under an anoxic, ferruginous water column, this then
allows for the possibility that Fe(II)-phosphates provided a second, potentially significant
source of P to Thorntonia sediments.

Nevertheless, the limited contribution of Fe$_{ox}$ to Fe$_HR$ in both the Thorntonia and
Arthur Creek (Fig. 5c), the low P$_Fe$ values (Fig. 5b), and the present decoupling of P
within the Thorntonia from Fe$_HR$ phases (Fig. 5g) all suggest that any P delivered to
Thorntonia sediments via the Fe-P shuttle must have been subsequently decoupled from
iron particles within the sediment column. One way to explain this decoupling is through
the reductive dissolution of Fe oxides in anoxic pore-waters. This suggestion is consistent
with petrological observations that require wholesale remobilization of P before
precipitation within shell interiors (Fig. 3a,b). Thus, the present distribution of P in the
Thorntonia Limestone, spatially decoupled from either iron or organic carbon sources,
confounds easy attribution to primary source vectors. In the following section we
integrate C, Fe, and P geochemical data to explore the relative contribution from organic-bound and iron-bound P delivery sources.

Assessing the relative importance of organic-bound versus iron-bound phosphorus to authigenic apatite precipitation

To begin, we estimate whether organic matter degradation alone could provide sufficient phosphorus for the observed apatite content in the Thorntonia Limestone. We then quantify how much of this estimated organic carbon must have been lost through remineralization to reconcile the observed wt.% TOC within these strata. To do so, we use a Redfield stoichiometry (Redfield, 1958) to relate the measured sedimentary weight percent phosphorus to the associated flux of organic carbon necessary for this phosphorus delivery. Redfield stoichiometry varies in space and time due to, for instance, taxonomic variability in biomolecular and cellular composition and nutrient availability regulating biosynthetic allocation (e.g., Geider and LaRoche, 2002). Moreover, water-column heterotrophy increases the C:P ratio of particulate organic carbon delivered to the sediment-water interface (Clark et al., 1998). To be conservative, we assume no water-column remineralization and adopt the canonical Redfield ratio (106C:1P) in the calculations below. We also adopt the combined organic-bound and authigenic phosphorus phases determined from the phosphorus speciation extraction as an estimate of the original flux of phosphorus delivered to the sediment via organic matter. This calculation provides a conservative estimate because we neglect iron-adsorbed and carbonate-bound P as potential sources for authigenic apatite (as these can represent
primary sources of phosphorus to the sediment column), and we assume no diffusive loss of phosphate from pore-water contemporaneous with sedimentary apatite authigenesis.

Following the above arguments, our estimate for the weight percent organic carbon delivered to the sediment column ($\hat{C}_{org}$) that can account for the measured phosphorus content is given by:

$$\hat{C}_{org} = (P_{xl} + P_{org}) \times R \times \left( \frac{\alpha_c}{\alpha_p} \right)$$  \hspace{1cm} (1)

where $R$ is the adopted Redfield ratio and $\alpha_c$ and $\alpha_p$ represent the molar weights of carbon and phosphorus, respectively (Slomp et al., 2004). We estimate the percentage of organic carbon remineralization necessary to reconcile the difference between the delivery estimate, $\hat{C}_{org}$, and the measured wt.% total organic carbon ($C_{org}$) within Thorntonia and Arthur Creek rocks (Slomp et al., 2004) as:

$$\% \text{ loss of } \hat{C}_{org} = \left( \frac{C_{org} - \hat{C}_{org}}{\hat{C}_{org}} \right) \times 100.$$  \hspace{1cm} (2)

This value represents an estimate of organic carbon remineralization in the time between delivery to the sediment-water interface and lithification. Applying these equations to samples within the phosphorus-enriched middle and upper Thorntonia yields a median $\hat{C}_{org}$ of 18.6 wt.% and a median loss of 97.8% of this estimated delivery flux (Fig. 7). For comparison, applying these equations to samples from the Arthur Creek indicates a median organic carbon loss estimate of 74.0% from a median organic carbon delivery estimate, $\hat{C}_{org}$, of only 1.1 wt.% (Fig. 7). If, instead, we consider more typical ratios of $C_{org}:P_{org}$ delivered to the sediment column, that is, $C:P \gg 106:1$ (Ingall et al., 1993; Van Cappellen and Ingall, 1996; Clark et al., 1998; Algeo and Ingall, 2007), then the required
C_{org} delivery ($\hat{C}_{org}^*$) and the estimated $\% \hat{C}_{org}^*$ loss increase proportionally. Likewise, any diffusive/advective loss of phosphate from the sediment column prior to lithification (Ingall et al., 1993; Slomp et al. 2002; 2004) would increase the requisite $\hat{C}_{org}^*$ and, thus, the inferred $\% \hat{C}_{org}^*$ loss.

If organic carbon represented the sole delivery source of phosphorus to the sediment column, what would have been the oxidant demand for the organic carbon remineralization estimated above? Dissimilatory microbial metabolisms couple the remineralization of sedimentary organic carbon to the reduction of an oxidant (primarily O$_2$, NO$_3^-$, SO$_4^{2-}$, and Fe$^{3+}$; Konhauser, 2007). Thus, a portion of the estimated organic carbon loss can be accounted for in the early diagenetic minerals pyrite and siderite, which form from microbial dissimilatory sulfate and ferric iron respiration, respectively. In the following calculations, we assume the stoichiometry of Fe-(oxyhydr)oxide reduction, where one mole of organic carbon is remineralized per four moles of siderite produced:

\[
\text{CH}_2\text{O} + 8\text{H}^+ + 4\text{Fe(OH)}_3 \rightarrow 4\text{Fe}^{2+}_{(aq)} + \text{CO}_2 + 11\text{H}_2\text{O} \tag{3}
\]

\[
4\text{Fe}^{2+}_{(aq)} + 4\text{CO}_2 + 4\text{H}_2\text{O} \rightarrow 4\text{FeCO}_3 + 8\text{H}^+ \tag{4}
\]

and sulfate reduction, where four moles of organic carbon are remineralized per mole of pyrite produced:

\[
4\text{CH}_2\text{O} + 2\text{SO}_4^{2-} \rightarrow 2\text{H}_2\text{S} + 4\text{HCO}_3^- \tag{5}
\]

\[
\text{Fe}^{2+}_{(aq)} + 2\text{H}_2\text{S} \Rightarrow \text{FeS}_2 + 4\text{H}^+ \tag{6}
\]

We note that if Fe$^{2+}$ for pyrite formation were also reduced locally it would require additional C$_{org}$ consumption, akin to Eqn. (3).
To correct for the presence of siderite within samples, we relate the measured molar quantity of siderite to the Fe$^{3+}$ respiration stoichiometries of Eqns. 3 and 4 to estimate the necessary weight percent of organic carbon consumed to produce this siderite ($C_{\text{siderite}}$):

$$C_{\text{siderite}} = \left( \frac{\text{measured siderite (mol) \times \left( \frac{1 \text{ mol } C_{\text{org}}}{4 \text{ mol siderite}} \right) \times \gamma}}{\text{sample weight (g)}} \right) \times 100$$ \hspace{1cm} (7)$$

where $\gamma$ converts measured values in moles to wt.%. Likewise, to correct for the presence of pyrite, we relate the measured molar quantity of pyrite within each sample to the stoichiometry of SO$_4^{2-}$ respiration (Eqns. 5 and 6) in order to estimate the weight percent of organic carbon remineralized to produce this pyrite ($C_{\text{pyrite}}$):

$$C_{\text{pyrite}} = \left( \frac{\text{measured pyrite (mol) \times \left( \frac{4 \text{ mol } C_{\text{org}}}{1 \text{ mol pyrite}} \right) \times \gamma}}{\text{sample weight (g)}} \right) \times 100 \text{ .}$$ \hspace{1cm} (8)$$

Equation (8) does not account for any $C_{\text{org}}$ consumed to reduce iron for pyrite (e.g., Eqn. 3). In this regard, Eqns. 8 and 9 conservatively underestimate the weight percent of organic carbon remineralized to form pyrite for the case that iron was reduced locally, rather than sourced as Fe$^{2+}$.

With these estimates, we augment Eqn. (2) as:

$$\left( \frac{\hat{C}_{\text{org}} - \left( C_{\text{org}} + C_{\text{pyrite}} + C_{\text{siderite}} \right)}{\hat{C}_{\text{org}}} \right) \times 100 \text{ .}$$ \hspace{1cm} (9)$$

This exercise yields a corrected median % $\hat{C}_{\text{org}}$ loss for the middle and upper Thorntonia members of 96.2%, not significantly different than the estimate from Eqn. 2 (Fig. 7). In contrast, and with the exception of phosphorus-enriched samples in the uppermost measured meters, the corrected median loss for the Arthur Creek indicates that there is an
excess wt.% of organic carbon to account for the observed wt.% phosphorus (Fig. 7).

However, the observed quantity of siderite within Thorntonia and Arthur Creek samples may represent a late diagenetic addition to the sediment column and, thus, may not have formed through local iron respiration consuming $C_{\text{org}}$. If this were the case, the % $C_{\text{org}}$ loss would be less than the value estimated by Eqn. (9), and closer to the value determined by Eqn. (2).

With sulfate and ferric iron accounted for, the only quantitatively important remaining oxidant is molecular oxygen (Konhauser, 2007). In this regard, and if the above assumptions hold, the implication is that the majority of the hypothesized organic carbon loss was through respiration using molecular oxygen. We define a ratio of the estimate of organic matter consumed through anoxic respiration (that is, with $\text{Fe}^{3+}$ and $\text{SO}_4^{2-}$: $C_{\text{siderite}}$ and $C_{\text{pyrite}}$, respectively) to the estimate of $C_{\text{org}}$ loss not accounted for by this estimated anoxic remineralization. We calculate the ratio of anoxic to oxic respiration as:

$$\frac{\text{anoxic respiration}}{\text{oxic respiration}} = \frac{C_{\text{pyrite}} + C_{\text{siderite}}}{C_{\text{org}} - (C_{\text{org}} + C_{\text{pyrite}} + C_{\text{siderite}})}.$$  \hspace{1cm} (10)

In solving Eqn. (10), we obtain a median (1$^{\text{st}}$, 3$^{\text{rd}}$ quartile) value of 0.02 (0.1, 0.4) for the middle and upper Thorntonia members. This is to say that a median 2% of the estimated organic carbon delivery required to source the observed phosphorus content was remineralized through anoxic pathways---98% must have been remineralized with molecular oxygen to explain the absence of this organic carbon from measured samples.

If, however, one assumes a diffusive loss of either sulfide or ferrous iron from the sediment column (i.e., the numerator underestimates the organic carbon consumed by anoxic remineralization), the estimated percent of anoxic remineralization becomes a
minimum. If such diffusive loss occurred, then the proportion of $C_{\text{org}}$ remineralized through oxic respiration would be less than 98% and approach 0% as the sedimentary production of sulfide and/or $\text{Fe}^{2+}$ through microbial dissimilatory redox reactions quantitatively consumed $\hat{C}_{\text{org}}^*$. While we cannot determine the diffusive flux of reductants from Thorntonia or Arthur Creek sediments based on preserved geochemical signals, we note that such a diffusive loss would be possible if the redox boundary resided within the water column.

The calculated weight percent organic carbon required to deliver the observed phosphorus is notable; the median value, 18.6 wt.%, exceeds organic carbon export to the sea floor in most modern marine environments (Hedges and Keil, 1995). While such low organic carbon preservation efficiencies (or, as we describe, high % $\hat{C}_{\text{org}}^*$ loss estimates) commonly occur within modern marine environments, they typify depositional environments with low sediment accumulation rates (< ~0.02 cm/yr) or oxygenated shelf settings (> 20 $\mu$M bottom-water O$_2$; Canfield, 1994; Hedges and Keil, 1995). While we cannot provide unequivocal evidence that substantial aerobic carbon respiration did not consume most of the $C_{\text{org}}$ originally delivered to the Thorntonia sediment column, we find it difficult to reconcile how such substantial aerobic respiration could have proceeded without concurrently driving the sediment column anoxic, providing a negative feedback on the efficiency of organic carbon respiration. Moreover, we note that the oxidant demand to remineralize this magnitude of organic carbon is difficult to reconcile with Cambrian oxygen levels, perhaps 15 – 50% present atmospheric concentrations (Dahl et al., 2010; Bergman et al., 2004; for alternative views, see Berner, 2006; Garrels and Lerman, 1984). Nevertheless, it remains a possibility that episodes of
intense aerobic respiration—and efficient capture of released P within authigenic
phases—account for Thorntonia Limestone phosphatic carbonate precipitation (although
see Föllmi et al. (2005) for discussion of a Miocene phosphogenic episode in which P
sourced from aerobic respiration was ruled out). If, however, one accepts the conclusion
that organic burial alone does not provide an adequate source of phosphorus to the
sediment column, then an additional source of P must have been present during
Thorntonia deposition.

Phosphorus adsorbed onto and/or co-precipitated with metal oxide particles
provides a second potential source of P to the sediment column whose importance
depends, in part, on the magnitude of the flux of metal oxides to the sediment column
(Shaffer, 1986; Feely et al., 1990; Feely et al., 1998; Poulton and Canfield, 2006).
Accordingly, we estimate phosphorus delivery under the assumption of an appreciable
iron-bound P flux, for simplicity based entirely on P adsorbed to iron (oxyhydr)oxides.
This assumption is consistent with the order-of-magnitude calculations presented above;
nonetheless, we acknowledge that other metal oxides, particularly manganese, play an
important role in the cycling of phosphorus (e.g., Dellwig et al., 2010).

Ideally, iron-speciation measurements could provide the basis for a quantitative
estimate of Fe-bound P delivered to the sediment column. But before we can perform
such a calculation, we ask whether the Fe_{ox}, Fe_{mag}, Fe_{carb}, and Fe_{py} pools as determined by
iron speciation in carbonate-rich strata of the Thorntonia Limestone and Arthur Creek
Formation reflect primary depositional reservoirs, or if post-depositional diagenesis could
have converted iron into, out of, or between these phases of the highly reactive iron pool?
Specifically, if these lithologies experienced closed system (with respect to mass)
diagenetic remobilization of Fe, then it is likely that appreciable amounts of Fe were transferred between highly reactive iron phases (e.g., the formation of Fe\text{carb} and Fe\text{py} through the reduction of an Fe\text{ox} precursor phase). In this regard, the value for Fe\text{HR} would still accurately represent the primary iron pool—and could thus be used in calculations of Fe-bound P delivery—however calculations involving any individual Fe\text{HR} phase (e.g., Fe\text{ox}, Fe\text{carb}) would not provide robust estimates of Fe-bound P. Alternatively, if these lithologies underwent open system diagenesis, the resulting addition or loss of Fe from the Fe\text{HR} pool (from any and/or all constituent phases) would render any calculation based on the iron speciation data suspect. While we cannot eliminate the possibility of Fe addition during open system diagenesis, we note that Fe-speciation data for the Thorntonia Limestone and Arthur Creek Formation are consistent with other redox proxies (see above) favoring the view that the highly reactive iron species to these rocks record a substantial depositional flux.

In the following discussion we provide a methodology to address the potential contribution of the Fe-P shuttle to Thorntonia and Arthur Creek sediments under the assumption of limited or closed system iron diagenesis. To this end, we employ iron speciation data from these lithologies for illustrative calculations. These calculations provide a consistency argument given that organic-bound P was likely insufficient to account for the measured P content. Throughout this discussion, we introduce and emphasize the caveats inherent to the use of a diagenetically mobile element in these calculations.

The molar ratio of the co-precipitation of phosphorus onto iron (oxyhydr)oxide particles conforms to a distribution coefficient ($K_D$) model that scales linearly to the
ambient seawater phosphate concentration ([Psw]) (Feely et al., 1991; 1998; Konhauser et al., 2007):

\[
\left( \frac{P}{Fe} \right)_{molar} = K_D \times [P_{sw}].
\]  

(11)

Thus, to estimate the delivery of iron-bound phosphorus, \( \hat{P}_{Fe}^* \), we multiply an estimate of iron oxide delivery (\( \hat{Fe}^*_{ox} \)) by the adsorption coefficient of phosphorus to iron oxides (\( K_D \)) for a given estimate of seawater phosphate concentration ([Psw]):

\[
\hat{P}_{Fe}^* = \gamma \hat{Fe}^*_{ox} \times K_D \times [P_{sw}]
\]  

(12)

where \( \gamma \) converts measured values (in wt.%) to moles as required in the definition of the adsorption coefficient. Within anoxic pore-waters, a fraction of the iron oxides delivered to the sediment column will be reduced by dissimilatory iron reduction and converted to ferrous iron, and these ions will either precipitate as pyrite or iron carbonate, or advect/diffuse to the overlying water column. Accordingly, a full accounting of \( \hat{Fe}^*_{ox} \) would include all of these conservation and loss terms. The estimate would become a lower bound on \( \hat{P}_{Fe}^* \) if we ignored the ferrous iron loss flux, which in any event is unconstrained, and included only the measured iron oxide (\( Fe_{ox} \)), pyrite (\( Fe_{py} \)) and iron-carbonate phases (\( Fe_{carb} \)). We note, however, that at least some of the measured Fe (most obviously the \( Fe_{carb} \) phase) may have originated from diagenetic remobilization of iron to these carbonates. (For the lower Thorntonia Limestone, \( Fe_{carb} \) comprises a median (1st, 3rd quartile) of 76.8 % (71.3, 81.8) of the total iron pool; in contrast, for the phosphatic middle/upper Thorntonia and for the Arthur Creek Formation, \( Fe_{carb} \) accounts for only
28.7 % (22.3, 33.2) and 20 % (15.15, 23.5) of FeT, respectively.) In this regard, this
calculation may overestimate $\hat{P}_{Fe}^*$. Magnetite may form through the reductive
dissolution of mixed ferrous–ferric oxide phases (e.g., Zegeye et al., 2012), and, as such, could be considered in the
summation of primary iron oxide minerals ($\hat{F}e_{ox}^*$); however, magnetite may also form
during prograde metamorphism, in which case inclusion of this phase would over-
estimate the primary ferric iron flux to the sediment column. We include Fe_{mag} within our
calculation because the authigenic pathway likely exceeds weathering and metamorphic
overprints for this depositional environment. (Regardless, within NTGS 99/1 magnetite
represents a negligible component of FeT, therefore this assumption does not alter the
illustrative estimate for $\hat{P}_{Fe}^*$.) Therefore, we rewrite Eqn (12) in the approximate form:

$$\hat{P}_{Fe}^* = \gamma(F_{eox} + F_{epy} + F_{ecarb} + F_{emag}) \times K_D \times [P_{SW}]. \quad (13)$$

A host of seawater ions—notably silica, trace metals and rare earth elements—
compete with phosphorus for adsorption sites on the surface of iron oxide particles (e.g.,
Berner, 1973; Trocine and Trefry, 1988; Olivarez and Owen, 1989; Trefry and Metz,
1989; Feely et al., 1991; Feely et al., 1998; German et al., 1990; Konhauser et al., 2007).
Thus, the choice of $K_D$ depends on the assumption of the seawater composition of
Cambrian oceans. As these element concentrations are broadly unknown for the
Paleozoic Era, we focus here only on the role of the major seawater constituent dissolved
silica in competition for iron-surface anion sites. Following Siever’s (1992) inference of
cristobalite saturation for early Phanerozoic seawater ($[Si_{SW}] = 0.67$ mM), Konhauser et
al. (2007) determined experimentally a $K_D = 0.0108$ for ferrihydrite at this silica
saturation state. Notably, the linear range of the $K_D$ model depends on the phosphorus
concentration of ambient seawater. At cristobalite saturation, the linearity of the $K_D$
model saturates above $\sim$5 $\mu$M $[P_{sw}]$. This is to say that the co-precipitation and delivery of
phosphorus bound to iron oxides remains constant at and above this ambient seawater
phosphate concentration.

Hence, we adopt $[P_{sw}] = 5$ $\mu$M to calculate a maximum estimate for $\hat{P}_{Fe}$ at the
adopted $[Si_{SW}]$. We emphasize that the chosen value of 5 $\mu$M is a simplistic assumption
and that water column phosphorus concentrations are affected by variable environmental
factors that are difficult to generalize, even under well-constrained modern conditions.
Nevertheless, this adopted phosphate concentration is consistent with modern anoxic
environments, including the Black Sea and Cariaco Basin (Shaffer, 1986; Scranton et al.,
2006). For example, in the Black Sea, higher phosphate concentrations in the ferruginous
chemocline than in the underlying sulfidic waters result from the dissolution of settling
Fe-oxides and the release of adsorbed phosphate (Brewer and Murray, 1973). Similar
processes are suggested to explain the phosphate concentrations (up to 9 $\mu$M dissolved P)
in the ferruginous Lake Matano (Crowe et al., 2008) where the release of Fe(III)-bound P
at the chemocline is balanced by the precipitation of Fe(II)-phosphates below the
chemocline.

Applying Eqn. (13) to samples from the middle and upper Thorntonia members
yields a median estimate for iron-bound P of 0.1 wt.% as compared to a median estimate
of 0.2 wt.% for the Arthur Creek (Fig. 7). In this formulation, phosphorus delivery by
iron oxides is proportional to the highly reactive iron phases ($Fe_{HR}$) determined from iron
speciation geochemistry. While $Fe_{HR}/Fe_T$ decreases between the P-enriched middle /
upper Thorntonia members and the Arthur Creek, the observed increase in $Fe_T$ within the
Arthur Creek compensates such that the molar estimate of $\hat{Fe}_{ox}^*$, and, thus, $\hat{P}_{Fe}^*$ remains roughly constant between the two formations. As such, and if the above assumptions hold, this implies that the relative contribution of the Fe-P shuttle to the observed weight percent sedimentary P was much greater during deposition of the Arthur Creek Formation because of the lower wt.% P$_T$ measured throughout this formation. Indeed, the median estimate of $\hat{P}_{Fe}^* = 0.2$ wt.% for the Arthur Creek greatly exceeds the median measured P$_T$ (0.03 wt.%; Fig. 7). In contrast, the median estimate of $\hat{P}_{Fe}^* = 0.1$ wt.% for the middle and upper Thorntonia members provides only ~10% of the median measured P$_T$ (0.98 wt.%; Fig. 7), and proportionally less for samples with the highest measured P$_T$ approaching 4 wt.%. Likewise, any diffusive loss of P from the sediment column prior to lithification would increase the requisite $\hat{P}_{Fe}^*$ and, in the case of the Thorntonia, increase the deficiency between the observed P$_T$ and P hypothesized to have been delivered associated with Fe$_{ox}$ ($\hat{P}_{Fe}^*$).

The formulation of our equations may significantly overestimate Fe-bound P delivery for two reasons. First, our calculations adopt a $K_D$ value based on an estimate of contemporaneous seawater silica concentrations. Second, our calculations adopt a seawater phosphate concentration that maximizes the potential for phosphorus delivery by the iron shuttle. If we presumed a higher seawater silica concentration (that is, decreased $K_D$), or if, for an assumed [Si$_{SW}$], we also assumed a lower [P$_{SW}$], then we would calculate a lower P delivery flux per unit Fe$_{ox}$. Thus, both of these changes would yield a lower estimate of $\hat{P}_{Fe}^*$ for a given iron flux to the sediment column.
Some iron minerals are more effective P delivery shuttles than others. The capacity for iron minerals to scavenge and deliver phosphorus to the sea floor depends on a number of factors, including the surface density of adsorption sites, which in part is related to mineral surface area. In this regard, amorphous to poorly crystalline phases will scavenge more phosphate than highly crystalline phases. (We note, however, that progressive crystallization may result in the subsequent desorption of P from adsorption sites. If this desorption occurs within the sediment column, outside the length-scales of advection/diffusion with the overlying water-column, Fe-bound P could provide a significant source of P to the sediment column.) Here we assumed ferrihydrite as the carrier phase (Konhauser et al., 2007), however, a range of other iron minerals form during anaerobic Fe\(^{2+}\) oxidation (e.g., Kappler and Newman, 2004; Zegeye et al., 2012). For instance, in the only detailed study of Fe mineralogy in a ferruginous water column (Lake Matano, Indonesia), Zegeye et al. (2012) found that ferrihydrite was quantitatively transformed to carbonated green rust (‘fougerite’) during settling through the water column, with more minor formation of magnetite. Unfortunately, no experimental data currently exist for P adsorption to green rust under the chemical conditions likely encountered in Cambrian oceans (e.g., Lake Matano has relatively low [Si]). However, adsorption of oxyanions to green rust tends to be far higher than for ferrihydrite (Randall et al., 2001), and thus such a finding highlights the need to consider multiple and varied carrier phases for the ancient Fe-P shuttle. An iron carrier phase with an adsorption coefficient (\(K_D\)) with respect to P greater than ferrihydrite could have delivered more P to Thorntonia sediments for a given iron flux to the sea floor.
Are there other scenarios in which the delivery of Fe-bound P could have been greater than that inferred from the formulations of equations 11 through 13? To answer this question it is necessary to address whether the measured Fe\textsubscript{HR} is an accurate proxy for the contribution of Fe\textsubscript{ox} to the sediment column, or whether it could underestimate the original Fe\textsubscript{ox} flux (\(\dot{\hat{P}}_{Fe}^{*}\)), and, thus, \(\dot{\hat{P}}_{Fe}^{*}\) to the sediment column. Next, we explore hypothetical redox scenarios in which Fe-bound P could contribute more substantially to authigenic apatite. Without an independent line of evidence that the constituent phases of the highly reactive iron pool represent the primary fluxes of iron to the sediment column, we choose not to advocate for this possibility for the Thorntonia Limestone. Nevertheless, with regard to the broader question of the mechanism for phosphatic carbonate deposition, we find it informative to evaluate the circumstances in which the Fe-bound delivery shuttle could contribute substantially to phosphogenesis and phosphatic carbonate deposition.

One can envision a spectrum of scenarios for the relative magnitudes of Fe\textsubscript{ox} delivery to and Fe\textsuperscript{2+} loss from the sediment column. These scenarios fall within three generalized categories: Fe\textsubscript{ox} delivery (1) greater than, (2) nearly equal to, or (3) less than Fe\textsuperscript{2+} diffusive/advective loss. In the following discussion we discount scenario (3) because such an imbalance defines an unsustainable Fe cycle. To begin, we consider the scenario that (1) Fe\textsubscript{ox} delivery exceeds Fe\textsuperscript{2+} loss. This can result from two opposing redox regimes. (1a) If the majority of Fe\textsubscript{ox} delivered to the sediment column were stabilized within oxygenated pore-water then this would preclude widespread iron reduction. In this instance, only a small amount P would be liberated from the Fe\textsubscript{ox} delivery shuttle, and Fe\textsubscript{ox} would dominate Fe\textsubscript{HR}. (1b) Alternatively, if sedimentary electron donors (e.g., C\textsubscript{org})...
contributed to pore-water anoxia, some fraction of the delivered Fe$_{\text{ox}}$ would be reduced to Fe$^{2+}$, and any P bound to these Fe$_{\text{ox}}$ particles would be released to pore-waters. To maintain the low Fe$^{2+}$ loss fraction defining this scenario, any Fe$^{2+}$ ions produced must be captured quantitatively within authigenic ferrous iron minerals. In this instance, sedimentary Fe would be partitioned amongst Fe$_{\text{ox}}$, Fe$_{\text{carb}}$, and Fe$_{\text{py}}$ phases, and the dominance of the latter two minerals would imply that much of the original Fe$_{\text{ox}}$ flux was reduced. Notably, with regard to P delivery, either scenario for high Fe$_{\text{ox}}$ delivery relative to Fe$^{2+}$ loss predicts that the measurement of sedimentary Fe$_{\text{HR}}$ represents a close approximation of the magnitude of P delivery associated with the Fe-P shuttle ($\hat{P}_{\text{Fe}}^*$). If, for example, the Fe cycle were operating in this manner at the time of deposition of the middle and upper Thorntonia members then, under the above assumptions, the Fe-shuttle would be constrained to have contributed a median of ~10% P$_T$ (as determined from Eqn. 13) and, therefore, could not represent a dominant source of P for the observed enrichment.

If scenarios 1a and 1b cannot source significant amounts of Fe-bound P to phosphatic lithologies, can scenario 2? Like scenario (1b) above, scenario (2) necessitates a redox environment that facilitates the reductive dissolution of the majority of Fe$_{\text{ox}}$ delivered to the sediment column, regardless of the size of this flux. In contrast, scenario (2) is distinguished from scenario (1) by the condition that the majority of the sedimentary Fe$^{2+}$ produced must escape to the overlying water column, resulting in less capture of Fe$^{2+}$ ions in authigenic minerals. Such diffusive loss requires anoxia within the water-mass overlying the sediment column. As above, Fe retained within the sediment can reside in any combination of Fe$_{\text{ox}}$, Fe$_{\text{carb}}$, and/or Fe$_{\text{py}}$ phases. Notably, Scenario (2)
allows for the measured Fe$_{HR}$ value to significantly underestimate iron oxide delivery to
the sea floor ($\hat{P}_{Fe}^*$) and, therefore, to underestimate the Fe-P shuttle ($\hat{P}_{PFe}^*$). If, for
example, the Fe cycle were operating with an extensive benthic flux of Fe$^{2+}$ to the water
column during deposition of the middle Thorntonia Limestone, and if a mechanism
existed to preferentially retain the delivered P, then the Fe-P shuttle could have provided
a significant proportion of the observed P to these phosphatic strata, that is, greater than
the $\sim 10\%$ estimated from Eqn. (13).

In summary, simple models of Fe-bound P delivery estimates ($\hat{P}_{PFe}^*$), as determined
from Eqn. (13), indicate that this delivery shuttle could have sourced the measured P
content of the Arthur Creek Formation. In contrast, our estimates of Fe-bound P can only
account for a median of 10\% of the P content the Thorntonia Limestone. (This estimate
assumes that Fe$_{HR}$ in Thorntonia rocks reflects deposition from the water column. To the
extent that Thorntonia iron minerals reflect open-system diagenesis, this estimate would
be even lower.) Only by invoking a major diffusive loss of iron from the Thorntonia
sediment column with subsequent capture of delivered P within authigenic phases—a
scenario for which we do not advocate, yet do not find inconsistent with the assumption
of limited diagenesis—could Fe-bound P have provided a more substantial contribution
to phosphatic carbonates of the Thorntonia Limestone.

**CONCLUSIONS**

Within drill core NTGS 99/1, phosphorus enrichment is confined to the middle
and upper members of the Thorntonia Limestone, and petrographic observations reveal
that this enrichment reflects authigenic apatite mineral nucleation primarily associated
with the interior of bioclasts and, more rarely, as cement in bioclastic grainstone. Under the canonical model that phosphorus bound within organic matter represents the only significant delivery flux of phosphorus to the sediment column, molar $C_{org} : P_{T}$ well below the Redfield ratio requires significant $C_{org}$ loss or a second delivery source of phosphorus to Thorntonia sediments.

Interpreted together, sedimentological observations and iron speciation data suggest that sediment within the southern Georgina Basin accumulated under anoxic, ferruginous conditions. This redox diagnosis is consistent with previous research documenting the propensity for anoxic, ferruginous conditions in subsurface water masses of late Neoproterozoic and Cambrian oceans (Canfield et al., 2008) driven by the relative fluxes of electron donors (organic carbon) and electron acceptors (reactive Fe, sulfate) into a basin (Johnston et al., 2010). If correct, the conclusion of an active iron redox cycle contemporaneous with the deposition of the Thorntonia Limestone and Arthur Creek Formation provides a second mechanism for augmented sedimentary phosphorus delivery—phosphorus adsorbed to particulate iron minerals.

The stoichiometries of delivery estimates and remineralization reactions indicate that the phosphorus content of the Arthur Creek Formation is easily accounted for by any combination of phosphorus associated with organic matter and/or iron oxide fluxes. However, the observed phosphorus content of the Thorntonia is difficult to reconcile with reasonable fluxes of either organic-bound or iron-bound phosphorus alone. Thus, we suggest that both sources were necessary to account for Thorntonia Limestone phosphatic carbonate deposition.
The discontinuous nature of phosphorite and phosphatic carbonate through Earth history speaks to discontinuous mechanisms of formation. We hypothesize that redox-mediated phosphorus delivery via the Fe-P shuttle, rather than a discontinuous organic carbon flux, provides the more intermittent mechanism for phosphorus delivery to the sediment column. That said, ferruginous bottom waters appear to have been widespread in Proterozoic oceans, whereas phosphatic carbonates are not. Thus, the episodic nature of phosphate deposition must additionally depend on the fate of phosphate after it enters the sediment column. Where the oxic-anoxic interface lies well within the water column, microbial reduction of ferric iron within the sediments will remobilize P, with a high probability of escape back to the water column. Where phosphate in solution is trapped by skeletons, however, or bound to decay-resistant materials such as chitinous exoskeletons, mineral phosphate may be reprecipitated in sediments. With this in mind, it would appear that delivery mechanisms, post-delivery fate within sediments, and evolution all contributed to the observed geological record of Cambrian phosphate accumulation.

ACKNOWLEDGMENTS

We thank the Northern Territory Geological Survey and Max Heckenberg and Jay Carter of the Alice Springs Core Library for generous access to core material. The Agouron Institute and the NASA Astrobiology Institute (MIT node) provided financial support. We thank Paul Myrow for discussions of sedimentology, Eric Morrow for assistance with data analysis, Greg Eischeid for technical support in the Harvard University Laboratory for Geochemical Oceanography, and David Fike and an anonymous reviewer for critical comments that helped to improve this paper.
REFERENCES CITED


Laurie, J.R., 2004a, Early Middle Cambrian trilobites from Pacific Oil & Gas Baldwin 1 well, southern Georgina Basin, Northern Territory: Memoirs of the Association of Australasian Palaeontologists v. 32, p. 127-204.


Southgate, P.N., 1988, A model for the development of phosphatic and calcareous 
lithofacies in the Middle Cambrian Thorntonia Limestone, northeast Georgina Basin, 
Australia: Australian Journal of Earth Sciences, v. 35, p. 111-130, doi: 
10.1080/08120098808729443.

to Middle Cambrian phosphogenesis, Georgina Basin, Australia: Journal of Australian 
Geology and Geophysics, v. 12, p. 119–144.

Strickland, J.D.H., and Parsons, T.R., 1972, A Practical Handbook of Seawater Analysis: 
Fish Research Board of Canada.

Swanson-Hysell, N.L, Rose, C.V., Calmet, C.C., Halverson, G.P., Hurtgen, M.T., and 
Maloof, A.C., 2010, Cryogenian glaciation and the onset of carbon-isotope decoupling: 

Trappe, J., 2001, A nomenclature system for granular phosphate rocks according to 
depositional texture: Sedimentary Geology, v. 145, p. 135–150, doi: 10.1016/S0037-
0738(01)00103-8.

Trefry, J.H., and Metz, S., 1989, Role of hydrothermal precipitates in the geochemical 

Trappe, J., 2001, A nomenclature system for granular phosphate rocks according to 
depositional texture: Sedimentary Geology, v. 145, p. 135–150, doi: 10.1016/S0037-
0738(01)00103-8.

Vine, J.D., and Tourtelot, E.B., 1970, Geochemistry of black shale deposits; a summary 

stratigraphy of the Centralia Superbasin, Australia: Precambrian Research, v. 73, p. 173-

and global correlation of Cambrian Series 2-Series 3 carbonate rocks in the Keping area 


EFTN.2.0.CO;2.


**Figure captions:**

**Figure 1:** (A) Areal extent of the constituent basins of the Neoproterozoic Centralian Superbasin. The black dot marks the drill locality for core NTGS 99/1 in the southern Georgina Basin. (B) Chronostratigraphy and lithostratigraphic nomenclature for the Northern Territory outcroppings of Cambrian strata within the southern Georgina Basin (modified from Dunster et al., 2007). The symbol “(?)” reflects uncertainties in correlating regional Australian trilobite Zones with International Cambrian System designations.

**Figure 2:** Lithofacies of the Thorntonia Limestone and Arthur Creek Formation in NTGS 99/1. (A) Sandy dolostone of the lower Thorntonia Limestone, just above the contact with the underlying Paleoproterozoic granite basement (~595.8 – 595.6 mcd). (B) General character of the mottled-to-stylonodular, dolomitic lower Thorntonia Limestone (584 – 580.5 mcd). (C) Characteristic meter to sub-meter scale lithologic alternations and color variation within limestone of the middle Thorntonia Limestone (577.7 – 571.4 mcd). (1) Denotes black and dark gray calcimudstone; (2) denotes lighter gray calcimudstone, wackestone and packstone; and (3) denotes limestone grainstone. Note the general up-package coarsening and lightening, often without cyclic or predictable variation. (D) Bioclastic grainstone to mudstone transition from 570.15 – 570.05 mcd (middle Thorntonia Limestone; all limestone). (E) Appearance of the vuggy, bioclastic dolomitic grainstone of the upper Thorntonia Limestone (left) and the overlying basal ‘hot shale’ of the lower Arthur Creek Formation (right). Contact at 554.7 mcd. (F) The laminated siliciclastic shale/siltstone and calcimudstone facies of the lower Arthur Creek Formation. (G) Light-gray early diagenetic nodule (calcimudstone) displacing dark-gray laminations within the lower Arthur Creek Formation at 532.8 – 532.65 mcd (arrows mark the exterior of the nodule). (H) General appearance of the interbedded siliciclastic mudstone/siltstone and calcimudstone (neomorphosed to microspar) facies of the lower Arthur Creek Formation above ~430 mcd.

**Figure 3:** Photomicrographs under plane-polarized light of authigenic apatite distribution within the middle Thorntonia Limestone. (A) A limestone packstone with apatite
replacement specifically targeting the interior of conical small shelly fossil elements at 570.35 mcd. (B) Wholesale matrix and grain phosphatization at of a limestone at 575.17 mcd. (C) Dispersed, allochthonous grains of authigenic apatite within a limestone at 560.69 mcd (see text for discussion of origin).

**Figure 4**: Lithology and stable isotope chemostratigraphy of the Thorntonia Limestone and lower Arthur Creek Formation within drill core NTGS 99/1. For all panels, data for the lower and middle/upper Thorntonia Limestone are plotted in open and solid blue circles, respectively, while data for the Arthur Creek Formation are plotted in solid red circles. (A) Generalized stratigraphic column depicting the lithology of the lower, middle, and upper Thorntonia Limestone and the lower Arthur Creek Formation. Lithologic abbreviations: Siliciclastics: slts = siltstone; Carbonates: mds = mudstone; wks = wackestone; pks = packstone; grn = grainstone. Vertical axis reflects meters core depth from the surface. (B) Carbonate carbon isotopic composition (relative to V-PDB). (C) Carbonate oxygen isotopic composition (relative to V-PDB). (D) Total organic carbon isotopic composition (symbol size scaled to wt.% total organic carbon (TOC)). (E) Cross-plot of carbonate carbon and carbonate oxygen isotopic composition. (F) Cross-plot of organic carbon and carbonate carbon isotopic composition.

**Figure 5**: Phosphorus and iron speciation geochemistry, molar C:P ratios, and correlations between P and other geochemical metrics within the Thorntonia Limestone and Arthur Creek Formation. (A) The weight percent of total phosphorus (filled green circles) and subtotal phosphorus (open green circles) for those samples whose PFe concentrations were not determined from P-speciation geochemistry. Weight percent total Fe (open red circles) from Fe-speciation geochemistry. Note the logarithmic scale to emphasize, in particular, the P content of the middle and upper Thorntonia Limestone. (B) The weight percents of operationally-defined phosphorus phases as determined by phosphorus-speciation geochemistry. Note the logarithmic scale. See text for discussion of the operationally-defined P phases. (C) The weight percents of iron phases as determined by iron-speciation geochemistry. Note the logarithmic scale. (D) The molar ratio of organic carbon to total phosphorus. Grey line intersects the axis at C:P = 106:1,
the canonical Redfield ratio. (E) Correlation between the weight percent phosphorus within individual samples as determined from ICP-AES versus that determined by the sequential extraction method (see Methods section). Slope of linear regression = 1.1; $R^2 = 0.88$. (F) Correlation between the zirconium to aluminum ratio (ppm/%) and the operationally-defined $P_{x1}$ phase (see text for discussion) determined from phosphorus speciation geochemistry. (G) Cross-plot of the weight percent of highly reactive iron species ($Fe_{HR}$; oxides, magnetite, pyrite, and iron carbonates) determined from iron-speciation geochemistry versus the weight percent of total phosphorus determined from phosphorous-speciation geochemistry.

**Figure 6:** Iron-speciation geochemistry. For all panels, data for the lower and middle/upper Thorntonia Limestone are plotted in open and solid blue circles, respectively, while data for the laminated facies and interbedded siliciclastic/carbonate mudstone facies of the Arthur Creek Formation are plotted in solid and open red circles, respectively. Data from the Arthur Creek ‘hot shale’ appear as solid red circles with a black outline. (A) A cross-plot of the weight percent total iron ($Fe_T$) versus the weight percent iron within highly reactive phases ($Fe_{HR}$; oxides, magnetite, pyrite, and iron carbonates). We plot slopes of 1 and 0.38 as a reference for comparing these carbonate data to previously published iron-speciation data, but we do not advocate interpreting carbonate data (blue circles) within the canonical siliciclastic framework. Slope of regressions (not plotted) reflect the percentage of the total iron residing in highly reactive phases (lower Thorntonia = 57%, $R^2$: 0.53; middle/upper Thorntonia = 89%, $R^2$: 0.95; laminated facies of the Arthur Creek = 53%, $R^2$: 0.44; interbedded siliciclastic shale / siltstone and carbonate mudstone facies of the Arthur Creek = 26%, $R^2$: 0.90). (B) A cross-plot of the weight percent highly reactive iron ($Fe_{HR}$) versus the weight percent iron within pyrite ($Fe_{py}$). We plot slopes of 1 and 0.8 for reference (see (a)). Slope of regressions (not plotted) reflect the percentage of the highly reactive iron residing within pyrite (lower Thorntonia = 17%, $R^2$: 0.07; middle/upper Thorntonia = 64%, $R^2$: 0.95; laminated facies of the Arthur Creek = 75%, $R^2$: 0.95; interbedded siliciclastic shale / siltstone and carbonate mudstone facies of the Arthur Creek = 30%, $R^2$: 0.50). We note that the linear regression for the ‘hot shale’ ($Fe_{py} = 0.8*(Fe_{HR})-0.2$) is the same for the
lower Arthur Creek laminated facies exclusive of the ‘hot shale’ data. (C) A cross-plot of
the weight percent highly reactive iron (FeHR) versus iron carbonate (Fe_carb). Slope of
regressions (not plotted) reflect the percentage of the highly reactive iron residing within
iron carbonate (lower Thorntonia = 82%, R^2: 0.62; middle/upper Thorntonia = 31%, R^2:
0.82; laminated facies of the Arthur Creek = 25%, R^2: 0.68; interbedded siliciclastic shale
/ siltstone and carbonate mudstone facies of the Arthur Creek = 52%, R^2: 0.73). We note
that the linear regression for the ‘hot shale’ (Fe_carb = 0.25*(FeHR)+0.15) is similar for the
lower Arthur Creek laminated facies exclusive of the ‘hot shale’ data (Fe_carb =
0.20*(FeHR)+0.15).

Figure 7: Assessing the potential contribution of organic-bound and iron-bound
phosphorus (P) to authigenic apatite precipitation. For the case of organic-bound P
delivery (left), the dashed boxes depict the median estimated weight percent organic
matter (wt.% \( \hat{C}_{org}^* \)) necessary to account for the measured wt.% sedimentary P based on
equation (1) with a Redfield ratio of 106C:1P. Dark grey boxes represent the median
wt.% total organic carbon (TOC) measured within samples. Light gray boxes represent
the corrected wt.% \( \hat{C}_{org}^* \) (see discussion leading to equation (9)). All values plotted to
scale. Organic carbon delivery can account for all of the P within the Arthur Creek
Formation. In contrast, the blank area within the dashed Thorntonia Limestone box
represents the amount of \( \hat{C}_{org}^* \) that would have to have been remineralized to account for
the observed sedimentary P content if it were sourced by organic-bound P alone.

For the case of iron-bound P delivery (right), the dashed boxes depict the median
measured wt.% P\(_T\) within samples while the dark grey boxes represent the estimated
delivery of iron-bound P (\( \hat{P}_{Fe}^* \)) as determined from equation (13) assuming a partition
coefficient for ferrihydrite and a seawater phosphate concentration of 5 \( \mu \text{m} \) (see text for
discussion). All values plotted to scale. In this regard, and under these assumptions, the
Fe-P delivery shuttle can account for all of the P within the Arthur Creek Formation. In
contrast, only by invoking Fe\(^{2+}\) loss from the sediment column and preferential capture of
Fe-bound P within authigenic phases, could the Fe-P shuttle have contributed more
substantially (> ~10%) to the phosphatic carbonate of the Thorntonia Limestone.
### Figure 1

![Image of a map showing geological formations and their locations.

#### Legend:

- **Narpa Group**
- **Shadow Group**

#### Cambrian:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Series 2</th>
<th>Series 3</th>
<th>Series 4</th>
<th>Series 5</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Guzhangian</td>
<td>Guzhangian</td>
<td>Guzhangian</td>
<td>Terreneuvian</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Stage 1</td>
<td>Stage 2</td>
<td>Stage 2</td>
<td>Stage 3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Stage 3</td>
<td>Stage 4</td>
<td>Stage 5</td>
<td>Stage 6</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Key:**
- **Arrinerrunga Formation**
- **Steamboat Sandstone**
- **Arthur Creek Formation**
- **Thoronia Limestone**
- **Red Heart Dolostone**
- **Mount Baldwin Formation**
- **Adam Shale**

[Click here to download Figure. NTGS Fig 1.pdf]
Core wells ascend from bottom left to upper right.
Figure 4

Click here to download Figure: NTGS Fig 4.pdf
Figure 5
Click here to download Figure: NTGS Fig 5.pdf
Organic-bound P delivery

middle/upper Thorntonia Limestone

Arthur Creek Formation

18.6 wt.% $C_{org}$

Iron-bound P delivery

middle/upper Thorntonia Limestone

Arthur Creek Formation

Fe$^{3+}$ loss, P capture

0.98 wt.% $P_T$

0.03 wt.% $P_T$

Corg remineralization

1.1 wt.% $C_{org}$
Supplementary Information

Click here to download Supplemental file: Supplementary Information for Revision 2.pdf
Supplementary Figure 2
Click here to download Supplemental file: NTGS Fig S2.pdf