Ciudad Juárez Hope: Medellín’s Case as a Pathway for Social Transformation

The Harvard community has made this article openly available. Please share how this access benefits you. Your story matters.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Citable link</th>
<th><a href="http://nrs.harvard.edu/urn-3:HUL.InstRepos:37945136">http://nrs.harvard.edu/urn-3:HUL.InstRepos:37945136</a></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Terms of Use</td>
<td>This article was downloaded from Harvard University’s DASH repository, and is made available under the terms and conditions applicable to Other Posted Material, as set forth at <a href="http://nrs.harvard.edu/urn-3:HUL.InstRepos:dashboard.current.terms-of-use#LAA">http://nrs.harvard.edu/urn-3:HUL.InstRepos:dashboard.current.terms-of-use#LAA</a></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
“Ciudad Juárez Hope: Medellín’s Case as a Pathway for Social Transformation”

Lina Tramelli Melo

A Thesis in the Field of Government
for the Degree of Master of Liberal Arts in Extension Studies

Harvard University
May 2018
Abstract

This thesis examines the outcomes of a series of social, cultural and educational policies and strategies that have been developed in Medellín, Colombia to recover the city from drug cartels, from 2001 to the present day in order to determine whether one or more of these successful processes could be applied in the case of Ciudad Juárez, Mexico and its current dealings with the effects of drug cartels.

To achieve these, this research assesses the policies applied in Medellín and determines the effects they had on its society.

Additionally, this thesis work also evaluates the path that Medellín has taken as it moves toward a more innovative and intelligent city. Likewise, it identifies the elements that favored the city’s success in the implementation of the government's policies and strategies to bring back the order and stability and to attenuate the violence caused by drug cartels.

To address the posited hypothesis, I analyzed the processes established to solve the central social problems caused by the presence of drug cartels in Medellín.

The research done confirmed that the social urbanism and cultural policies developed in Medellín affected the social and cultural dynamics and promoted integration, transparency, a sense of belonging, participation and democratization in the community.

This facilitated the improvement of local safety and enabled the resolution of problems related to violence caused by drug cartels.

Similarly, the research results indicate that the policies developed in Medellín from the beginning of the new century, affected the social relations between its inhabitants, and had a positive effect in the social transformation process.
My research found that taking into account the similarities between Medellín and Ciudad Juárez, it is possible to apply some of the policies developed in Medellín in order to solve the social problems in Ciudad Juárez.
Dedication

To my parents, Giuseppe and Mercedes.

Thank you for your endless support and for being always there for me.

You will always be my source of inspiration.

I love you.

Lina.
Acknowledgments

I would like to express my gratitude to my research advisor, Dr. Donald Ostrowski, for adding valuable guidance during my time at Harvard. As well, for his dedication, patience and support, for being always ready to collaborate and for guiding me through the learning process of this master thesis.

I want to also thank my thesis director, Professor Filipe Campante, for agreeing to direct my thesis, for reviewing it, and for helping me to organize my ideas and putting pieces together. Also, for his advice, for sharing his knowledge with me and for allowing me to find the bridge that justified my thesis’ hypothesis and that made my arguments more solid.

I am also very grateful to my loved ones, who are my inspiration and the engine of my life, for their unlimited confidence in my strength, for having supported me throughout this process and for helping me maintain the harmony necessary to achieve this. I am very fortunate to have them in my life.

To my family, friends and others who shared their support and their kindness in one way or another during this process, thank you.

The completion of this thesis could not have been possible without the assistance of you all.
# Table of Contents

Dedication .................................................................................. v

Acknowledgments ...................................................................... vi

List of Tables ........................................................................... ix

List of Figures ........................................................................... x

List of Acronyms ....................................................................... xi

Definition of Terms ................................................................... xii

I. Introduction to Research ...................................................... 1
   Research Problem ................................................................. 2
   Research Objectives and Questions ....................................... 4
   Research Proposition ............................................................. 5
   Significance of the Research ................................................ 6

II. Conceptual Framework .......................................................... 7

III. Research Methodology, Analyses, and Limitations ................. 13
   Methodology: Approach and Analyses ................................. 13
   Empirical Analysis ............................................................... 13
   Procedure ............................................................................ 14
   Research Limitations ............................................................ 16

IV. Background: Origins, Drug Cartels and Violence .................... 18
   Medellín .............................................................................. 21
   Ciudad Juárez ...................................................................... 33

V. Medellín’s Strategic Plans Analysis ....................................... 39
VI. Policy Analysis and Results ........................................55

   Explanation of the Results: How Did the Policies Work? ......56

VII. Discussion and Recommendations ..................................60

   How Does One Translate Medellín into Ciudad Juárez?........60

   Solutions That Could Be Applied in Ciudad Juarez .......... 64

VIII. Research Findings..........................................................68

Bibliography ........................................................................71
List of Tables

Table 1. Murders in Medellín (1965-2011) ......................................................... 7
Table 2. Murders in Medellín (1987-2008) ......................................................... 24
Table 3. Homicides in Colombia (2002-2015) ................................................... 26
Table 4. Coca and eradication in Colombia (1994-2015) ................................. 27
Table 5. Murders and armed conflicts in Medellín (1985-2014) .................... 28
Table 6. Murders in Medellín (1975-2002) ......................................................... 29
Table 7. Records of murders in Mexico’s cities ................................................. 34
List of Figures

Figure 1. Map of Medellín ................................................................. 21
Figure 2. Division of Medellín in neighborhoods and comunas ................ 22
Figure 3. Attacks made by Medellín Cartel in 1989.................................. 25
Figure 4. Map of Ciudad Juárez............................................................ 33
Figure 5. Ciudad Juárez mourns its dead people..................................... 35
Figure 6. Overcome from violence........................................................ 40
Figure 7. Garbage accumulation in Villa del Socorro.............................. 42
Figure 8. Transformation of the dump in a public garden........................ 42
Figure 9. Library España and Metro Cable built in a marginal neighborhood... 45
Figure 10. Escalators in Comuna 13..................................................... 46
Figure 11. More than 2,224 families used to live among 1.5 millions tons of waste....... 47
Figure 12. Transformation of Moravia’s neighborhood into an urban garden .......... 47
Figure 13. Graffiti made by the community in a wall in Comuna 13.............. 48
Figure 14. Metro in Medellín................................................................. 50
Figure 15. Graffiti on a public wall in Comuna 13.................................... 51
Figure 16. Fire in Comuna 13 caused by the battle between criminals........... 51
Figure 17. Comuna 13 After the creation of social urbanism policies ............. 52
Figure 18. Metro Cable........................................................................ 53
List of Acronyms

BACRIM (Bandas Criminales Emergentes): criminal bands, involved in drug trafficking that emerged in Colombia following paramilitary demobilization.¹

DEA: US Drug Enforcement Administration

DoD: US Department of Defense

HIDTA: High-Intensity Drug Trafficking Areas

ONDCP: Office of National Drug Control Policy

PUI (Integral Urban Project): is an instrument of urban intervention that includes the dimensions of the physical, the social and the institutional, in order to solve specific problems on a defined territory by placing all the tools of development simultaneously according to the area of intervention.²

USBP: US Border Patrol

UVA (Unidades de vida articulada/Units of articulated life): are part of a new city project invented in Medellín where the local government is articulated with the community in order to improve their neighborhoods. It seeks to adapt and build public spaces to strengthen the citizen’s encounter around life and equity, through culture, recreation, and most important, community participation.³


Definition of Terms

*Armed clientelism:* the process of increasing political influence at the local level through coercion and violence.\(^4\)

*Bloque de Búsqueda (Search Block):* a combined police-army-marine anti-narcotics force, organized by the Colombian government, which had received training from the U.S. in order to attack the powerful drug cartels in Colombia.\(^5\)

*Capo (Drug Lord):* the highest position within a drug cartel. He is responsible for the business that is, supervising, delegating functions and making alliances, and planning high-profile executions.

*Collection Offices (Oficinas de cobro):* the place from which trafficking organizations exercise discipline on employees and competitors.\(^6\)

*The Colombian “Cell System”:* the methods the Colombians had used successfully for so long based on eliminating contact between cartel workers except between those who actually function as a distribution team.\(^7\)

*Drug Cartels:* are global criminal organizations, based in developing countries whose purpose is to provide drugs, especially to the countries of the first world, through smuggling. These organizations have a pyramidal structure to coordinate the production

---

\(^4\) Henderson, *Colombia’s Narcotics Nightmare*, 193.

\(^5\) Ronald Chepesiuk, *The Bullet or the Bribe: Taking Down Colombia’s Cali Drug Cartel* (Westport, CT: Praeger, 2003), 141.

\(^6\) Henderson, *Colombia’s Narcotics Nightmare*, 195.

\(^7\) Henderson, *Colombia’s Narcotics Nightmare*, 193.
and distribution of the drug, in this case cocaine. In order to maximize economic benefits, the cartel tries to control prices and eliminate competition.

*Caserío*: hamlet, or group of houses located in the countryside.\(^8\)

*Cocaine Cowboys*: nickname earned by the most cold-blooded, ruthlessness and violent Colombian traffickers.\(^9\)

*Comuna*: slums in Medellín.

*Coyotes*: clandestine smugglers who facilitate the entry of drugs and the migration of people to the United States across the Mexican border. In recent years, coyotes have been taxed by drug cartels that have entered the smuggling network for letting people pass through their controlled territory.

*Desechables* (literally meaning garbage or waste): beggars, homeless, drug addicts who were seen as profiteers and unproductive folks – threats to “progress” and property.\(^10\)

*Desplazados*: people who are forced to flee their homes due to violence and thus become internally displaced within their own country of Colombia.\(^11\)

*Guaridas*: safe houses owned by cartels where their members hide and kidnapping victims are held and tortured.\(^12\)

---

\(^8\) Henderson, *Colombia’s Narcotics Nightmare*, 193.

\(^9\) Henderson, *Colombia’s Narcotics Nightmare*, 34.


\(^12\) Sylvia Longmire, *Cartel: The Coming Invasion of Mexico’s Drug War* (New York: Palgrave Macmillan, 2011), 32.
Juntas de Acción Comunal (Community Action Council): is a form of association and organization of people who live in the same physical environment.\textsuperscript{13}

\textit{Law of Metal}: accept a bribe or be shot. Also known as \textit{plata o plomo} (money or the bullet),\textsuperscript{14} famous form of negotiation used by Pablo Escobar.

\textit{Limpieza social}: social cleansing (low tolerance for desechables) perpetrated by corrupt public forces, vigilantes, neighborhood gangs, or guerrillas militias.\textsuperscript{15}

\textit{Mulas}: individuals who are used for the smuggling and delivery of narcotics in other countries. Often carry the drug to the United States in their stomachs or body cavities.

\textit{Narco}: a drug trafficker or a dealer that deals with narcotics.

\textit{Narco-política}: influence of drug lords decisions in local and national politics.

\textit{Narco-terrorism}: acts of extreme violence, such as kidnapping, intimidation, torture, car bombs, and murder, that drug cartels perpetrate in the society to protect drug routes to further their agendas or as a reaction to hostile competition or in order to create fear to achieve their goals.

\textit{Pescas milagrosas} (miraculous fishing trips): practice of stopping Colombians at surprise roadblocks and kidnapping for ransom those judged to be the most affluent.\textsuperscript{16}

\textit{Plazas}: Strategic territory controlled by a specific drug cartel. In general, plazas are hot spots due to disputes between cartels to take control over that location for drug trafficking.


\textsuperscript{14} Henderson, \textit{Colombia’s Narcotics Nightmare}, 194.

\textsuperscript{15} Martin, “Proximity, Crime, Politics and Design,” 58.

\textsuperscript{16} Henderson, \textit{Colombia’s Narcotics Nightmare}, 195.
Seguridad Democrática (Democratic Security): it is a policy implemented by Colombia’s former president Álvaro Uribe to improve national security by combating violence and crime in order to make Colombian people safe.\footnote{Henderson, Colombia’s Narcotics Nightmare, 155.}

*Sicario* (Hitman): a quite professional and well-trained person hired specifically to carry out a murder.\footnote{Henderson, Colombia’s Narcotics Nightmare, 195.}

*Social recovery*: strong anti-narcotic strategy. The stated goal of this action is to increase governability, legitimacy, credibility, and citizens’ confidence in the State, and in themselves as a community.\footnote{Henderson, Colombia’s Narcotics Nightmare, 175.}

*Sujetos incómodos* (uncomfortable subjects): people who have information about drug traffickers and who they do not want to spread. They are usually “disappeared” by the cartels.

*Vacuna*: Protection money paid by Colombian citizens as insurance against kidnapping or other crimes in order to help finance the criminal organization.
Chapter I.
Introduction to Research

The drug trafficking phenomenon as a form of organized crime has been built on social, political and economic dimensions, and every time, it acquires greater influence in the economic life of nations, giving rise to a true “drug economy.” \(^{20}\)

In countries such as Colombia and México where many regions are isolated and the state is weak and corrupt and the presence of the national government in many areas is weak and not effective enough to fight the private drug trafficking armies, drug trafficking organizations (Cartels), threaten state authorities and establish control structures that alter the social order in their cities and end up regulating society. These countries’ most disadvantaged social and economic sectors use violence as a means of domination. Violence itself became an opportunity for economic advancement, social recognition and power gain.

The government’s delay in addressing safety issues in cities, and the state’s inability to control the corruption from within, fueled a widespread corruption of the state's institutions and allowed the impunity of authorities and therefore, created an atmosphere of mistrust amongst citizens\(^{21}\). Due to these factors, Drug Cartels were accepted by many sectors of society as a mean to allow for social inclusion and a way of social demands


\(^{21}\) Gustavo Duncan, *Más que plata o plomo: el poder político del narcotráfico en Colombia y México* (Debate, Bogotá, Colombia, 2014), 78.
between peripheral and marginal areas.\textsuperscript{22} Especially in peripheral societies where people are excluded from the markets, the enormous amount of capital and resources introduced by the Drug Cartels increased their participation in the economy. As a result, the local economies were overtaken to the point that Drug Cartels transformed the distribution of wealth, the social hierarchies and the social order as a whole.

Research Problem

Recently, México has been shocked by a phenomenon of violence caused by the presence of drug cartels. This flourishing of violence that is plaguing México is evocative of the bloodbath that Colombia faced three decades ago. At that time, many Colombians, including politicians, journalists and police officers were assassinated, kidnapped or intimidated by the most powerful and fearsome drug-trafficking organizations the world has ever seen: the Cali and Medellín cartels.\textsuperscript{23}

Nowadays, it is Mexico that is surrounded by the same rising violence and it is fighting against authoritarian drug cartels, such as the Juárez, Sinaloa, and Gulf cartels.

As a result of the intense violence related to drug cartels, two cities in particular, one Mexican and one Colombian, Ciudad Juárez and Medellín, became almost unlivable and have faced destruction and rampant murders from direct coercion and physical threats to the erosion of the quality of life and livelihood opportunities.\textsuperscript{24} In a similar way in both

\textsuperscript{22} Duncan, \textit{Más que plata o plomo}, 15.


cities, the presence of drug cartels in involved changes in power relations and social order resulted in increasing the levels of corruption, crime and violence. This wave of violence has resulted, predominantly because of the war between cartels, but also due to government strategies and initiatives that intended to punish drug cartels and fight drug trafficking and transnational crime such as the “War on Drugs” in Colombia, which included the Merida Initiative and the Plan Colombia. These strategies focused on security increase, reduction of criminality, regulation of the social system, the strengthening of political and social institutions, poverty reduction and the promotion of economic growth. However, to make sure these strategies were effective, the Mérida Initiative and the Plan Colombia also proposed and implemented a military plan.

Medellín and Ciudad Juárez are characterized by being strategically located for the distribution and trade of narcotics. Their large size made it attractive to entrepreneurs in the illegal drug business because the larger territory makes their detection just that much more difficult and bribery, often an intrinsic part of illegal enterprise, is a cheaper and less risky process altogether.25

On the one hand, Ciudad Juárez is located in México, on the border with United States. After being catalogued by the CBP as a HIDTA, this city is considered the world capital of crime, the epicenter of Mexican drug trafficking and one of the most dangerous cities of México since 2008, with more of 3000 annual murders. This fact has resulted, predominantly because drug cartels have determined that the narrow strip of desert that

---

separates this border city from El Paso, Texas, is a big market, and thus they want to control these corridors\textsuperscript{26} in order to smuggle drugs.

On the other hand, Medellín is located in Colombia, well situated as a center of its early cocaine trade. During the 1980s, the Medellín cartel kept the city under a reign of terror where intimidation and violence were effective. As a result, Medellín was considered by the DEA as the murder capital and the most violent city in the world. Two decades later, the city lived a time of transformations by a succession of state interventions. It went from being the most violent city to the most innovative city in Latin America. Medellín is a city where violence was a part of everyday life, and it has been transformed by recognizing its problems and facing them with a collective construction, this has changed the way communities and state interact in making this city a project of inclusion, equity and a profound transformation from the public.\textsuperscript{27}

Research Objectives and Questions

This thesis aims to perform an individual and comparative analysis of the role that drug cartels have played in Medellín since the early 1990s, and recently in Ciudad Juárez, and the cartels’ impact in both cities’ societies. Likewise, it will concentrate on the factors that made Medellín’s transformation into an innovative city possible, after being consumed by the violence of the drug cartels 30 years ago.


The fundamental question to be answered by this thesis is: Can Medellín’s case be used as an example of a potential pathway for social transformation in Ciudad Juárez?

In order to answer this question, this thesis seeks to examine the following research questions:

a. How did the drug cartels work in Medellín in the early 1990s, and how are they working now in Ciudad Juárez?

b. What is the role of Drug Cartels in both cities?

c. What are the consequences (influence) that drug cartels left in Medellín’s society?

d. What is the influence of drug cartels in Ciudad Juárez’ society?

Research Proposition

Taking into account the similarities and differences between these two countries, which historically have suffered extensively from the drug trade\(^{28}\), Colombia and México, specifically between the plights that Medellín and Ciudad Juárez faced due to drug cartels. I hypothesize that it is feasible to use Medellín’s case as an example for social reconstruction and social transformation in Ciudad Juárez. To test my hypothesis, I will analyze governmental reports and documents, conduct interviews, and do an extensive literature review from both, electronic and printed sources, in order to collect data to give a wide background on the drug cartels and give a frame of reference. Likewise, I will

provide statistics and fundamental background on both cities’ situations for an efficient evaluation of the topic.

Significance of the Research

This thesis’ main challenge is to demonstrate that Ciudad Juárez can significantly learn from Medellín's experiences so to end the violence generated by the drug cartels, and thus demonstrate that the Medellín’s case can be applied in other hot-spot cities that experience violence and transform societies after being run by drug cartels. Given this background, this thesis is relevant to the fields of Government, Social and Cultural Studies, especially in the matters related to Latin America as it seeks to find a way in which success can be achieved and thus, contribute in defeating the violence that drug cartels generate, beyond México and Colombia.

Additionally, this research is significant for different audiences. First, for governmental organizations, as it helps them to understand the problems of their cities, and therefore it helps in the development of better policies to solve them. Besides, it will improve the way local governments relate to the inhabitants of their cities. Second, for the communities of these cities, because by refining local politics and transforming and rebuilding their cities, they will improve their living conditions and lives without fear of drug cartels’ violence. Lastly, this publication can contribute to the scholarly research since it can serve as a guide to understand which factors are needed to apply the Medellín’s in other cities in order to rebuild and transform their societies after being devastated by the presence of drug cartels and by the violence they caused.
Chapter II.
Conceptual Framework

In the decade of the 1990s Medellín was under a reign of terror as a result of the atrocities committed by the Medellín cartel. As an outcome, violence had become a daily occurrence throughout its society and the city became almost unlivable.

Table 1. Murders in Medellín (1965-2011)

As a consequence of the presence of the Medellín cartel, insecurity and fear, manifested in various forms, emerged and settled dramatically in Medellín. The existence of drug trafficking with its dynamics and armed structures, and the consolidation of criminal gangs that focused their actions under violent logics of appropriation of the
territory, forced protection through extortion and vacunas,\textsuperscript{29} caused social disintegration in Medellín and turned it into the world’s most violent city. As an effect, citizens became survivors but not participants of society.\textsuperscript{30}

One of the biggest problems that the city faced was the presence of young people who were excluded from society. The lack of opportunities, their antisocial behavior and a well-rooted culture of the desire to opt for an ostentatious life with little effort (in addition to all the aesthetic imaginary brought by this drug trafficking culture)\textsuperscript{31} lead them to find a way out of the circle of inequality by participating in illegal groups that provided them with means of subsistence and social status.

In other words, individuals who differ in their earnings abilities are marginalized or excluded from the benefits and society itself, and choose between work and crime taking the probability and consequences of punishment into account\textsuperscript{32}, and become prey easy of criminal organizations that convince them that there is only one certain future, either


\textsuperscript{30}“In 1991, because of violent conflicts between these different violent non-state groups and between them and state actors, Medellín was portrayed as the “most dangerous city in the world” with over 6500 homicides that year. Medellín’s homicide rate (381 per 100,000) was four times the national homicide rate of Colombia (90 per 100,000) and almost 40 times the United Nations definition of epidemic violence of 10 per 100,000.,” Kate Maclean, “The ‘Medellin Miracle’: The Politics of Crisis, Elites and Coalitions,” Birkbeck College, University of London 2014. Accessed November 21, 2017. http://publications.dlprog.org/The%20Medellin%20Miracle.pdf, 33.

\textsuperscript{31}Diego Corrales, La Sistematización de Experiencias Gubernamentales como Herramienta de Evaluación de Políticas Públicas para la Rendición de Cuentas a la Ciudadanía. Caso Medellín, la Ciudad que pasó de ser la más Violenta del Mundo a la más Innovadora (Tesina: Universidad Internacional de Andalucía, 2017), 52.

become a narco or die. These young people were at risk of participating in criminal activities. It is clear that if they wanted to join the illegal business, the characteristics of a city like Medellín allowed them to find the way to do it. What it means is that giving an aggregate relationship between the probability of punishment and the level of crime and between the number of criminals and the number punished, those young people who from very early on incur problems with legality and participate in relatively serious crimes, by comparing the benefits and costs of crime with those of alternative activities, have a high possibility of persisting in these activities unless a focused, intensive and integral intervention is made, and these interventions are responsibility of the local government.

Then, it is possible to break the vicious circle generated by violence in Medellín, a city that has been hit the hardest by the effects of drug trafficking and violence and that recently was characterized by social decomposition and exclusion, deterioration of public spaces, high crime rates, chaos, and degradation of civic culture?

The research done confirmed that it is possible to break it and replace it by a virtuous circle fueled by trust, transparency and social inclusion. The success on overcoming violence and crime is about a change of skin with the awakening of civil society.

It has been said that the only way to fight criminals and mitigate the effects that they bring to societies is through a big intervention that requires guns and a national

---


35 Martin, Medellín, tragedia y resurrección, 515.

army. Paradoxically, war feeds war and produces a substantial strengthening of criminal force.\(^{37}\) Thus, what was implemented in Medellín in order to alleviate the pain that violence caused in its inhabitants?

In Medellín there was a change in the way to make policy. There prevailed topics like mobility, social integration, democratization, transparency in application of policies, reduction of poverty, of social inequalities, violence, and corruption. Further, the policies prioritized themes like respect for difference and human rights, youth participation, and ethics for democracy. Added to these, a pedagogic strategy for the formation of young citizens was developed based on the message that overcoming violence implied in daily life a construction of individual ethics and social responsibility.\(^{38}\) In the same way, components of coexistence dynamization in spaces of youth socialization, through soccer, fair play were promoted.\(^{39}\) In response to the violence, there was also a neighborhood cultural production, particularly from groups and artistic and theater corporations.

The solution to isolate the problem was to create public spaces where individuals feel safe and included. These spaces resisted the silence because its inhabitants believed that they could change the destiny that they felt was not for them. In fact, before the restoration of the public space, it was the dumping ground for bodies from different battles fought in the area.\(^{40}\)

\(^{37}\) Reveles,. “El Cártel Incómodo,” 222.

\(^{38}\) Martin, Medellín, tragedia y resurrección, 283.

\(^{39}\) Martin, Medellín, tragedia y resurrección, 284.

\(^{40}\) Martin, Medellín, tragedia y resurrección, 265.
For instance, different initiatives arose that counterbalanced the options of violence and illegality, especially for the young people of the city, who found new opportunities in this type of space.\(^\text{41}\) This way, the return of the youth to criminal activities decreased and the cycle of crimes and violence related with drugs was broken. Likewise, new jobs were created so they will be part of the society and would not become an easy prey of criminal organizations. Additionally, it was important to develop policies that helped to break with the culture that had been forged around the figure of easy money, excesses and above all, contempt for life. Narco-aesthetics and social referents such as Pablo Escobar detracted from the legitimacy of the State and its institutions, since a large part of the population wanted to identify with these symbols, even though they were part of an illegal framework.\(^\text{42}\)

Finally, it was relevant to promote a citizen culture founded on shared values “such as solidarity, respect for life to prevent illegality and violence.... Also it is important to increase governability, legitimacy, credibility, and citizens’ confidence in the State, and in themselves as a community,”\(^\text{43}\) and to strengthen cooperation between state and society and cooperation within the community.\(^\text{44}\)

To sum up, the efforts of social urbanism to re-engage citizens and promote references to habitability for common sense had a positive outcome in Medellín, a city that ceased to be the emblem of violence and drug trafficking to be an image of an innovative

\(^\text{41}\) Alcaldía de Medellín, “Medellín: Transformación de una ciudad,” 42.

\(^\text{42}\) Alcaldía de Medellín, “Medellín: Transformación de una ciudad,” 42.

\(^\text{43}\) Henderson, Colombia’s Narcotics Nightmare, 175.

\(^\text{44}\) Martin, Medellín, tragedia y resurrección, 265.
city. To illustrate, the process of transformation that Medellín has lived through in recent years demonstrates that making such a change is not an insurmountable utopia but an achievable work agenda based on strategic vision, shared effort and management capacity.\textsuperscript{45}

\textsuperscript{45} Alcaldía de Medellín, “Medellín: Transformación de una ciudad,” 19.
Research Methodology, Analysis and Limitations

The purpose of my research is to define if the policies applied in Medellín to transform the city and its society, can be applied in Ciudad Juárez in order to reconstruct it, to weaken drug cartels and to stop the violence they caused in this city. With the goal of establishing if the Medellín model can be implemented in Ciudad Juárez, I found it essential to take into account contextual factors of both cities, analyze the policies executed in Medellín and learn from its lessons and identify the common causes that allowed these cities to legitimize drug cartels.

Methodology Approach

To achieve the objective of this research, the actors that I will observe to develop my research are the following: the local government of Medellín and Ciudad Juárez, the community of both cities and the drug cartels.

Empirical Analysis

To establish which factors of the policies applied in Medellín were efficient to transform and rebuild the city, I developed a qualitative case study of Medellín and then, to answer the main question of my research – Can Medellín’s case be used as an example of a potential pathway for social transformation in Ciudad Juárez? – I elaborated a comparative analysis of this city and Ciudad Juárez in the impact of drug cartels on their societies and the consequences they brought to these cities. In order to acquire a vision of the process of social transformation that took place in Medellín, and to collect indicators
that established the effects of social policies in Medellín, I analyzed data from primary and secondary sources. As well, based on a political aspect, I examined historical literature, research reports and specialized bibliography.

Procedure

This study is executed in five parts. First, I provide the reader with an overview of the background on drug cartels in Medellín and its legitimation. Additionally, I point out the factors that led to urban violence in the city and their effects on society. In order to present these factors, I took into account three periods of time that gave characteristics to urban violence. First, between 1990 and 1993, the violence mainly came from the confrontation between the government and drug cartels. It was the moment when drug cartels where legitimize and became really powerful using terrorist tactics to press the government to stop them from punishing. Second, the period between 1994 and 1998, after the death of Pablo Escobar followed by the disintegration of a solid hierarchy, sicarios, who killed by economic demands and in some cases by honor, became the predominant illegal actors. Thus, new disputes over the control and administration of spaces arose. Third, the period between 1999 and 2002 where new actors appeared trying to impose its rules of game and interests: the guerrilla and paramilitaries (self-defense groups). At this point, political violence begins to be more effective with clashes between urban militias and self-defense armies, without losing sight of the territorial approach that pointed to the development of the urban conflict. Further, I discuss the history of unlawful activity and cartels in Ciudad Juárez and how corruption generated the approval of drug cartels in the
city. Everything mentioned above by making an extensive review of the literature on this subject from 1980 to the present.

In the second part, I expose the projects and analyze the policies applied in Medellín since the 1990s, which allowed its reconstruction and made it a safe and prosperous city and I highlight the changes that this city experienced. Likewise, I show how successful these projects were in the reconstruction of Medellín, from a political and institutional level, and in the weakening of drug cartels. To achieve these, I reviewed available reports and documents and I got on to interview government officials who helped create the projects, set them up and build a better city.

Third, I evaluated the policies that have allowed the social transformation of Medellín, analyzed the possible effects and results that these interventions generated, and presented their level of social acceptance. In order to get comprehensive information, this part of the data collection involved personal interviews with some inhabitants of Medellín and the conduct of surveys. So as to choose the inhabitants that I interviewed, I got on to community leaders, NGO’s and other social organization in contemplation of determine which is the vulnerable population, where are they located, what are the social problems. Then I performed a mapping of the population to determine the sample for my research.

In the fourth part, I made a comparative analysis of Medellín and Ciudad Juárez, specifying their similarities and differences. Additionally, I discussed which of the factors that allowed the successful implementation of these projects in Medellín can be found in Ciudad Juárez to determine if it is possible to use the case of Medellín as an example of reconstruction and social transformation in Ciudad Juárez. Based upon the obtained results, I elaborated a set of recommendations on what Ciudad Juárez can learn from Medellín’s
case to perform policy solutions and develop a new design that could be apply in this city in order to diminish the power that drug cartels have and stop the violence.

At last, I conclude with some final reflections on the importance for Ciudad Juárez of taking into account the recommendations of Medellín, a city that has been hit by the violence of the drug cartels and passed through its same situation. Hence, it is important to consider its lessons, and thus, learn from its mistakes and experiences to solve its current problems and to avoid futures troubles.

Research Limitations

The current research only evaluated documents from 1980 to the present. While there are many books on drug cartels, I focused only on those who have information about the influence of these in Medellín and in Ciudad Juárez. Likewise, this research took into account only drug cartels whose business is the cocaine trade. Due to the differences that can be found between the two cities, to validate the results obtained in my research, I analyzed the similarities and differences between their political regimes, the level of local security, the implications of drug cartels in society, and its relationship with the United States in terms of the production and trade of cocaine. Furthermore, it is important to emphasize that I hypothesized that it is feasible to Medellín’s case as an example for social reconstruction and transformation because I considered that Medellín’s history of drug cartels is repeated in Ciudad Juárez.
Regarding the sources that I analyzed to test my hypothesis, the interviews may provide indirect information in a designated place rather than the natural field setting.\footnote{John W. Creswell, \textit{Research Design: Qualitative, Quantitative, and Mixed Methods Approaches}, 3rd ed. (Los Angeles: Sage Publications, 2009), 179.}

Additionally, the responses may be biased due to my presence as researcher that may be disruptive and affect response. Further, the size of the sample may be small and it may not contribute to enhance the reliability of the research.

Although I attempted to review many of the available ways to get information, this was not always possible because of external limitations. The major external limitation of this thesis is that it requires searching for information in dangerous places that also are difficult to access and I was not able to travel to Ciudad Juárez. A second external limitation is that the documents and reports may not be accurate or authentic. Last, there may be incomplete materials and protected information unavailable to public or private access.\footnote{Creswell, \textit{Research Design}, 180.} For these reasons, I did not include in my research private documents, just public documents that are easy to access.
Chapter IV.

Background: Origins, Drug Cartels and Violence

México, has recently not only replaced Colombia in the business of drug trafficking, but entered in a spiral of violence similar to that one faced by Colombia 30 years ago. Back then, Colombia was terrified by the Cocaine Cowboys, the cruelest and most cold-blooded traffickers from the Cali and Medellín cartels\textsuperscript{48} that played an important role in the political, economic, and social sphere, establishing control structures that altered the social order and increased the levels of violence in a country where private interests have come to prevail over public welfare.

At the present time, it is México the one that has found itself fighting the same war against drug trafficking and experiencing a climate of violence of such magnitude, caused by authoritarian drug cartels such as the Juárez, Sinaloa, and Gulf cartels who use subversion, penetration, and corruption of state institutions; including police, prosecutors and even the military in conjunction with extreme violence to control the drug trade.\textsuperscript{49} Additionally, over the last decade, as a result of pre-existing corruption, the inability of

\textsuperscript{48} Pablo Escobar’s Medellín Cartel is largely seen as responsible for the astonishing increase in violence at this time. This way, homicides in Medellín have far exceeded the national rate. The city-specific rise started in the 1980s and peaked in the early 1990s. To put this in perspective, the 2012 homicide rate per 100,000 per year in Baltimore, Maryland (considered one of the most violent in the US) was 35 Maclean, “The ‘Medellín Miracle’,” 8).

weak law enforcement institutions to counter them, and the demand for illegal drugs in the United States, Mexican drug cartels have acquired unprecedented power to corrupt and intimidate government officials and civilians.\textsuperscript{50} Particularly, two cities were filled with fear and distrust: Medellín in Colombia and Ciudad Juárez in Mexico.

The intense violence generated by the war between and within cartels, was also directed against a wide variety of targets such as government officials and miscellaneous politicians,\textsuperscript{51} law enforcement agents, rival cartel members, low-level drug dealers, prominent businessmen, witnesses, and informants.\textsuperscript{52} These confrontations increased the perception in society of lawlessness and absence of the state. While there have been many murders of innocent civilians, these killings do not seem to have been motivated by an ideological, or religious cause. Moreover, most of the violence has been selective and not designed to kill indiscriminately. There was clearly an element of game playing in these statements, with several organizations seeking to exonerate themselves while implicating major rivals. Only in few occasions, criminal organizations carried out terrorist campaigns, such the indiscriminate killing of innocent people for political purposes.\textsuperscript{53} Drug cartels are not typical criminals, but they are organizations that used ties of blood, marriage, and fictional kinship to create a tight knit group adverse to law enforcement. Moreover, they

\begin{flushright}
\textsuperscript{50} Simser, “Plata o plomo,” 270.
\end{flushright}

\begin{flushright}
\textsuperscript{51} The Secretary of Justice of Colombia and the most likely candidate to win the presidency of Colombia, were killed by the Medellín Cartel in 1984 and 1989, respectively.
\end{flushright}

\begin{flushright}
\textsuperscript{52} Longmire, Cartel: The Coming Invasion of Mexico’s Drug Wars, 20.
\end{flushright}

\begin{flushright}
\end{flushright}
formed and equipped private elite armies in order to control drug trafficking and to regulate the economic and social relations in these cities. This phenomenon of violence affected the social order in these cities and turned them almost unlivable.

The main factors that allowed the success of drug cartels in these cities are high rates of social inequality and poverty, fragmentation of power, urban violence, centralism, lack of guarantees from the government, impunity, insecurity, precariousness-corruption, complicity between the government and criminal organizations, and the criminal opportunities of extreme profitability offered by the global cocaine trafficking. Officials are bribed when possible, coerced and otherwise intimidated when necessary. Thereby, drug cartels took control of state institutions and, based on the exercise of private coercion that responded to the new political economy of these cities, supplanted them by other types of institutions that allowed the capital flows of drugs to feed local economies with the aim of ensuring the inclusion of peripheral communities in the market.

Additionally, drug cartels took advantage of the strategic location where Medellín and Ciudad Juárez are located to accomplish their projects. This way, it is important to give a geopolitical perspective in order to understand the behavior of drug trafficking in these cities.

Medellín


55 Simser, “*Plata o plomo,*” 267.

Medellín is situated in a strategic location in Colombia, halfway between the main producing regions in Latin America (Bolivia and Peru) and the corridors through the Pacific Ocean, the Caribbean, and Central America that lead to the largest markets (North American and European markets).  

Figure 1. Map of Medellín

Its geographic location, the characteristics of its climate - Medellín is knowing as the City of the Eternal Spring because its tropical heat generates a pretty comfortable temperature media annual of 23 degrees Celsius (74 degrees Fahrenheit) and its soil, added to its political, cultural, and economic factors, allow us to understand the reason why Medellín was for the narcos the principal drug trafficking hub in Colombia and why, drug cartels triumphed in producing and exporting cocaine.

---


During the 1980s, the economy of Medellín was affected by the crisis of its textile industry and the disaster of its financial sector.\textsuperscript{59} Due to these factors and adding to problems such as the absence of the state, the weakness of its institutions, the lack of decentralization aggravated by its inability to formulate and execute effective resolutions necessary to answer the needs of the population and extend basic services to rural areas, new types of authorities that were in favor of the interests of the diverse armed groups, begun to control the justice using violence. Non-state actors, such as the Medellín Cartel, criminal groups, and urban militias, dramatically hardened and professionalized a series of clans, establishing the criteria of the law that would be applied.\textsuperscript{60}

Figure 2. Division of Medellín in neighborhoods and comunas.

\textsuperscript{59} Martin, “Medellín, tragedia y resurrección,” 253.

\textsuperscript{60} The Medellín Cartel built politically effective alliances that allowed it not only to succeed in the narco-traffic business but also to accumulate power in the city. Maclean, “The ‘Medellín Miracle’,,” 22.
The emergence of militia groups in Medellín is associated with the expansion of criminal violence produced by drug trade, especially in informal popular comunas in the northern part of the city. In particular, these comunas were deeply affected, as poor people were more vulnerable because they had fewer resources to protect themselves and were excluded from the markets.

There, drug cartels were seen as a way to success because with the enormous amount of capital and resources introduced in the society, they increased the participation of the marginal people in the economy. In addition, they were accepted and the profits of the drug business were welcomed as they satisfied social demands. Their role was recognized as a means of social inclusion due to factors such as locally investing on supermarkets, restaurants, nightclubs, brand stores and luxury cars dealers, the creation of new jobs, sponsor housing which enhanced the sense of belonging and pride among the members of the local community.

---


As a result, the local economies were overtaken to the point that drug cartels transformed the distribution of wealth, the social hierarchies, and the social order as a whole.\textsuperscript{64}

Furthermore, the government had a strong reason to tolerate the criminal transactions of this type in marginal communities because they had a great legitimacy in the capacity in which the criminal organizations had to solve the new social demands that arose from the drug trafficking itself.\textsuperscript{65} Therefore, the drug cartels could not be controlled by the state and became the means of socialization and the identification model for the new generations of popular neighborhoods, by building an imaginary on children who grew up under the everyday sign of violence where death is the fundamental reference.\textsuperscript{66}

Table.2 Murders in Medellín (1987-2008)

\textsuperscript{64} In contrast, para-state and paramilitary actors were recognized as having de facto legitimacy in the comunas, and a political solution, that recognized the bases of their power was deemed necessary in the early 1990s (Boudon, 1996). In both cases, formal political actors offered to recognize the militia and the paramilitaries by legitimizing their security role. Whilst this is a recognition of the political processes behind the violence. It also blurs the lines between legitimate and illegitimate force, continuing some of the political underpinnings of the violence. Maclean, “The ‘Medellin Miracle’,” 25.

\textsuperscript{65} Martin, \textit{Medellin, tragedia y resurrección}, 21.

\textsuperscript{66} Martin, \textit{Medellin, tragedia y resurrección}, 148.
By the 1990s, homicide and other forms of violence surged in Medellin. Violence had become a daily occurrence throughout the society, and the city turned into both the world's most violent city and the global leader in kidnapping. These factors became the main social, economic, public health and safety problems in the city as a result of the presence of the Medellín cartel that kept this city under a reign of terror.

Figure 3. Attacks made by Medellín cartel in 1989.

---

67 Henderson, Colombia’s Narcotics Nightmare, 3.
An increase of violence had resulted, predominantly because of the war between cartels, but also due to narco-terrorist campaigns against the strategies that the government enforced in order to penalize drug cartels, which was known as the Plan Colombia. This program was embraced by the U.S., which was concerned over the escalating violence in Colombia and its potential for spreading internationally.\textsuperscript{68} The main approach that influenced the Plan Colombia was based on the idea that security improves social equality, diminishes poverty, and brings stability to social and political institutions. Thus, to guarantee security, this program implemented a military plan.

\textsuperscript{68} Henderson, \textit{Colombia’s Narcotics Nightmare}, 166.
Although Plan Colombia improved public safety in the country and some cities became visibly less violent, cocaine production increased and drug cartels improved and strengthened their strategies such as the Cell System, a structure that allowed them to operate adequately in order to get hold of Medellín.

Table 3. Homicides in Colombia (2002 - 2015)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Year</th>
<th>Homicides</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>2002</td>
<td>28,837</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2003</td>
<td>23,523</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2004</td>
<td>20,210</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2005</td>
<td>18,111</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2006</td>
<td>17,479</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2007</td>
<td>17,198</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2008</td>
<td>16,140</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2009</td>
<td>15,817</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2010</td>
<td>15,459</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2011</td>
<td>16,127</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2012</td>
<td>16,440</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2013</td>
<td>15,419</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2014</td>
<td>13,343</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2015</td>
<td>12,673</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>


Table 4. Coca and Eradication in Colombia (1994-2015)
As a result, a new wave of violence hit the city and processes of deterioration became evident in that period. It occurred when the Medellín drug dealers directly assassinated prominent political leaders who oppose them and openly attacked the Colombian state, using terrorist tactics such as car and pipe bombs, kidnappings, murders, among other acts of barbarism. Extradition has been the main cause of the narco-terrorism that erupted in the late 1980s and the source of conflict between the government and drug traffickers, who have used all available resources to fight it.\textsuperscript{69} Their goal was to avoid extradition and to pressure for a lighter sentencing regime for drug offenses, and they attained it\textsuperscript{70}, but the cost paid by Colombians had no comparison.

\textsuperscript{69} Francisco E. Thoumi, “Illegal Drugs in Colombia: From Illegal Economic Boom to Social Crisis,” \textit{Annals of the American Academy of Political and Social Science} 582. Cross-National Drug Policy (July, 2002): 111. http://www.jstor.org.ezp-prod1.hul.harvard.edu/stable/1049737?Search=yes&resultItemClick=true&searchText=cartel&searchText=colombia&searchUri=%252Faction%252FdoBasicSearch%253FQuery%253Dcartel%252Bcolombia%2526amp%253Bprq%253Dcartel%2526amp%253Bhp%253D25%2526amp%253Bacc%253Don%2526amp%253Bwc%253Don%2526amp%253Bfc%253Doff%2526amp%253Bso%253Drel%2526amp%253Bdref%2526seq=1#page_scan_tab_contents, 111.

\textsuperscript{70} Ceballos and Cronshaw, “The Evolution of Armed Conflict in Medellín,” 115.
Cartels and fragmented groups of common criminality were engaged in harsh disputes over the domain of plazas to establish their headquarters for drug trafficking. For instance, in the poorest comunas, the Medellín Cartel increased violent methods, developed a ramified military base, and set up collection offices in order to control drug-related activities in the city. It was a place where the Cartel exercised discipline, collected vacunas, and organized its next moves.

The proliferation of gangs and the infiltration of the narcotraffic economy generated an inversion of values and aspirations in models of the youth. Added to the lack of opportunities that the young people had to success within the formal social channels, it resulted in the social construction of a subculture of criminality, a new form of juvenile delinquency that arose in the popular and poor districts of Medellín: sicarios, hired assassins who worked for the highest bidder and had no respect nor compassion for anyone, who incorporated death as an everyday element and spread fear in the city traumatizing their inhabitants. Their money, ruthlessness, corruption, threats and systematic use of murder and other forms of violence, further paralyzed the justice and security apparatus,
besides corrupting local society. As a consequence of this violence that afflicted the streets of Medellín every day, assassinations and human rights violations increased and these drove the city into near collapse.

Table 6. Murders in Medellín (1975-2002).

![Graph showing murder rates in Medellín and Colombia from 1975 to 2002.](image)

Source: Medicina Legal, 2002.

The sicariato brainwashed the youth. For instance, they were programmed to kill and for a fee they liquidated opponents or enemies of drug traffickers. Thus, they eliminated debtors, traitors, notable politicians, judges, judicial officials, and members of the police and intelligence bodies that confronted or investigated them. Once the young people submerged in this subculture, where the language was full of visual images, brands names, music, and fashion, the means to consume were part of their ability to appear powerful and influence the way of perceiving and putting an end to their world. They did not find any other alternative or way out, except through death. The generalization of these

---

71 Klaufus, and Ouweneel, *Housing and Belonging in Latin America*, 58.

characters as the Nouveaux riches meant an accelerated process of stigmatization of the poor youth of that city.\textsuperscript{73}

What happened next with the young people was a natural consequence of a process of exclusion from the society. It was a revolt by the adolescents of the poor neighborhoods, who drawn to a gang not just for economic reasons, but because it opened its doors and offered them a social role that gave them identity and cohesion.\textsuperscript{74} They had discovered themselves involved in violence, killing for money, and in the drug trade; the only possibility of fulfilling their wishes and playing an active part in a society had closed its doors to them.\textsuperscript{75}

An example of the power that the sicariato can produce was the case of Pablo Escobar. Escobar with his warrior spirit, his charisma, his skills in negotiation, took advantage of the coercive apparatus of the sicariato that allowed him, on one hand, to control the highly lucrative drug business in Medellín and, on the other hand, to challenge the State decisions against drug traffickers.\textsuperscript{76} Pablo Escobar made brilliant use of terror to break the will of Colombians and their leaders\textsuperscript{77} and became the kingpin of Medellín.\textsuperscript{78}

\textsuperscript{73} Leal, \textit{En la encrucijada: Colombia en el siglo XXI}, 404

\textsuperscript{74} Alonso J. Salazar, \textit{Born to Die in Medellín (No nacimos pa’ semilla)}, trans. Nick Caistor (London: Latin America Bureau, 1992), 123.

\textsuperscript{75} Salazar, \textit{Born to Die in Medellín}, 111.

\textsuperscript{76} Duncan, \textit{“Más que plata o plomo,”} 76.

\textsuperscript{77} Henderson, \textit{Colombia's Narcotics Nightmare}, 80.

\textsuperscript{78} Medellín’s violence is most commonly attributed to one person: Pablo Escobar who in 1984 offered to pay off the entire national debt of US$10 billion. This offer was refused, but his political influence penetrated the highest offices, and, having taken offence at the refusal and determined to avoid an extradition treaty, Escobar declared war on the state. The theatre for this war was not uniquely, but predominantly, Medellín. The war took the form of a bombing campaign, the assassination of presidential candidates, and an offer of over $2,000 for any police officer killed in Medellin. A ‘plomo o plata’ approach to political
For the sicariato, he was their hero, he influenced their suicidal attitude; their desire to join the death squad. Likewise, they did all the dirty jobs for him in order to get easy money and prestige.

Furthermore, in Medellín, the aftermath of drug trafficking and the presence of narcos in the city, deteriorated the public order, isolated and broke links between citizens, causing a rupture of the social system, and transmitted new cultural values and customs to the society.

By the end of 1993, with the murder of Pablo Escobar, the greatest capo of the Medellín Cartel and in the history of the country, the Colombian government increased control of its territory and was able to disrupt the flows of money and weapons, its ability to acquire drugs and drug precursor chemicals, and its distribution networks, eradicating parts of their destructive growth. However, the fall of the Medellín cartel did not end the violence in the city, but it inadvertently triggered the displacement and mitosis of lethal narco-cells throughout the State. Further, it gave rise to violent battles between different illegal armed actors who wanted to control the power gaps left by the cartel. Inevitably, the competition for greater prestige and radicalism soon moved to a more violent plan and outbreaks of bloodshed erupted, in a classic moment of inversion of what looked like a

---


social movement, but it was, at heart, an armed illegal agitation. The situation in Medellin seemed like an endless nightmare.

In addition, due to acts of narcoterrorism such as violence, fear and terror, combined with corruption and the complicity of the police, and the absence of confidence in the role of the state regulator, the society was devastated and had to face the need to carry out a battle on different fronts. Many citizens’ desplazados moved to other cities, others fled to different countries, but most of them had to stay and become survivors, but not participants in society.

Hence, it was demonstrated that the intervention of the state was necessary to create a change in the city. As a result, between 2004 and 2016, Medellín lived a period of physical and social transformations that changed the way the state and communities interact.

Ciudad Juárez

Similarly to Medellín, Ciudad Juárez is strategically located for the distribution and trade of cocaine. It is situated in México’s Chihuahua state on the border with United States, in front of El Paso (Texas). From there, drug cartels, with the help of coyotes, supply the growing U.S. demand of cocaine. They smuggle women, child, weapons and

---


82 Alcaldía de Medellín, “Medellín: Transformación de una ciudad,” 38.

83 Klaufus and Ouweneel, *Housing and Belonging in Latin America*, 258.
immigrants as well. Therefore, it is considered as the most lucrative plaza for drug cartels along the US-México border.

Figure 4. Map of Ciudad Juárez.

Nowadays, Ciudad Juárez is the city that has witnessed the bloodshed of major crimes waves and spikes in drug-related violence over the last few years⁸⁴ and it is considered one of the most violent city in México and one of the most dangerous cities in the world where seven people were murdered daily and more than 3,000 murders for intentional homicides (executions, as the federal government calls them) and confrontations were registered,⁸⁵ as a result of bloody territorial disputes that occurred between 2007 and 2012 among cartels, such as the Juárez and Sinaloa cartels, which wanted to take control of this plaza. An unacceptable threshold of violence stems from the

⁸⁴ Martin, Medellín, tragedia y resurrección, 27.

rise of murders, rapes, and kidnappings. These unprecedented levels of violence and victimization associated with drug crimes have been spilling over in recent years.

Table 7. Records of murders in Mexico’s cities.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>City</th>
<th>Percentage</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Juárez</td>
<td>20%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Culiacán</td>
<td>10%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Tijuana</td>
<td>8%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Chihuahua</td>
<td>6%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Acapulco de Juárez</td>
<td>4%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Gómez Palacio</td>
<td>3%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Torreón</td>
<td>2%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mazatlán</td>
<td>1%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Nogales</td>
<td>1%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Durango</td>
<td>1%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Navojo</td>
<td>1%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Monterrey</td>
<td>1%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ahome</td>
<td>1%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Morelia</td>
<td>1%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Tepic</td>
<td>1%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Rayosa</td>
<td>1%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Guasave</td>
<td>1%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ecatepec de Morelos</td>
<td>1%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Hidalgo del Parral</td>
<td>1%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Uruapan</td>
<td>1%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sinaloa</td>
<td>1%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Lerdo</td>
<td>1%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Source: El Siglo de Torreon

Figure 5. Ciudad Juárez mourns its dead people

---


This way, drug cartels are assuming an enormous cost for México spreading fear, anxiety, and distrust in government institutions, such the local police force that is notably corrupt.

This rise of violence has been caused by the heinous acts driven by drug cartels to spark fear in the police, the military, and the government as a result of the strategies that México and U.S.A. enforced to penalize drug cartels in 2007\(^{88}\). These strategies are known as Iniciativa Mérida and were designed to support law enforcement efforts to fight drug trafficking. Similarly to the Plan Colombia, this master plan was funded by the U.S. in order to fight organized crime and put an end to the associated violence. U.S.A. launched $1.6 billion in order to disrupt the organized crime groups, institutionalize reforms to sustain the rule of law and protect human rights, and to create a border and build a strong

and resilient community. These was achieved through the formulation of crime prevention programs, the provision of the equipment necessary to fight the cartels and the establishment of programs to strengthen law enforcement and the institutions of justice.\footnote{Simser, “Plata o plomo,” 275.}

Even though this initiative included intelligence, training, and equipment to weaken organized criminal groups, it was not enough to stop the traffickers. For instance, nor sensors, video cameras, neither the USBP, nor the Army could stop them. These were only obstacles that made their businesses improve and made them lose all respect for law enforcement and feel untouchable and unreachable.

Drug cartels are responsible for regulating social transactions that the state cannot regulate due to its informality and illegality, or simply because its institutions are inadequate for the demands of protection, order and financing of these businesses.\footnote{Duncan, “Más que plata o plomo,” 118.}

As a result of this wave of violence, revenge and collusion, corruption and impunity, drug cartels continue to attack the civilian population with extortion and kidnappings. Hence, unremitting violence such as decapitations, torture, slaughter, castrations, plunging victims in vats of acid, and burning them alive plague the streets of Ciudad Juárez and many innocents are trapped in the crossfire. These heinous acts are driven by money, revenge, ransom, extortion, access to drugs, turf battles, propaganda and the cartels’ determination to spark fear in rivals, the police, the military, and the population.\footnote{George W Grayson, Mexico: Narco-Violence and a Failed State? (New Brunswick, NJ: Transaction Publishers, 2010), 5.}
Ten percent of its population, primarily middle-class professionals, fled the violence.\textsuperscript{92} Narcos are a threat to the local institutions; they promote instability and tensions, which make it hard for the general populace to become prosperous.\textsuperscript{93} As well, the presence of narcos in the city destroyed the way of life of its inhabitants, deteriorated public order and threatened to break down the state and the sovereignty of the city.

One reason for the success of drug cartels in Ciudad Juárez is the increasing availability of weapons and ammunition, usually smuggled into México from the United States, allowing them to protect their illegal business and increase their economic gain. Likewise, the inability of the state to protect citizens, the incompetence of its leaders, the futility of its laws, and its ambivalence and serious discrepancies in its policy on drug-related activities also strengthens their power.\textsuperscript{94} Furthermore, the problems that the justice system has such as corruption of officials, that had always been a feature of the government in Ciudad Juárez, slow paths to justice, impunity of criminals and inaccurate evidence\textsuperscript{95} is another reason for their growth and sustainability. Through armed clientelism, narcos managed to make public workers their employees. Equally, drug traffickers have penetrated local and Federal institutions. For instance, police and members of the Mexican Army became their sicarios.\textsuperscript{96} With the help of these institutions, narcos managed to enjoy


\textsuperscript{93} Grayson, \textit{Mexico: Narco-Violence and a Failed State}? 231.

\textsuperscript{94} Henderson, \textit{Colombia’s Narco’s Narcotics Nightmare}, 91.

\textsuperscript{95} Simser, “Plata o plomo,” 275.

\textsuperscript{96} Anabel Hernández, \textit{Los señores del narco} (México City: Grijalbo, 2010), 394.
a high level of impunity and take possession of the city, by making disappear, if necessary, documents, sujetos incómodos, and confessions.

There are several reasons that explain why drug cartels are accepted by a large part of the population. First, they satisfy social demands and alter the distribution of wealth, investing the profits of their illegal business locally. Second, they intensify the sense of belonging and dignity between members of the society. Moreover, drug cartels have offered the inhabitants protection, security, surveillance, and defense, and have incremented the presence of peripheral people in the economy. Furthermore, they became the authority where the state was absent, transformed the social order, and became the means of socialization in the community. Similarly, ethical and moral issues surround the influence of drug cartels in the society. They have been transmitting new cultural values and many people consider them as heroes and glorify their lives. In fact, drug cartels became the identification model for the new generations of popular neighborhoods, affecting the lives of many children and creating a world of opportunities for the youth. This way, many people want to join these criminal organizations either because of the indignation and resentment that impacted their childhood or simply because they are attracted by easy money and by the glamour of the narco lifestyle.

---

97 Longmire, Cartel: The Coming Invasion of Mexico’s Drug Wars, 132.

98 Longmire, Cartel: The Coming Invasion of Mexico’s Drug Wars, 42.
Chapter V.

Medellín’s Strategic Plans Analysis.

Medellín’s three decades of violence and bloodshed was framed by the inability of the government to confront the problems that the city faced regarding poverty, inequality, lack of opportunities and conditions that guarantee a dignified life for its inhabitants, especially in rural areas. In the same way, the management of drug trafficking, with its particular interests in control of strategic zones, the disputes between gangs and the new culture of easy money increased the violence in the city. These factors have taught its leaders what must be done to build up peace and reconstruct its society.

Thereby, Medellin's social crisis was placed on the national and even global agenda, drawing the attention of external organizations that were interested in better understanding what was happening and what could be done to transform the reality of a city immersed in its problems\(^9\) and turn it into a more humane place for the new generations. In this case, it was indispensable to promote ideas, proposals, and programs and to allocate resources to address the social debt and the historical absence of the State.\(^1\)

\(^9\) Corrales, *La Sistematización de Experiencias Gubernamentales*, 69.

\(^1\) Alcaldía de Medellín, “Medellín: Transformación de una ciudad,” 42.
The idea of transformation is related to the concept of crisis that is assumed through the acceptance of the opportunity of change in a context of crisis where the pessimism is in the air\textsuperscript{101} and where the pain was the cause of the change, of the new reality.

Figure 6. Overcome from violence.

![Image of two birds sculpture](image)

Source: Parque San Antonio, Medellín\textsuperscript{102}

Between 2003 and 2012, the city of Medellín has undergone social and physical transformations under a demand-driven, participatory and integrated approach through a series of comprehensive policies and programs focused on the resolution of social problems in the most marginalized neighborhoods. With the purposes to guarantee the inclusion of poor and marginal sectors, and improve the indicators of quality of life and human

\textsuperscript{101} Alcaldía de Medellín, “Medellín: Transformación de una ciudad,” 23.

\textsuperscript{102} The bird’s sculpture made by Fernando Botero on the right was destroyed by an attack attributed to the war between cartels in 1995, where 22 people were killed and 100 were injured. The bird’s sculpture on the left was given again by the artist as a symbol that the city is not afraid anymore.
development, the main axes of these policies have been to strengthen the competitiveness of the city, develop an economy of citizen solidarity, promote employment, improve citizen security, promote civic culture and empower social capital. This resurrection process of Medellín has been a long one and is far from ending.

What Did They Do?

In order to end the problems related to violence and drug trafficking in Medellín, development plans were implemented with a high content of security measures and coexistence, which focused on the demarginalization of the neighborhoods and integral planning, as well as in the educational, social, cultural, urban and economic components.

The first plan that was implemented was named “Medellín: City of Opportunities” and was developed in 2001 by the administration of Mayor Luis Pérez. It mainly focused on the civic culture, understood as the correspondence that exists between daily relationships that express traditions, values, habits and behaviors, and a set of principles that support the Social State of Law. Its second mainstay was competitiveness as a driver of progress, welfare and efficiency. Lastly, it focused on the creation of public spaces and city scenarios to decrease inequality improve the quality of life and create more attractive and safer popular neighborhoods where the main character is the citizen that fulfills with his energy these spaces and in his daily life, defines culture and promotes confidence.

---

103 Corrales, *La Sistematización de Experiencias Gubernamentales*, 69.
105 Alcaldía de Medellín, “Medellín: Transformación de una ciudad,” 23.
With the objective of a respectful spatial insertion many public spaces that host permeable elements, vegetation and buildings that remind their inhabitants of their essence, and where the visitor can forget the tragedy that the city lived were created, and thus more urbanity and more places to live together. To illustrate, public library parks were built, as well as health clinics, playgrounds, schools and sports facilities, cultural centers and public gardens.

Figure 7. Garbage accumulation in Villa del Socorro neighborhood

![Figure 7. Garbage accumulation in Villa del Socorro neighborhood](image)

Source: Plataforma Urbana, 2017

Figure 8. Transformation of the dump in a public garden

![Figure 8. Transformation of the dump in a public garden](image)

---

During 2001-2003, Medellín was the scenario of the Democratic Security Policy implemented by Colombian former president Álvaro Uribe Vélez. The objective of this policy was to improve national security by combating crime and violence in an intense political, diplomatic and military offensive against terrorism and drug trafficking. With the implementation of “Operation Orión” in the “Comuna 13 (San Javier)”, under the declaration of a State of Emergency that allowed the intrusion of more than a thousand members of the military forces, police and special anti-terrorist army in all instances of private life and community, the national police returned to Medellín’s comunas and fought the dispute over the territory destroyed the militia infrastructure, intervened drug dispensing stores, and seized their weapons, making the presence of militias noticeably decrease in the area.

Subsequently, violence levels declined and the government regained the confidence and respect of its citizens and the city was gradually resurrecting.

In addition, in 2004 the administration of Mayor Sergio Fajardo implemented two plans “Medellín, commitment of all citizens” and “Medellín, the most educated city”. The first one focused mainly on the institutional crisis and security. In this way, it fought against crime and corruption, promoting the ethical principles of transparency and independence and always placing public welfare before particular interests.

It was very important for this administration to develop a programmatic vision of the city and to recognize historical processes in order to articulate national, regional and local security strategies and policies to recover the city and reduce its levels of violence.

107 Leal, *En la encrucijada: Colombia en el siglo XXI*, 42.

At the same time, it was important to decentralize the government in order to provide mechanisms for each municipality to respond to their needs, aimed at guaranteeing greater proximity of the local State to the basic needs of citizens, out of clientelism or electoral interests and so, achieve transparency in the process, greater efficiency, better accountability and less corruption.¹⁰⁹

For instance, this administration implemented an urban intervention methodology called PUI designed to generate new opportunities and feelings of belonging in the most depressed and marginalized areas of the city where the state usually has a high social debt. Likewise, it aimed to raise the levels of quality of life of the inhabitants of a specific area, concentrating all its resources in a single territory to focus efforts and achieve a result that reflected in the development and the integral social and physical transformation of the communities.¹¹⁰ The main objectives of PUI included improving access to public transportation, including the construction of cable cars, tramways, new bus lines and pedestrian routes. It also entailed as well the upgrading of public spaces, including: the recovery of the linear parks, the improvement of street lighting, the formalization of property titles, the connections to the public service grid and the consolidation of habitat.¹¹¹

In the same manner, and with the aid of public sectors, the local government established the UVA in the poorest areas of Medellín in order to develop dynamic spaces of culture and recreation, where the community identifies itself with its environment and

¹⁰⁹ Martin, Medellín, tragedia y resurrección, 283.
¹¹⁰ Martin, Medellín, tragedia y resurrección, 503.
¹¹¹ Klaufus and Ouweneel, Housing and Belonging in Latin America, 64.
strengthens its sense of belonging. Its main objectives were to promote the appropriation and care of spaces for public use, to respect diversity and to promote social inclusion\textsuperscript{112}.

On the other hand, “Medellín, the most educated city” had an educational approach. Education is considered to be the most important tool to fight social exclusion. This plan focused on the areas of inclusion, social participation, citizen culture and education. The objectives of this plan were to provide a comprehensive approach to care for infants in which health, nutrition and education were articulated. Consequently, day care centers were built and work was promoted with the parents, the family and the community. In addition, incentives were developed so that no one left school at an early age. As well, new high-quality schools were created and a credit fund for higher education was provided through partnerships with the private sector\textsuperscript{113}.


\textsuperscript{113} Alcaldía de Medellín “Medellín: Transformación de una ciudad,” 96.
In this period of time, the modification of the social dynamics facing the local institutionality, promoted the sensation of structural changes that indicated that the city was in a process of urban transformation based on policies and innovative programs in cultural, social and educational areas. Likewise, neighborhood scenarios were worked out in close collaboration with citizens and so were the central priorities of the plan for the city: equality, quality of life, and civic culture, as well as overcoming the social debt and transforming Medellín into a innovative city.

Figure 10. Escalators in Comuna 13.

---


115 Klaufus and Ouweneel, *Housing and Belonging in Latin America*, 64.
Following this line of thought, in 2008 the administration of Alonso Salazar developed the plans “Medellin is Solidary and Competitive” and “Safer Medellín”. The main focal points of the first plan were the reduction of social gaps that generate inequality, the incentive of competitiveness, the promotion of a "social urbanism" to dignify the most vulnerable populations and the promotion of Medellín as a city for innovation and development\textsuperscript{116}.

\textsuperscript{116} Corrales, \textit{La Sistematización de Experiencias Gubernamentales}, 61.
Figure 11. More than 2,224 families used to live among 1.5 million tons of waste.

Figure 12. Transformation of Moravia’s Neighborhood into an Urban Garden.

The purpose of this plan was to create a sense of belonging in the community that contributed to new forms of citizen participation, integration and sociability, especially in the city’s most violent and poorest neighborhoods and demographically inhabited by young people. It also intended to reconnect bridges with public and private agencies and work with neighborhood organizations and local government\(^\text{117}\) in order to keep the youth busy. For instance, new urban environments were created by the local government with the

\(^{117}\) Klaufus and Ouweneel, *Housing and Belonging in Latin America*, 61.
participation of the local community that helped to design and develop the projects and the aid of organized civil society that redirected the city’s path. As well, with the revitalization of civil society, more professional cultural initiatives for larger publics also began to take over popular neighborhoods and gave life to local projects.

State and community collaborated with enthusiasm. To illustrate, many residents helped to recover public spaces, renovate schools and health facilities, paint communal walls, clean streets and plant trees and flowers in the new public gardens.

Figure 13. Graffiti Made by the Community in a Wall in Comuna 13.

Some of them also took their works and productions to the neighborhoods, many times with the firm intention of sowing, through them, a seed of peace.\footnote{Martin, Medellín, tragedia y resurrección, 565.}

Furthermore, the plan “Safer Medellín” was intended to strengthen inter-institutional articulation, targeting, and differentiation of citizen security policy according to its territory. Likewise, it pretended to expand the focalized coverage of opportunities generation programs for at-risk youth and strengthen the citizen security fronts and
prevention networks in order to keep citizen participation active. Finally, it expected to increase support for the modernization of justice and security to reduce impunity.\textsuperscript{119}

After these urban interventions and the implementation of these plans, the homicide and crime rates decreased, public service delivery improved, the confidence in public administration and government legitimacy increased as well as the indexes of life quality and human development, in particular in the most disadvantaged inhabitants and territories of the city, largely concentrated in the neighborhoods and communes that had also intensely suffered violence.

In order to achieve the above-mentioned results, the local government created “Juntas de Acción Comunal” which, with their elected boards, became the principal community-based counterparts for such programs\textsuperscript{120}. These represented the leadership of the local model as an integrating force of society that directed its resources to meet the needs of citizens, especially the poorest through transparent public administration and equitable institutional access for all its inhabitants.\textsuperscript{121}

New policies were developed in Medellín such as having access to an affordable public transportation to connect the socially, economically and politically isolated parts of these informal communities with the rest of the city.\textsuperscript{122} Here, it is important to highlight the “Metro Culture”, a pedagogic campaign that contributed to guarantee the disciplined and respectful use of the new infrastructure.

Figure 14. Metro in Medellin

\textsuperscript{119} Martin, \textit{Medellín, tragedia y resurrección}, 565.

\textsuperscript{120} Klaufus and Ouweneel, \textit{Housing and Belonging in Latin America}, 56.

\textsuperscript{121} Alcaldía de Medellín, “Medellín: Transformación de una ciudad,” 27.

\textsuperscript{122} Klaufus and Ouweneel, \textit{Housing and Belonging in Latin America}, 243.
There was a feeling of civic pride due to the fact that Medellín was the first and only city in the country to have a metro. To illustrate, this new cultural shift evinced that the great majority of the citizens of Medellín had no difficulty in appreciating and making a respectful use of a quality public good. For example, people took and continue to take great care of it since the work began and intervened since then in the projects. They

Figure 15. Graffiti in a public wall in Comuna 13.
Figure 16. Fire in Comuna 13 caused by the Battle between Criminals.

Source: Revista Semana, 2001

dreamed that everything could be transformed from within, that is why the ideas of the community are collected.

Figure 17. Comuna 13 after the execution of social urbanism policies.

For instance, people fell in love with the city and felt that its reconstruction had something that brought them back to life. Additionally, innovations of social type and urban development emerged such as the Metrocable and the escalators in the Comuna 13 (San Javier) one of the poorest areas of Medellin. These reduced the commuting times of its inhabitants and created a sense of belonging and a social conscience to care for the common heritage. Likewise, they were given a new use to turn them into a means of mass transportation, which made them innovative products.

Figure 18. Metro Cable.

---


125 Pantaleón, “Medellín: la ciudad que domó a la violencia.”
Further, new administrations provided incentives to the community in order to create more employment and to improve the standard of living all around.\textsuperscript{126} To illustrate, new family businesses were created and schools and old businesses were improved.

As a result of the enforcement of these policies and development plans, Medellín reduced its violence rate by 80% in the last 20 years. Its homicide rate is less than 100 per 100,000 inhabitants, and the population that lives on less than $1.25 per day decreased from 47% in 1990 to 22% during 2010.\textsuperscript{127} To conclude, it is important to highlight the awards and recognitions that Medellín has had worldwide for its transformation. In 2008, it won the Dubai International Habitat Prize, the triple A rating (2006, 2007, 2008) of Duff and Phelps for the municipality's finances, the HOLCIM 2008 Award for the integral urban project of the Comuna 13, the 2008 Prize for the best architectural work for the Orquideorama at the Ibero-American Biennial of Architecture and Urbanism in Portugal. In 2013, The Wall Street Journal and Citigroup named Medellin as the "most innovative city in the world", in spite of not being a first world city like New York, Beijing or London\textsuperscript{128}. Besides, Mayors, officials and experts from other national and foreign cities visit the city frequently to learn about different aspects of the “Medellín Model” such as the management of citizen security, programs of access to justice, processes of integral urban planning, educational strategies, programs of social demarginalization and interventions of integral and sustainable urban renewal. Finally, The World Bank, UNDP, UNITAR, UN-Habitat, IADB, UNESCO and other multilateral and bilateral cooperation

\textsuperscript{126} Salazar, \textit{Born to Die in Medellín}, 108.

\textsuperscript{127} Pantaleón, “Medellín: la ciudad que domó a la violencia.”

\textsuperscript{128} Pantaleón, “Medellín: la ciudad que domó a la violencia.”
entities are interested in the “Medellín Model” as a laboratory of best practices to ensure that other cities in the world can apply the lessons learned.\textsuperscript{129}

\begin{flushright}
\textsuperscript{129} Corrales, La Sistematización de Experiencias Gubernamentales, 63.
\end{flushright}
Chapter VI.
Policy Analysis and Results

The violence that took place in Medellín in 1980s and 1990s set a new sense of order in the city. Thus, Medellín created its own framework for action and established cultural guidelines regarding how to provide solutions to conflicts in the midst of a scenario in which the State just started to acquire its potential to generate trust, to change the cultural framework of the city and to respond efficiently to the difficulties that the violence caused and that have inhibit the action of the local government,\textsuperscript{130} causing a crisis of governance. The most significant manifestations of this crisis were the fact that criminal actors controlled important areas of the city, imposing their laws, stopping the free development of community life and closed public spaces for deliberation. Likewise, it weakened the democracy in the city and reduced the legitimacy of local administration. Additionally, the confrontation between these criminal actors turned the city into a death niche.\textsuperscript{131} Hence their inhabitants became survivors but not participants of society.\textsuperscript{132}

In Medellín, there was a basic consensus among the different national, municipal, public, private and community actors, about the origin and character of the crisis\textsuperscript{133} that this city was suffering.

\textsuperscript{130} Corrales, “\textit{La Sistematización de Experiencias Gubernamentales}, 55.

\textsuperscript{131} Corrales, “\textit{La Sistematización de Experiencias Gubernamentales}, 55.

\textsuperscript{132} Klaufus and Ouweneel, \textit{Housing and Belonging in Latin America}, 258.

\textsuperscript{133} Martin, \textit{Medellín, tragedia y resurrección}, 275.
Explanation of the Results: How Did the Policies Work?

Policies:

1. Government Decentralization:
   - The municipality's ability to respond to the needs of its inhabitants by guaranteeing greater proximity of the local State to the basic needs of citizens improved.
   - Clientelism and electoral interests decreased.
   - Increase of transparency and efficiency in the management of resources by the public administration.
   - The credibility of the public administration among citizens increased.
   - The responsibilities of public administration increased.
   - Reduction in the levels of local corruption.
   - Institutional strengthening.
   - Prevalence of the public good over private interests.
   - The coverage and quality of services improved.
   - The broken and inefficient system was fixed.
   - Legitimize the local government and increase the confidence of citizens in it.

2. Social Democratization:
   - The levels of citizen participation increased, promoting the integration of its inhabitants.
   - Incrementation of solidarity and equity among the community.
   - Economic growth in Medellín.
   - The control of the execution of the programs increased in each neighborhood.
• Development of competitiveness.
• Boosted progress in the city.
• The welfare of the citizens increased.

3. Social urbanism:
• Inequality decreased.
• Quality of life increased.
• More attractive and safer popular neighborhoods were created.
• Development of civic culture as the existing correspondence between the daily relationships that express traditions, values, habits and behaviors, and a set of principles that support the Social State of the Law.\(^{134}\)
• The sense of belonging and civic engagement increased.
• The isolation of citizens decreased.
• Medellin became an inclusive and entrepreneurial city.
• Facilitation of coexistence and development.
• Boost of modernization.

4. Democratic Security:
• The national security improved.
• Reduction in violence levels.
• The institutional infrastructure improved.
• Recovery of trust and respect in for the local government by its citizens.
• Resurgence of the city.

5. Education

\(^{134}\) Corrales, “La Sistematización de Experiencias Gubernamentales, 59.
• Social inclusion and social participation were promoted.
• The quality of education improved.
• The collaboration between the private and the public sectors was encouraged as an opportunity for the State to mobilize efforts to contribute to social initiatives through the allocation of new financial resources.¹³⁵
• The sensation of structural changes that indicated that the city was in a process of urban transformation was promoted.¹³⁶

6. Equality:

• Reduction of social gaps that generate inequality.
• Increased competitiveness.
• The purpose of this policy was to create a sense of belonging in the community that contributed to new forms of sociability.

7. Transportation:

• Increase in affordable public transport.
• Connected the socially, economically and politically isolated parts of these informal communities with the rest of the city.¹³⁷

These policies soon made Medellín an example in the country and in the region, it was also admired and awarded by prestigious institutions ... Today this city is an example of

good governance that achieved it success through the way it used its institutions as a way to coordinate the spending of the resources.\textsuperscript{138}

It is important to highlight that there has been continuity in the application of the policies regardless of the ruler or the political party in turn because it is impossible to succeed if every mayor wants to destroy the plans that the former mayor did.

\textsuperscript{138} Martin, “Medellín, tragedia y resurrección, 260.
Chapter VII.
Discussion and Recommendations

México and Colombia, are the two countries that have historically suffered the most from drug trade, reflecting frustration over the violence and corruption that it has caused wherever it has taken root in the region. Culturally, drug trafficking has left its indelible mark on these cities causing a deterioration in traditional sources of power and replacing civilized reasoning with violence and brutality.

How Does One Translate Medellín into Ciudad Juárez?

Medellín and Ciudad Juárez’s community life and social relationships have been affected by the phenomenon of Violence that manifested itself in multiple ways and it is generally divided into three categories: violence directed against the authorities, against other cartels and between cartels as a tool of intimidation and to demonstrate domination. These acts of narco-terrorism devastated their societies, eroding the quality of life, and causing a radical change in the lives of its inhabitants.

---


140 Leal, En la encrucijada: Colombia en el siglo XXI, 388.

141 Longmire, Cartel: The Coming Invasion of Mexico’s Drug Wars, 20.
Previous studies\textsuperscript{142} have demonstrated that the outbreaks of violence in both cities have resulted mostly because of inequality, social exclusion and lack of opportunities, the dynamics of drug trafficking, the war between cartels, government strategies and policies against drug cartels, urban militias, and institutional incapacity.

Likewise, in Medellín there was a process of social decomposition where corruption and the excessive ambition of money and power were constant\textsuperscript{143} and now it is present in Ciudad Juárez. The presence of drug cartels in these cities, with their purchasing power, excesses and celebrations changed the activities and professions of its inhabitants. For instance, the acquisition of cars, real estate and luxury yachts, branded clothes and prostitutes became new symbols of social prestige. In this case, new patterns of material inclusion were legitimized that sought to accumulate power, guaranteeing the purchasing power of the population.\textsuperscript{144}

Although criminality was weakened by the actions of the government of these cities, which included closing the roads for the traffickers and stopping or extraditing the big bosses, the networks of young delinquents that sought to recover the territories and spaces of operation that the government snatched from them multiplied\textsuperscript{145} causing a increase in the violence generated by the war between the cartels, and causing instability in these cities.


\textsuperscript{143} Hernández. \textit{Los Señores del Narco}, 16.

\textsuperscript{144} Duncan, “Más que plata o plomo,” 135.

\textsuperscript{145} José Reveles, \textit{El Cártel Incómodo: El Fin de los Beltrán Leyva y la Hegemonía del Chapo Guzmán} (Grijalbo, México, 2010), 83.
In both cities, the cartels were strengthened due to dysfunctional relations between the military, the state, and the civil societies and the loss of monopoly by the weak states over the legitimate use of force that revealed their inability to protect their citizens and made the cartels not to respect the application of the law. In addition, drug trafficking is strengthened by the weakness of state institutions, the lack of opportunities, the problems of social exclusion, the lack of government guarantees, the inability of the State to have an effective presence in its territory and the corruptibility of the mechanisms of law enforcement. Thus, drug trafficking takes advantage of these weaknesses and worsens them, generating parallel powers that challenge the state monopoly of force. Besides, the economic resources of the different cartels allowed the criminal dynamic to be exploited and perpetuated.\textsuperscript{146}

Further, in Medellín and Ciudad Juárez, young people are extremely vulnerable to forced recruitment in gangs. They are continually intimidated and subjected to violence, pressured to join gangs or to work for them as drug dealers or murderers.\textsuperscript{147} When the State is unable to guarantee security, nor correctly apply social programs or to provide expectations for young people, crime also offers young people the opportunity to take social revenge, it gives their followers a sense of identity and dignity that the government doesn’t give them\textsuperscript{148} and they satisfy their needs. This way, groups of young people learned to serve drug traffickers, and to proceed solely for monetary interests, to counteract poverty

\textsuperscript{146} Corrales, \textit{La Sistematización de Experiencias Gubernamentales}, 43.


\textsuperscript{148} Reveles, “\textit{El Cártel Incómodo},” 10.
and inequality and the presence of young people who became hired killers where killing was their routine seems to be common among these cities.

Additionally, corruption has always been a feature of these nations' political system and led to the lack of confidence of citizens, who began to see an enemy in the State, subtracting legitimacy and opening the way to illegal options for the administration of justice or for territorial control.

Likewise, in Medellín and Ciudad Juárez, the traffickers occupied the cities, intervened and related to society, formed alliances with other anti-state actors that hindered the control of violence and openly defied the states.

Finally, the cocaine industry was a cancer that grew in Colombian society and has spread in Mexican society, corrupting it as it grows. Like the cancers that afflict the human body, the drug cartels attracted little attention at first, they finally invaded and attacked the vital organs of the state and society.

Despite the differences between the two cities, and the fact that corruption and the purchase of power in México is a complex problem that defies a simple solution, there are problems, challenges and solutions that are common among them.

---


151 Henderson, *Colombia's Narcotics Nightmare*, 34.
Solutions That Could Be Applied in Ciudad Juárez

As happened with Medellin, Ciudad Juárez in México’s Chihuahua state is the city that have witnessed the bloodshed of major crimes waves and spikes in drug-related violence over the last few years.\(^\text{152}\)

With the purpose of diminishing the impacts that the drug cartels have left on the Ciudad Juárez society and improving the living conditions of its inhabitants, this study recommends possible solutions for this and to mitigate the violence in the city.

- The local government should reduce the levels of corruption in all its branches of power in order to avoid collusion with illegal actors and avoid the presence of narco-politics and informal actors in the public sphere. These, by the development of strong check and balance policies. As well, it is important to reduce clientelistic actions and stop vertical power relations, especially in the marginalized areas of the city.

- The country needs to reform and overhaul its hundreds of separate state and municipal police forces\(^\text{153}\) in order to provide security for its citizens and stop violent groups competing with the state to gain legitimacy by providing security.\(^\text{154}\)

- An institutional strengthening should be carried out and thus legitimize the local government and increase the confidence of citizens in it.

---

\(^{152}\) Henderson, *Colombia's Narcotics Nightmare*, 27.

\(^{153}\) Bonner, “The New Cocaine Cowboys,” 44.

• The local government should invest in the poorest areas of the city and improve the coverage and the quality of the services provided in order to prioritize inclusion and decrease the levels of social inequality.

• Develop civic, cultural and sports programs that promote the integration of its inhabitants and to keep the youth busy.

• Increase levels of citizen participation in government affairs to increase the confidence of the community in the local institutions.

• Design and execute a way to control, evaluate and report the programs developed in each sector of the city in order to bring government and planning, in general, closer to the citizenry and civil society, as well as legitimating local government and promoting transparency.¹⁵⁵

• Create public spaces where individuals feel safe in order to give a solution of the social isolation problem that hit the city. In Medellín, public spaces such as parks and libraries became icons of the city’s changing image.

• Develop competitiveness policies and solidarity among the inhabitants in order to support community associations and micro-enterprises, there are larger scale initiatives to encourage inclusive economic development.¹⁵⁶

• Create safer, attractive and integral neighborhoods and developing policies so that people fall in love with their city and feel proud of it with the purpose of developing

¹⁵⁵ Maclean, “The ‘Medellin Miracle’,” 32.

¹⁵⁶ Maclean, “The ‘Medellin Miracle’,,” 32.
the sense of belonging among its citizens. This way, it will make a difference in human behavior and will make the citizens take care of their city.

- Kindly investment in previously neglected and stigmatized neighborhoods to transform them into tourist attractions in order to show that it is possible to break the stigmas and reduce violence by transforming neighborhoods and improving the quality of life of the society.
- Invest in education and create new affordable schools for all and implementation of policies that improve the quality of education.
- Promote the integration of the public and private sectors in order to mobilize efforts to contribute to social initiatives through the allocation of new financial resources.
- Formulate policies that reduce social inequality and inequity in order to reduce the levels of violence in the city and improve the life’s quality of the society.
- Improve transport systems and infrastructure in order to connect isolated parts with the rest of the city and address the problem of spatialized exclusion. As well, to change the way that people and wealth circulate, hence improve the economy.\(^\text{157}\)
- Implement continuity in successive government programs in order to make progress in improvement and transformation of the city.
- Repair what is broken rather than apply a radical renovation.\(^\text{158}\)
- Adopt a strategy that was used to defeat cartels in Colombia. Rather than fight many battles on many fronts, the Colombian Government first focused on one cartel at a


\(^{158}\) Klaufus and Ouweneel, Housing and Belonging in Latin America, 66.
time and within a relatively short period dispatched both the Medellín and Cali cartel.\textsuperscript{159}

\textsuperscript{159} Simser, “Plata o plomo,” 272.
Chapter VIII.

Research Findings

This thesis has shown that Ciudad Juárez can learn from the experiences of life in Medellín in terms of the process of social transformation. Thus, it is with the reduction of crime, the improvement of the city's infrastructure and efficiency in public transport, accompanied by the construction of a social conscience, in which the ground was prepared for the birth of the new Medellín: the global capital of innovation.160

Likewise, this suggests the waves of violence and corruption created by drug mafia kingpins demand a bold rethinking of the fight against these criminals.161

Besides, this study shows that social urbanism and development are often positively correlated. This indicates that by increasing the resources assigned to cultural, educational, sports and social programs in general, an increase in opportunities for citizens is reflected. In turn, this causes an increase in the sense of belonging of the inhabitants that is reflected in social welfare and leads to the need to build an adequate infrastructure and good mobility. And in this way competitive and developed cities are created.

160 Pantaleón. “Medellín: la ciudad que domó a la violencia.”

In the same manner, this thesis highlights that mistakes made in the past should be perceived as opportunities for learning, and learning should be identified as an important source of growth and development.\textsuperscript{162}

This study further proposes that it is possible to replace the vicious circle generated by violence by a virtuous circle fueled by trust\textsuperscript{163} of citizens in government institutions. Hence, once the problem of violence has been identified, it is important that the actions that are to be taken go in the same line as the results.

Along these lines, this thesis advised that who must make the decisions that transform the cities are the politicians. They start by having legitimacy, administrative power and budget to direct plans, programs and projects conducive to the construction of a better society (or just the opposite). In this sense, public management becomes a powerful motor that fosters and mobilizes processes of development and progress for societies, and from there, generates learning and lessons that can be replicable and transferable.\textsuperscript{164}

Finally, after achieving the reduction of violence, the next challenge for Medellín is the creation of trained human capital, with which it will follow the path towards a service economy. Similarly, being named the most innovative city in the world is not enough for Medellín. The road has not been finished. Now this city has a new and ambitious goal on the horizon: to become an intelligent city. And to achieve this, in addition to betting on the continuous development of the technological cluster that it already has, it needs to promote

\textsuperscript{162} Corrales, \textit{La Sistematización de Experiencias Gubernamentales}, 8.

\textsuperscript{163} Moreno, \textit{“Medellín: Transformación de una ciudad,”} 19.

\textsuperscript{164} Corrales, \textit{La Sistematización de Experiencias Gubernamentales}, 78.
a new information and communication centers that contribute to solve the problems of education, security, mobility, environment, citizen participation and equity.\textsuperscript{165} 

\textsuperscript{165} Pantaleón, “Medellín: la ciudad que domó a la violencia.”
Bibliography


Cerdá, Magdalena, Jeffrey D Morenoff et all. “Reducing violence by transforming neighborhoods: a natural experiment in Medellin, Colombia”. American Journal of


Thoumi, Francisco E. “Illegal Drugs in Colombia: From Illegal Economic Boom to Social Crisis.” Annals of the American Academy of Political and Social Science 582 (July, 2002): 102-116. http://www.jstor.org.ezp-prod1.hul.harvard.edu/stable/1049737?Search=yes&resultItemClick=true&searchText=cartel&searchText=colombia&searchUri=%252Faction%252FdoBasicSearch%253FQuery%253Dcartel%252Fbcolumbia%2526amp%2526Bprq%252Fdcartel%2526amp%2526Bhp%2526D25%2526amp%2526Bacc%252Fdon%2526amp%2526Bwce%2526amp%2526Don%2526amp%2526Bfco%2526Doff%2526amp%2526Bso%2526Drel%2526amp%2526Braec%2526Doff%2526amp%2526Bseq=1#page_scan_tab_contents.


