"The mother, so sad it is, of the very best": The lament of Thetis in Iliad 18

The Harvard community has made this article openly available. Please share how this access benefits you. Your story matters

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Citation</th>
<th>Nagy, Gregory. 2015.10.29. &quot;The mother, so sad it is, of the very best&quot;: The lament of Thetis in Iliad 18.' Classical Inquiries. <a href="http://nrs.harvard.edu/urn-3:hul.eresource:Classical_Inquiries">http://nrs.harvard.edu/urn-3:hul.eresource:Classical_Inquiries</a>.</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Published Version</td>
<td><a href="https://classical-inquiries.chs.harvard.edu/the-mother-so-sad-it-is-of-the-very-best-the-lament-of-thetis-in-iliad-18/">https://classical-inquiries.chs.harvard.edu/the-mother-so-sad-it-is-of-the-very-best-the-lament-of-thetis-in-iliad-18/</a></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Citable link</td>
<td><a href="http://nrs.harvard.edu/urn-3:HUL.InstRepos:40827361">http://nrs.harvard.edu/urn-3:HUL.InstRepos:40827361</a></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Terms of Use</td>
<td>This article was downloaded from Harvard University’s DASH repository, and is made available under the terms and conditions applicable to Other Posted Material, as set forth at <a href="http://nrs.harvard.edu/urn-3:HUL.InstRepos:dashboard.current.terms-of-use#LAA">http://nrs.harvard.edu/urn-3:HUL.InstRepos:dashboard.current.terms-of-use#LAA</a></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Classical Inquiries

Editors: Angelia Hanhardt and Keith Stone
Consultant for Images: Jill Curry Robbins
Online Consultant: Noel Spencer

About

Classical Inquiries (CI) is an online, rapid-publication project of Harvard’s Center for Hellenic Studies, devoted to sharing some of the latest thinking on the ancient world with researchers and the general public.

While articles archived in DASH represent the original Classical Inquiries posts, CI is intended to be an evolving project, providing a platform for public dialogue between authors and readers. Please visit http://nrs.harvard.edu/urn-3:hul.eresource:Classical_Inquiries for the latest version of this article, which may include corrections, updates, or comments and author responses.

Additionally, many of the studies published in CI will be incorporated into future CHS publications. Please visit http://nrs.harvard.edu/urn-3:hul.eresource:CHS.Online_Publishing for a complete and continually expanding list of open access publications by CHS.

Classical Inquiries is published under a Creative Commons Attribution-NonCommercial 4.0 International License. Every effort is made to use images that are in the public domain or shared under Creative Commons licenses. Copyright on some images may be owned by the Center for Hellenic Studies. Please refer to captions for information about copyright of individual images.

Citing Articles from Classical Inquiries

To cite an article from Classical Inquiries, use the author’s name, the date, the title of the article, and the following persistent identifier:
http://nrs.harvard.edu/urn-3:hul.eresource:Classical_Inquiries.

For example:
In this posting, I show the thinking that went into a self-evaluation exercise that I had put together for "Heroes X." In putting together the wording for this exercise as I wrote it in 2013, I was thinking of things that never made it into the book version. So, my thinking about Iliad 18.54–56 is being shared here in public for the very first time.

§1. In this posting, I show the thinking that went into a self-evaluation exercise that I had put together for "Heroes X." This thinking goes back to 2013, which was the date of publication for my book The Ancient Greek Hero in 24 Hours, which I abbreviate hereafter as H24H.

§2. The original reference for this self-evaluation exercise in "Heroes X" is Hour 4 Annotation Exercise question 1, and it focuses on Iliad 18.54–56. In putting together the wording for this exercise as I wrote it in 2013, I was thinking of things that never made it into the book version, that is, the thinking I am about to show here cannot be found in H24H. So, my thinking about Iliad 18.54–56 is being shared here in public for the very first time. I start with my translation of the Iliadic text:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>54 Ah me, the pitiful one! Ah me, the mother, so sad it is, of the very best.</th>
<th>55 I gave birth to a faultless and strong son,</th>
<th>56 the very best of heroes.</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>ὤ μοι ἡγή, ὤ μοι δυσαριστότεκεια,</td>
<td>ἢ τ᾽ ἐπὶ ἄρ τέκνον υἱόν ἰμῶν ἀμύμων τε</td>
<td>κρατερόν τε ἢ ἀρχον ἥρωιν.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

§3. In the interpretation that follows, I introduce my Annotation Exercise question in a "reader-friendly" way, hoping to help the participants in "Heroes X" organize their thinking before they write down their
What is the biggest reason for the sadness of Thetis about being the mother of the best of all heroes in the Iliad? How do we know that Thetis is really singing a lament and not just quoted as saying sad words? Here are some comments that might help, at least indirectly.

At line 51 of Iliad 18, shortly before the passage that is being quoted in Text G, Thetis starts to perform a lament, the word for which is goos here. Then, at line 54, where we read what Thetis is saying in her lament, she refers to herself as dusaristotokeia. I have translated this complex word as 'the mother, so sad it is, of the very best'. The part of my translation that reads 'the mother of the very best' corresponds to -aristo- tokeia, where -tokeia means 'mother' and -aristo- means 'of the very best'. As for the part dus-, it means 'bad', which we can see in such English borrowings as "dys-functional," "dys-entery" (= 'bad gut' in the original Greek), and so on. This 'bad' is like a parenthetical commentary on the wording aristo-tokeia. The part of my translation 'so sad it is' is an attempt to convey the effect created by dus-. For Thetis, it was a bad thing that Achilles was so good that he was the very best. And there is a relevant sound play that happens in the original Greek here. When women lament, as we can see in the language of Greek tragedy, they sometimes make the mournful cry otototio—and other such sounds. Such a mournful cry is echoed when Thetis says dusaris-toto-keia. So the sound-effect here is also conveyed by the parenthetical expression 'so sad it is'.

§4. Having thus prompted the close-readings of the participants, I invite them to reflect on their analysis by asking them to choose a text "tag" that best corresponds to their understanding:

In your response to this question, which tag below corresponds to the sadness expressed by the mother of Achilles? (choose only ONE tag, here and elsewhere):

She feels grief because Achilles as the best hero is not being treated as the best.

She feels grief because Achilles feels grief.

She feels grief because Achilles is doomed to die.

§5. At this point, in terms of the "Heroes X procedures," I go on to offer my own interpretation of the interpretations already written down by the participants. I do this by writing down my own analysis *in the process of* ranking the text tags that had been made available for the participants. This way, the participants can rethink the choices that they originally made when they wrote down the tags that they thought had best matched their original thinking:

If you answered [by choosing the tag that matches the wording] "she feels grief because Achilles as the best hero is not being treated as the best," you were not following the "logic" of what she is saying here. Although it is true that Achilles feels grief because he was not being treated as the best when Agamemnon insulted him, the immediate cause of the mother's grief here is that her son is doomed to die: what a pity, for the best of the best to die so prematurely! So if you answered [by choosing the tag that matches the wording] "she feels grief because Achilles is doomed to die," you chose the best of the three formulations offered here. If, however, you answered [by choosing the tag that matches the wording] "she feels grief because Achilles feels grief," you would certainly not be wrong. As you keep reading this passage, you see that Achilles will feel grief for the remainder of his very short life, and that Thetis feels helpless because she cannot stop his grief. So I can't quarrel with your answer. But I think that this answer is not as good as the answer [by choosing the tag that matches the wording] "she feels grief because Achilles is doomed to die." As I indicated in my explanation of the background, Thetis is performing a lament, and this is spelled out in line 51 of Iliad 18. Further, as we learn in Hour 2, laments are sung, not just spoken. Thetis is singing while crying, crying while singing. Still further, the grief that she expresses in her lament is caused by the fact that she already knows that Achilles will die young. When she hears her son crying, from far away, in the depths of the sea, she already knows why he is crying: Patroklos has died, and, once that happens, Achilles will inevitably die soon thereafter. That is why Thetis cries for Achilles, once she hears Achilles crying. And, as she cries, she sings her lament. This lament of Thetis is a preview of the lament that she will sing at the funeral of Achilles, as narrated in Odyssey 24.58 (the description is quoted in Hour 4 Text H).

Here I follow through on what I said in H24H Hour 2§78 about the inevitability of the death of Achilles. Let me restate what I said there:

In the Embassy Scene of the Iliad, when Achilles says he must choose between two kères or ‘fated ways’ (9.411), either a nostos, ‘homecoming’, or a kleos, ‘glory’, that will last forever (9.413), he is actually not yet ready to make his choice: the two alternative fates had simply been foretold for him by his mother, the goddess Thetis (9.410–411). Now, after Patroklos has been killed, Achilles is facing the same choice, but now he will finally make his decision. In the lines that follow the text that we are examining here, Achilles will say that there cannot be a homecoming for him (nostēs 18.90) because he must kill Hector in order to avenge the death of Patroklos, and, once he kills Hector, his own death in battle
will become a certainty (18.90–93), just as his mother had foretold—and as she
will now foretell again (18.96–97). By choosing to kill Hector, Achilles will choose
to die young on the battlefield, and he will refer to this death as his inevitable kēr
or ‘fated way’ (18.115). As his compensation, however, he will now win kleos,
‘glory’, for himself (18.121).

§6. So here I have shared with the participants in "Heroes X" my own interpretations about the lament-word dusaristotokeia without (I hope) intruding on the interpretations of the participants. My hope is to
promote their thinking, not to preempt it.

Tags: Achilles, H24H, HeroesX, Iliad, lament, Thetis

2 Responses to “The mother, so sad it is, of the very best”: The lament of Thetis in
Iliad 18

—Mark Miner

Thetis, like Mary, has clearly treasured up in her heart the prophecy of her son’s greatness. As a fan of
"Oidipus, Schmoidipus, as long as he loves his mother!" I wonder what Yiddish could do with the magnificent
compound, "δυσ-αριστοτόκεια," so evocative of the catastrophe of motherly over-investment and high
expectations . . . followed by crushing disappointment. Leo Rosten not being at hand to consult, I turn to the
wiki of Yiddish in English:
https://en.wikipedia.org/wiki/Yiddish_words_used_in_English

How about,
"Oy vey ist mir, Achilles, my Schand-kveller boychik!"

—Mark Miner

(On a side note, When Judy Hallett posted a mock New Yorker cover of Maurice Sendak and his male partner
Eugene Glynn,figuured as "Wild Things," in a synagogue, getting married under a chuppah, with little Max
holding up a post, I added my own post-gay comment: "Definition of chutzpah: The little ceremonial canopy
two nice Jewish boys are married under in the synagogue.")

—Bill

Prof Nagy,

I wonder if Thetis also grieves what could have been. If she had married better her son would gave been
immortal, ageless and ruler of the universe. Is her lament loaded with guilt?

Bill