About Greek ale#theia ‘truth’: Marcel Detienne challenges Martin Heidegger

Citation

Published Version

Permanent link
http://nrs.harvard.edu/urn-3:HUL.InstRepos:41364275

Terms of Use
This article was downloaded from Harvard University’s DASH repository, and is made available under the terms and conditions applicable to Other Posted Material, as set forth at http://nrs.harvard.edu/urn-3:HUL.InstRepos:dash.current.terms-of-use#LAA

Share Your Story
The Harvard community has made this article openly available. Please share how this access benefits you. Submit a story.

Accessibility
Classical Inquiries

Editors: Angelia Hanhardt and Keith Stone  
Consultant for Images: Jill Curry Robbins  
Online Consultant: Noel Spencer

About

Classical Inquiries (CI) is an online, rapid-publication project of Harvard’s Center for Hellenic Studies, devoted to sharing some of the latest thinking on the ancient world with researchers and the general public.

While articles archived in DASH represent the original Classical Inquiries posts, CI is intended to be an evolving project, providing a platform for public dialogue between authors and readers. Please visit http://nrs.harvard.edu/urn-3:hul.eresource:Classical_Inquiries for the latest version of this article, which may include corrections, updates, or comments and author responses.

Additionally, many of the studies published in CI will be incorporated into future CHS publications. Please visit http://nrs.harvard.edu/urn-3:hul.eresource:CHS.Online_Publishing for a complete and continually expanding list of open access publications by CHS.

Classical Inquiries is published under a Creative Commons Attribution-NonCommercial 4.0 International License. Every effort is made to use images that are in the public domain or shared under Creative Commons licenses. Copyright on some images may be owned by the Center for Hellenic Studies. Please refer to captions for information about copyright of individual images.

Citing Articles from Classical Inquiries

To cite an article from Classical Inquiries, use the author’s name, the date, the title of the article, and the following persistent identifier: 
http://nrs.harvard.edu/urn-3:hul.eresource:Classical_Inquiries.

For example:

§0. In the book Sein und Zeit (1927) and in other works by Martin Heidegger, the etymology of the Greek word ālētheia ‘truth’ is explained as a negativizing of the element ēth-, attested as the verb lanthanein, which is used primarily in the sense of ‘escape the notice of’ in ancient Greek texts. Accordingly, Heidegger interpreted the basic meaning of ālētheia as ‘unconcealedness’—to cite a commonly used English translation of his German term Unverborgenheit. I propose here to highlight a less-well-known interpretation of ālētheia, which I think deserves its own place in the sun. This alternative is to be found in a book by Marcel Detienne, originally published in 1967; a second edition appeared in 1994, and an English translation by Janet Lloyd followed in 1996. In the first edition, Detienne was already fiercely critical of Heidegger’s interpretation, using philosophical, philological, and historical arguments in developing his own interpretation. In the second edition, Detienne added linguistic arguments in taking his interpretation even further. In adding those new arguments, Detienne cited, with approval, my own work on the etymology of ālētheia. In this brief essay, I concentrate on the linguistic arguments.

§1. In his preface to what he describes as the “American edition” of Masters of Truth, Detienne (1996; reprinted as Detienne 2001) cites my linguistic arguments in analyzing the etymology of the es-stem formation ālē-the- that we see attested in the noun ālētheia ‘truth’—as also in the adjective ālēthes– ‘true’. Two relevant books of mine are cited in this context by Detienne (1996:143n37): The Best of the Achaeans (Nagy 1979/1999) and Pindar’s Homer (1990). In addition, Detienne (1996:217, also 141n31) cites a relevant article of mine (Nagy 1996) on Hesiodic poetry, where I recap what I say in my two books about traditional Greek poetic wording that instructs the listener to be ‘mindful’, as expressed by the root mnē-, of what is ritually and morally correct—and not to be ‘unmindful’, as expressed by the root ēth-. The negative aspect of such poetic instruction, in terms of my linguistic explanation, is the essence of the earliest recoverable meaning of ālētheia: one must not be unmindful of whatever is true, and such truth must be not only memorable but also absolutely unforgettable.
§2. Detienne (1996:217, also 141n31) goes out of his way to point out that such a linguistic interpretation can be viewed not only as a validation of his own hermeneutic model for explaining alētheia 'truth' but also as an obstacle to the explanation of 'archaic truth' as formulated in an article by Thomas Cole (1983). Cole had intended his formulation to be an alternative to the explanation of alētheia by Heidegger, but, unfortunately, he had not reckoned with the explanatory model of Detienne, which I think is more comprehensive. As Detienne (1996:217) comments ruefully about Cole’s citations of relevant research on alētheia, he "appears to have read everything except The Masters of Truth." For more on the argumentation of Cole and on the counterargumentation of Detienne, I cite the relevant analysis in a PhD dissertation by Anita Nikkanen (2011), the book version of which is in preparation.

§3. In another work, Homeric Questions (Nagy 1996b), I summarize briefly my linguistic analysis of alētheia at pp. 122–129. [Interested readers may follow this link and read between the markers 

"{(121|122)}" and "{(128|129)}."

Bibliography


Tags: alētheia, Anita Nikkanen, Being and Time, etymology, Les Maîtres de vérité en Grèce ancienne, Marcel Detienne, Martin Heidegger, Pindar’s Homer, Sein und Zeit, The Best of the Achaeans, The Masters of Truth in Archaic Greece

Comments are closed.
‘I’m burning up in flames and I’m drowning’: On the poetry of Nikos Gatsos, inside the music of Stavros Xarhakos, inside the film Rebetiko

On a ‘guessing song’ sung by Cherubino in Mozart’s Marriage of Figaro